

INSTITUTIONS OF DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE

Governance in China's One-Party System

China's one-party authoritarian political system remains out of compliance with the standards defined in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights,¹ which China has signed and declared an intention to ratify,² and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.³ These standards require that citizens be allowed to freely choose their representatives⁴ and to hold their officials accountable through fair and impartial elections regardless of political party membership.⁵ Historic developments in China this past year signified further regression from these international standards of democratic governance:⁶ The Chinese Communist Party tightened its control over the government and society through a significant restructuring of central Party and government institutions,⁷ and the Party and government overturned a key institutional reform of the post-Mao era by abolishing presidential term limits.⁸ In his report to the 19th National Congress of the Chinese Communist Party (19th Party Congress) in October 2017, Party General Secretary and President Xi Jinping asserted that Party building will play a "decisive role" in achieving the Party's goal of the "great rejuvenation of the Chinese nation."⁹ According to an expert, the speech implies that "the Party is the prerequisite for any success [of the country]."¹⁰ As Party leaders demanded obedience and loyalty from all sectors of society,¹¹ the Party itself increasingly came under the personal leadership of Xi.¹² Citizens who voiced disagreement with official policies faced harassment, detention, or criminal prosecution,¹³ demonstrating Chinese authorities' violation of citizens' right to participate in public affairs.¹⁴

Xi Jinping Further Amassed Power

This past year, Party General Secretary and President Xi Jinping further "[centralized] authority under his personal leadership,"¹⁵ thereby undermining collective leadership,¹⁶ "[reversing] reform and opening initiated by former Chinese leader Deng Xiaoping . . .,"¹⁷ and "destabilizing" China's political system,¹⁸ according to scholars and experts. At the 19th Party Congress,¹⁹ convened between October 18 and 24, 2017,²⁰ Xi delivered the 18th Central Committee report in which he reiterated a key goal of the Party's economic plan²¹ to complete the final phase of building a "moderately prosperous society" by 2020.²² Xi demanded that all sectors of society obey the Party Central Committee,²³ and he also further solidified his leadership over the Party.²⁴ On October 24, 2017, members of the 19th Party Congress voted to amend the Chinese Communist Party Constitution to recognize Xi as the "core" leader of the Party Central Committee²⁵ and to write Xi's name and theory into the preamble.²⁶ According to a U.S.-based scholar, the amendment "marks a degree of influence and dominance not shared by any other leader since Mao [Zedong]."²⁷ An analysis described Xi's theory, "Xi Jinping Thought on Socialism With Chinese Characteristics for a New Era," as "a super-nationalistic narrative."²⁸ In addition, Xi's references to the importance of "propaganda and thought work" (*xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo*) in his

Institutions of Democratic Governance

2

speeches since assuming power at the 18th Party Congress evoke “brainwashing and Mao-style ideological campaigns,” according to this analysis.²⁹ In March 2018, the Central Committee issued a plan to restructure Party and government organizations and elevated four leading small groups (*lingdao xiaozu*) headed by Xi to committees; the leading small groups were responsible for reform efforts, cybersecurity, finance, and foreign affairs, and the redesignation, according to some observers, may enhance Xi’s authority and control over these policy issues.³⁰ [For more information on the restructuring of Party and government organizations, see Party Expands Power Over Government and Society below.]

China’s Constitution Amended To Eliminate Presidential Term Limits

Carrying out the Party Central Committee’s recommendation,³¹ the National People’s Congress³² amended China’s Constitution on March 11, 2018, with a vote of 2,958 in favor, 2 against, and 3 abstentions.³³ In what two experts characterized as “historically consequential” revisions,³⁴ the amended Constitution no longer limits the president to serving two five-year terms.³⁵ Former leader Deng Xiaoping took a leading role in instituting term limits in 1982, reportedly to avoid over-concentration of political power in one person³⁶ and to establish an “orderly system of succession.”³⁷ Eliminating term limits potentially would allow Xi Jinping to retain the presidency indefinitely,³⁸ and it signified Xi’s repudiation of the succession system developed by Deng, according to observers.³⁹ Chinese and international observers said that the move—even if made with the intention of improving governance, as an NPC spokesman stated⁴⁰—could lead to disorder,⁴¹ and “revert[s] the country back to the era of strongman politics and the personality cult.”⁴²

While state and Party news outlets asserted that the constitutional amendment enjoyed wide public support,⁴³ different forms of protest against the amendment took place outside China.⁴⁴ Authorities reportedly suppressed dissenting voices by means of censorship,⁴⁵ detention,⁴⁶ and keeping democracy and rights advocates away from Beijing municipality.⁴⁷ In one example, the Party Committee of Zhongnan University of Economics and Law removed a university professor from her teaching position for criticizing the constitutional amendment.⁴⁸ Outside China, Chinese students studying at over 30 schools around the world reportedly hung posters protesting the removal of term limits.⁴⁹

EROSION OF INTRAPARTY DEMOCRACY

Xi Jinping further centralized his political power by handpicking persons to fill top leadership positions.⁵⁰ In October 2017, the First Plenum of the 19th Central Committee announced the new members of the Politburo and its Standing Committee,⁵¹ the de facto center of political power in China.⁵² Xi Jinping reportedly handpicked the new members⁵³ through conducting personal interviews.⁵⁴ During the previous two congresses, the Party experimented with a straw poll, allowing a group of Party leaders to recommend candidates,⁵⁵ as a step toward intraparty democracy (*dangnei minzhu*; also translated as “inner-Party democracy”).⁵⁶ Although it is unclear if the straw poll approach had an actual im-

Institutions of Democratic Governance

pact on the ultimate selection, it “suggested the legitimacy of the leading cadres of the [Communist Party],” according to an expert.⁵⁷ An official news article cited the prevention of corrupt practices to justify Xi’s dismissal of the straw poll approach.⁵⁸ One observer expressed regrets that the straw poll approach was outright abandoned rather than improved upon,⁵⁹ and another observer said that prior “optimism for [intraparty democracy] proved short-lived.”⁶⁰

Party Expands Power Over Government and Society

At the annual meetings of the National People’s Congress (NPC) and Chinese People’s Political Consultative Conference in March 2018 (Two Sessions), central authorities unveiled sweeping changes to Party and government structures.⁶¹ Such reorganization, China’s biggest in decades,⁶² gives the Party and Xi tighter control⁶³ in a number of areas as the Party takes over the responsibility of policy implementation, which in recent decades had largely been left to the government bureaucracy.⁶⁴ One scholar observed that these changes also are likely to erode the space for policy discussions and reduce checks on the abuse of power.⁶⁵ Examples in which the restructuring plan grants the Party control over government-held functions include the following:

- The Central Party School and the Chinese Academy of Governance merged to consolidate the Party’s leadership in training government officials and in ensuring their ideological conformity.⁶⁶
- The Party’s United Front Work Department assumed exclusive policymaking authority over religious and ethnic minority matters.⁶⁷ [For more information on the impact on religious freedom, see Section II—Freedom of Religion.]
- The Party’s Central Propaganda Department took over managerial responsibilities for press and film administration from the State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film, and Television (SAPPRFT), which was disbanded as a result of the reorganization.⁶⁸ A newly created State Council agency called the State Radio and Television Administration took over SAPPRFT’s remaining responsibility for radio and television administration, while the Central Propaganda Department will continue to have a leadership role over the three major official broadcast entities.⁶⁹ In July 2018, the Propaganda Department and the Central Organization Department directed local units such as schools, research institutions, and enterprises to produce media content, hold special topic seminars, and implement training modules aimed at expeditiously cultivating among intellectuals “a striving spirit to promote patriotism,” and aligning them with the Party and government’s objectives.⁷⁰ A former provincial-level propaganda department official characterized this as a brainwashing campaign targeting intellectuals.⁷¹

Another structural change that further blurs the line between the Party and the government is the creation of the National Supervisory Commission (NSC) to direct anticorruption efforts.⁷² At the Two Sessions, the NPC, acting at the direction of the Party’s Central Committee,⁷³ established the NSC by amending the Con-

Institutions of Democratic Governance

stitution⁷⁴ and passing the PRC Supervision Law.⁷⁵ The Supervision Law grants the NSC similar status as the State Council, the Supreme People's Court, and the Supreme People's Procuratorate (SPP).⁷⁶ The NSC replaces the Ministry of Supervision and National Bureau of Corruption Prevention, and takes over certain duties of the SPP involving the investigation of official misconduct such as bribery and dereliction of duty.⁷⁷ The NSC shares office space, personnel, and a website with the Central Commission for Discipline Inspection (CCDI), a Party entity,⁷⁸ and is under the direct supervision of the Party's Central Committee.⁷⁹

While the CCDI's jurisdiction is limited to Party members, the new PRC Supervision Law grants the NSC broad supervisory jurisdiction covering not only Party and government officials, but also administrators at state-owned enterprises, public schools and hospitals, as well as village and residence committees.⁸⁰ Some observers opined that creating the NSC allowed the Party to extend its extrajudicial disciplinary reach over the entire public sector,⁸¹ which is estimated to be over 100 million people.⁸² In addition, the PRC Supervision Law grants the NSC authority to confine individuals under a newly institutionalized disciplinary measure called "confinement" (*liuzhi*) for up to six months without judicial oversight.⁸³ Unlike "double designation" (*shuanggui*), a coercive measure reserved for Party members only,⁸⁴ experts have assessed that NSC officials may apply *liuzhi* to confine any person suspected of bribery or of participating in crimes involving official misconduct, which may include civilians and foreign citizens.⁸⁵ [For more information on arbitrary detention and on the NSC's authority to confine individuals, see text box titled Confinement (*Liuzhi*) Under the PRC Supervision Law in Section II—Criminal Justice.]

Control Over Citizens

SOCIAL CREDIT SYSTEM

Party and government leadership continued to build the social credit system that aims to use surveillance and artificial intelligence to coerce and incentivize individuals to participate in "social management" to maintain social order.⁸⁶ In 2014, the State Council issued a plan to complete by 2020 the regulatory and technical framework for a national social credit system,⁸⁷ which is designed to measure citizens' creditworthiness and moral integrity as it relates to "socialist core values."⁸⁸ As a social management tool currently consisting of "fragmented initiatives that share a basic set of objectives [and] operational frameworks,"⁸⁹ the system takes into account factors beyond financial transactions to include criminal records, traffic violations, social media activities, and political activities.⁹⁰ Critics have raised concerns that the social credit system is part of the Chinese government's efforts to counter perceived threats to national security and shape citizens' behavior through massive data-gathering and surveillance at the expense of privacy.⁹¹

As part of its efforts to develop the social credit system, the Chinese government this past year moved to gain access to personal information collected by commercial enterprises.⁹² In February 2018, China's central bank, the People's Bank of China, granted a

Institutions of Democratic Governance

license to Baihang Credit Scoring (Baihang) to operate as a credit reporting company, enabling it to collect and process personal information.⁹³ The newly formed Baihang is owned by eight major private companies in credit-related businesses⁹⁴ and the National Internet Finance Association of China (NIFAC), a Party- and state-organized association that supervises the implementation of government policies in internet finance.⁹⁵ The eight companies could share among themselves and with the NIFAC⁹⁶ a wide range of customer data.⁹⁷ The license was granted despite the Cyberspace Administration of China having found one of the member companies to have collected personal information in violation of the non-binding⁹⁸ government standards for safeguarding personal information.⁹⁹ Moreover, the manner in which collected data may be automatically shared among the eight companies for credit evaluation raised concerns that it could exceed the scope of customers' consent.¹⁰⁰ In June 2018, Baihang partnered with over 120 companies, which would provide Baihang with personal information of their customers in exchange for access to Baihang's credit information database.¹⁰¹ One source expressed concern over whether Baihang's member companies' data sharing would violate China's privacy laws.¹⁰²

In addition, part of the implementation of the social credit system in some cases may violate citizens' due process rights and infringe on their right to freedom of movement.¹⁰³ In March 2018, the National Development and Reform Commission (NDRC) and other state entities issued two opinions prohibiting certain individuals who have "lost credit in serious ways" from taking trains for six months¹⁰⁴ or airplanes for a year.¹⁰⁵ Affected individuals include those blacklisted because of their failure to satisfy a court judgment.¹⁰⁶ International NGO Human Rights Watch highlighted two cases in which a lawyer and a journalist were unable to buy plane tickets because they were blacklisted as "untrustworthy," respectively, for a court-ordered apology deemed "insincere" and a payment submission that a court said it did not receive.¹⁰⁷ The NDRC deputy director reported in March that authorities had restricted 3 million individuals from using trains and 9 million from using aircraft due to "lost credit."¹⁰⁸

AN EXPANDING, PERVASIVE SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM

The Chinese government continued to expand the existing video surveillance system (also known as Skynet)¹⁰⁹ this past year. In 2005, the Ministry of Public Security initiated a pilot program to implement video surveillance systems in over 400 localities, and the ministry expanded the program to cover every prefecture-level city by 2011.¹¹⁰ Official news agency China News Service reported that the surveillance system had a limited impact on fighting crime and that its primary function is to "maintain social stability" such as preventing protests and demonstrations.¹¹¹ Between 2012 and 2017, the system grew to consist of 20 million cameras,¹¹² covering over 5,000 local administrative jurisdictions,¹¹³ with many having facial recognition capabilities.¹¹⁴ In January 2018, the Party Central Committee and State Council issued an opinion on "rejuvenating" villages and expressed the intention to expand the surveil-

Institutions of Democratic Governance

lance system to cover rural areas,¹¹⁵ consisting of about 41 percent of China's population.¹¹⁶

In addition, Chinese authorities are building biometric databases to monitor broad segments of the population.¹¹⁷ In December 2017, the Wall Street Journal reported that public security officials in various locations in China collected biometric information such as saliva and blood samples from individuals, in some cases without their informed consent, who had expressed views critical of the government or committed minor infractions.¹¹⁸ The police in Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region reportedly wrote that they “were transforming DNA technology from simply a criminal investigation tool into an important initiative for social control and safety keeping.”¹¹⁹ In some localities, authorities gathered biometric information from migrant workers and coal miners because officials deemed these groups to be “a higher risk to social stability.”¹²⁰ In the Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region, authorities “[collected] DNA samples of all residents between the ages of 12 and 65.”¹²¹ China reportedly lacks adequate privacy protections with respect to the installation of surveillance cameras and the collection of biometric information.¹²² [For more information on surveillance in the Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region, see Section IV—Xinjiang.]

CONTINUED CRACKDOWN ON FREE SPEECH, ASSEMBLY, AND ASSOCIATION

Chinese authorities continued to harass, detain, and imprison advocates who exercised their rights to freedom of speech, assembly, and association. The UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights has found that the free exercise of these rights constitutes “essential conditions” for effective political participation.¹²³ Representative cases are as follows:

- Authorities harassed individuals around the 29th anniversary of the 1989 Tiananmen protests by means of censorship, questioning, detention, and enforced disappearance.¹²⁴ For example, on June 4, 2018, police and officials from the local religious affairs bureau detained over 17 members of the **Early Rain Covenant Church** in Chengdu municipality shortly before a scheduled prayer meeting to commemorate the anniversary.¹²⁵
- Authorities continued to administratively and criminally detain democracy advocates.¹²⁶ In one case, on May 21, 2018, police took rights defender **Yu Qiyuan** into custody at a train station in Guangzhou municipality, Guangdong province,¹²⁷ reportedly in connection with his participation in a sea memorial held in July 2017 in Guangdong to commemorate the death of Nobel Peace Prize laureate Liu Xiaobo.¹²⁸ Yu tweeted that police located him with facial recognition technology.¹²⁹
- On May 11, 2018, the Wuhan Intermediate People's Court tried **Qin Yongmin**, whom authorities accused of “subversion of state power” in connection to his participation in the banned China Democracy Party and the domestic NGO China Human Rights Watch.¹³⁰ The trial took place more than three years after authorities detained him in January 2015.¹³¹ According to Qin's sister-in-law, authorities also forcibly disappeared Qin's wife **Zhao Suli** at the same time and placed her under

Institutions of Democratic Governance

7

soft detention.¹³² On July 11, 2018, the same court sentenced Qin to 13 years in prison and 3 years' deprivation of political rights.¹³³

- As of May 2018, **Liu Feiyue**, founder of the rights monitoring website Civil Rights & Livelihood Watch, remained in pretrial detention on suspicion of "inciting subversion of state power," since authorities took him into custody in November 2016.¹³⁴

Citizen Participation

ELECTIONS

The Commission did not observe progress in expanding the scope of direct elections, which Chinese law limits to people's congresses of local jurisdictions such as smaller cities, counties, and townships.¹³⁵ Chinese news media emphasized the Party's leadership in every step of the local election process,¹³⁶ and citizens reportedly continued to face difficulties in running as independent candidates.¹³⁷ Sources further highlighted instances in which officials suppressed meaningful participation in or speech regarding elections this past year,¹³⁸ demonstrating that China's political institutions do not meet the standards for elections outlined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights¹³⁹ and International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.¹⁴⁰ For example, in January 2018, police in Laizhou city, Yantai municipality, Shandong province, took Zhang Yuxi into custody and ordered him to serve eight days' administrative detention on the charge of "fabricating facts to disturb public order," thereby preventing him from participating in a village election.¹⁴¹ Zhang previously filed complaints about local officials' corrupt practices and exposed irregularities in a local election.¹⁴²

RULEMAKING PROCESS

The State Council's December 2017 amendments of two sets of regulations governing rulemaking processes¹⁴³ have the potential to curb the arbitrary exercise of power¹⁴⁴ and improve public participation, but they included language emphasizing the Party's control.¹⁴⁵ The amended regulations require the State Council to solicit public opinion when drafting rules that diminish citizens' benefits or increase their responsibilities.¹⁴⁶ State Council departments and local administrative departments are prohibited from making this type of rule unless expressly authorized by law.¹⁴⁷ The amendments also require the rulemaking body to solicit public comments and permit it to hold public hearings or to appoint third-party experts with specialized knowledge to draft rules involving technical matters.¹⁴⁸ Nevertheless, there is no mechanism by which the public can ensure that the rulemaking body has considered public comments.¹⁴⁹ Moreover, the amendments added a new requirement for compliance with the Party's decisions and policies.¹⁵⁰

Institutions of Democratic Governance

8

Transparency

The Chinese Communist Party issued regulations with the stated goal of improving transparency in Party affairs, but their impact likely will be limited. In December 2017, the Party Central Committee issued trial Regulations on Open Party Affairs (Open Party Regulations) that require Party entities to release information to the extent relevant to Party members and the public.¹⁵¹ Unlike the Open Government Information Regulations,¹⁵² the Open Party Regulations do not provide for mechanisms that allow citizens to request disclosure, and compliance is supervised by the Party itself.¹⁵³ The scope of disclosure under the Open Party Regulations generally is limited to policy documents and work progress reports,¹⁵⁴ and does not require the release of financial information, which is reportedly a key element in combating corruption.¹⁵⁵ The extent of public oversight on the new National Supervisory Commission (NSC) remains uncertain because it is unclear which set of disclosure rules applies—while the NSC reports to the National People’s Congress as a state entity, it also is characterized as a political body.¹⁵⁶

Accountability

Central authorities have implemented a years-long anticorruption campaign with the purported aim of holding officials accountable, but reports continue to highlight the campaign’s apparent underlying political motivations and note that corruption remains pervasive in China.¹⁵⁷ The Central Commission for Discipline Inspection (CCDI) announced that authorities nationwide disciplined a total of 527,000 individuals in 2017;¹⁵⁸ meanwhile, corruption reportedly remained a significant problem.¹⁵⁹ A scholar noted that Xi Jinping has used the anticorruption campaign to disrupt “[f]actions organized around political rivals.”¹⁶⁰ As the CCDI underscored in the communiqué of its second plenary session, the elimination of individuals disloyal to the Party is part of the objective of the anticorruption campaign.¹⁶¹ Vice President Wang Qishan,¹⁶² who ran the campaign in his previous role as the CCDI Secretary,¹⁶³ wrote a commentary in October 2017 that further underscored the political motivations of the campaign.¹⁶⁴ Wang identified political corruption as the worst form of corruption, which includes stealing power from the Party and the state by creating interest groups and undermining the Party’s control by organizing factional activities.¹⁶⁵ A U.K.-based scholar noted that widespread corruption persists in China due to the absence of true accountability and transparency regarding internal affairs and that Chinese leaders do not display sufficient commitment to address these challenges.¹⁶⁶

Authorities in various localities retaliated against individuals who exposed official misconduct. Examples are as follows:

- In August 2017, the Heyuan Municipal Intermediate People’s Court in Guangdong province dismissed **Liu Yao’s**¹⁶⁷ appeal challenging a lower court’s judgment sentencing him to 20 years in prison and fined him 1.4 million yuan (approximately US\$209,000) for “extortion,” “fraud,” and “purchasing a trafficked child.”¹⁶⁸ Liu’s detention is reportedly connected to his

Institutions of Democratic Governance

efforts to expose corruption, including an official's alleged involvement in unlawful appropriation of farmland for a golf course project.¹⁶⁹

- In February 2018, the Huidong County People's Court in Huizhou municipality, Guangdong, convicted **Li Jianxin** on the charge of "extortion" and sentenced him to 11 years in prison.¹⁷⁰ Li's detention is reportedly connected to his efforts to expose corruption by local officials, including a former deputy mayor of Huizhou.¹⁷¹

Notes to Section III—Institutions of Democratic Governance

¹International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76.

²United Nations Treaty Collection, Chapter IV, Human Rights, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, last visited 13 July 18; State Council Information Office, “National Human Rights Action Plan of China (2016–2020)” [Guojia renquan xingdong jihua (2016–2020 nian)], 29 September 16, sec. 5.

³Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A(III) of 10 December 48.

⁴Ibid., art. 21. Article 21 of the UDHR provides that, “Everyone has the right to take part in the government of his country, directly or through freely chosen representatives . . . The will of the people shall be the basis of the authority of government, this will shall be expressed in periodic and genuine elections which shall be by universal and equal suffrage and shall be held by secret vote or by equivalent free voting procedures.”

⁵International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 25.

⁶David Shambaugh, “Under Xi Jinping, a Return in China to the Dangers of an All-Powerful Leader,” *South China Morning Post*, 1 March 18; Cheng Li and Ryan McElveen, Brookings Institution, “China’s Constitutional Conundrum,” 28 February 18.

⁷Willy Wo-Lap Lam, “At China’s ‘Two Sessions,’ Xi Jinping Restructures Party-State To Further Consolidate Power,” *Jamestown Foundation*, 26 March 18.

⁸Alice L. Miller, “Only Socialism Can Save China; Only Xi Jinping Can Save Socialism,” *Stanford University, Hoover Institution, China Leadership Monitor*, No. 56 (Spring 2018), 16 May 18.

⁹“Xi Jinping: Secure a Decisive Victory in Building a Moderately Prosperous Society in All Respects and Strive for the Great Success of Socialism With Chinese Characteristics for a New Era” [Xi jingping: juesheng quanmian jiancheng xiaokang shehui duoqu xin shidai zhongguo tese shehui zhuyi weida shengli], 18 October 17, *Xinhua*, 27 October 17; Jessica Batke, “Party All the Time: Governance and Society in the New Era,” *China Stanford University, Hoover Institution, Leadership Monitor*, No. 55 (Winter 2018), 23 January 18, 2. See also, Qian Gang, “Qian Gang Exclusive: Report on Discourse in 2017 Part 1 The System of ‘Xi’s Discourse’ Is Established” [Qian gang zhuanwen: 2017 yuxiang baogao—“xi yu” tixi quelil], *Storm Media*, 6 January 18.

¹⁰Jessica Batke, “Party All the Time: Governance and Society in the New Era,” *Stanford University, Hoover Institution, China Leadership Monitor*, No. 55 (Winter 2018), 23 January 18, 2.

¹¹“Xi Jinping: Secure a Decisive Victory in Building a Moderately Prosperous Society in All Respects and Strive for the Great Success of Socialism With Chinese Characteristics for a New Era” [Xi jingping: juesheng quanmian jiancheng xiaokang shehui duoqu xin shidai zhongguo tese shehui zhuyi weida shengli], 18 October 17, *Xinhua*, 27 October 17, sec. 3. See also Chris Buckley, “Orwellian Nonsense? China Says That’s the Price of Doing Business,” *New York Times*, 6 May 18; Jeffrey Wasserstrom, “Statesman, Strongman, Philosopher, Autocrat: China’s Xi Is a Man Who Contains Multitudes,” *The Conversation*, 2 April 18; Tom Phillips, “Xi Shores Up Power With Demand for Army Obedience and Foreign Respect,” *Guardian*, 1 August 17.

¹²James M. Lindsay, *Council on Foreign Relations, “Xi’s China Is More Authoritarian at Home and More Assertive Abroad, Argues Elizabeth Economy in New Book,”* 1 May 18; Gordon G. Chang, “Xi Jinping’s Great Leap Backward,” *American Conservative*, 9 July 18; Jessica Meyers, “China’s Communist Party Elders Picked Xi Jinping Because They Thought They Could Control Him. They Were Wrong,” *Los Angeles Times*, 16 October 17; Chris Buckley, “Xi Jinping Opens China’s Party Congress, His Hold Tighter Than Ever,” *New York Times*, 17 October 17; John Garrick and Yan Chang Bennett, “Xi Jinping Thought,” *China Perspective*, Vol. 1–2 (2018), 100.

¹³See, e.g., Rights Defense Network, “Wuhan Dissident Qin Yongmin Heavily Sentenced to 13 Years in Prison” [Wuhan yiwei renshi qin yongmin zao zhongpan 13 nian], 11 July 18; Rights Defense Network, “Monthly Report on Detained Political Prisoners and Prisoners of Conscience in Mainland China (May 31, 2018) Issue No. 32 (Total 761 Persons) (Part 1)” [Zhongguo dalu zaiya zhengzhifan, liangxinfan yuedu baogao (2018 nian 5 yue 31 ri) di 32 qi (gong 761 ren) (di 1 bufen)], 31 May 18; “Participant of Sea Memorial for Liu Xiaobo Detained by ‘Facial Recognition’” [Canyu liu xiaobo haiji renshi yi bei “renlian shibie” zao zhuabu], *Radio Free Asia*, 22 May 18; Rights Defense Network, “Democracy Rights Advocate Huang Wenxun Continues To Be Harassed and Pressured by Authorities Following Release From Prison” [Minzhu weiquan renshi huang wenxun chuyu hou reng zao dangju buduan saorao he daya], 25 May 18.

¹⁴International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 25.

¹⁵Elizabeth C. Economy, *The Third Revolution* (Oxford: Oxford University, 2018), 10; James M. Lindsay, *Council on Foreign Relations, “Xi’s China Is More Authoritarian at Home and More Assertive Abroad, Argues Elizabeth Economy in New Book,”* 1 May 18.

¹⁶Shannon Tiezzi, “Carl Minzner on China’s Post-Reform Era,” *The Diplomat*, 4 April 18; Elizabeth C. Economy, *The Third Revolution* (Oxford: Oxford University, 2018), 52–53; David Shambaugh, “Under Xi Jinping, a Return in China to the Dangers of an All-Powerful Leader,” *South China Morning Post*, 1 March 18.

¹⁷James M. Lindsay, *Council on Foreign Relations, “Xi’s China Is More Authoritarian at Home and More Assertive Abroad, Argues Elizabeth Economy in New Book,”* 1 May 18. Elizabeth C. Economy, *The Third Revolution* (Oxford: Oxford University, 2018), 53.

¹⁸Carl Minzner, “Reversing Reform,” *Asia Society, ChinaFile*, 8 March 18; Carl Minzner, *End of an Era* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), 29, 30, 32, 34.

Institutions of Democratic Governance

¹⁹Chinese Communist Party Constitution [Zhongguo gongchandang zhangcheng], adopted 6 September 82, amended 1 November 87, 18 October 92, 18 September 97, 14 November 02, 21 October 07, 14 November 12, 24 October 17, art. 19. The Chinese Communist Party Constitution provides that a Party Congress is held once every five years and convened by the Central Committee. “18th Party Congress Begins, Hu Jintao Presents Report” [Shiba da kaimu hu jintao zuo baogao], Xinhua, 8 November 12. The 18th Party Congress took place in November 2012.

²⁰“19th Party Congress of the Chinese Communist Party Convened in Beijing, Xi Jinping Delivers Work Report to Congress on Behalf of the 18th Central Committee, Presided Over by Li Keqiang” [Zhongguo gongchandang di shijiu ci quanguo daibiao dahui zai jing kaimu xi jingping daibiao di shiba jie zhongyang weiyuanhui xiang dahui zuo baogao li keqiang zhuchi dahui], Xinhua, 18 October 17; “19th Party Congress of the Chinese Communist Party Concludes in Beijing, Xi Jinping Delivers Important Speech” [Zhongguo gongchandang di shijiu ci quanguo daibiao dahui zai jing bimu xi jingping fabiao zhongyao jianghua], Xinhua, 24 October 17.

²¹See, e.g., “Xi Jinping: Keep the Masses’ Security and Well-Being Close to Our Hearts” [Xi jingping ba qunzhong anwei lengnuan shike fang zai xinshang], Xinhua, 30 December 12; “Thirteenth Five-Year Plan Passed: Average Per Capita Income in 2020 Targeted To Double Compared to 2010” [Shisan wu guihua tongguo: 2020 nian renjun shouru bi 2010 nian fanfan], Beijing Times, reprinted in Xinhua, 30 October 15.

²²“Xi Jinping: Secure a Decisive Victory in Building a Moderately Prosperous Society in All Respects and Strive for the Great Success of Socialism With Chinese Characteristics for a New Era” [Xi jingping: juesheng quanmian jiancheng xiaokang shehui duoqu xin shidai zhongguo tese shehui zhuyi weida shengli], 18 October 17, Xinhua, 27 October 17, sec. 4.

²³Ibid., sec. 3. See also Chris Buckley, “‘Orwellian Nonsense’? China Says That’s the Price of Doing Business,” New York Times, 6 May 18; Jeffrey Wasserstrom, “Statesman, Strongman, Philosopher, Autocrat: China’s Xi Is a Man Who Contains Multitudes,” The Conversation, 2 April 18; Tom Phillips, “Xi Shores Up Power With Demand for Army Obedience and Foreign Respect,” Guardian, 1 August 17.

²⁴Chinese Communist Party Constitution [Zhongguo gongchandang zhangcheng], adopted 6 September 82, amended 1 November 87, 18 October 92, 18 September 97, 14 November 02, 21 October 07, 14 November 12, 24 October 17, General Program; James M. Lindsay, Council on Foreign Relations, “Xi’s China Is More Authoritarian at Home and More Assertive Abroad, Argues Elizabeth Economy in New Book,” 1 May 18; Gordon G. Chang, “Xi Jinping’s Great Leap Backward,” American Conservative, 9 July 18; Jessica Meyers, “China’s Communist Party Elders Picked Xi Jinping Because They Thought They Could Control Him. They Were Wrong,” Los Angeles Times, 16 October 17; Chris Buckley, “Xi Jinping Opens China’s Party Congress, His Hold Tighter Than Ever,” New York Times, 17 October 17; John Garrick and Yan Chang Bennett, “Xi Jinping Thought,” China Perspective, Vol. 1–2 (2018), 100.

²⁵Zhao Chao and Chen Weiwei, “Glorious Guide To Building a Marxist Ruling Party—Story of the Birth of the ‘Chinese Communist Party Constitution (Amendment)’” [Jianshe makesi zhuyi zhidengdang de guanghui zhiyin—“zhongguo gongchandang zhangcheng (xiuzheng’an)” dansheng ji], Xinhua, 28 October 17.

²⁶Central Commission for Discipline Inspection, “Understanding Through One Picture: Table Illustrating Changes in the ‘Constitution of the Chinese Communist Party’” [Yitu dudong: “zhongguo gongchandang zhangcheng” xiugai duibi yilanbiao], 31 October 17.

²⁷Joseph Fewsmith, “The 19th Party Congress: Ringing in Xi Jinping’s New Age,” Stanford University, Hoover Institution, China Leadership Monitor, No. 55 (Winter 2018), 23 January 18, 7–8.

²⁸Willy Wo-Lap Lam, “What is Xi Jinping Thought?” Jamestown Foundation, China Brief, Vol. 17, Issue 12, 21 September 17.

²⁹Ibid.; “Summary of Xi Jinping’s Captivating Speeches on ‘Propaganda and Thought Work’ Since 18th Party Congress” [Xi jingping shibada yilai guanyu “xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo” jingcai lunshu zhaibian], People’s Daily, 19 August 14; Zhang Xiaosong and Huang Xiaoxi, “Xi Jinping Attends National Propaganda and Thought Work Conference and Delivers Important Speech” [Xi jingping chuxi quanguo xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo huiyi bing fabiao zhongyao jianghua], Xinhua, 22 August 18.

³⁰“Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues ‘Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies’” [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfu “shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang’an”], Xinhua, 21 March 18, sec. 1(4); Alice L. Miller, “Only Socialism Can Save China; Only Xi Jinping Can Save Socialism,” Stanford University, Hoover Institution, China Leadership Monitor, No. 56 (Spring 2018), 16 May 18, 7; Jun Mai, “China Unveils Bold Overhaul To Tighten Communist Party Control,” South China Morning Post, 22 March 18; Mai Yanting, “Reform Leads to ‘Party-Based Governance,’ NPC’s Supervisory Function Significantly Weakened” [Gaige ling zhonggong “yi dang zhiguo” renda jiandu xiaoneng da xue], Radio France Internationale, 22 March 18. See also Zheng Yanzhi, “‘Small Groups’ Become ‘Committees,’ It’s Transcendence as Much as Status Elevation!” [“Xiaozu” bian “weiyuanhui,” jishi shengge, gengshi shenghua!], People’s Daily, 29 March 18.

³¹“Chinese Communist Party Central Committee’s Recommendation To Amend Portion of the Constitution” [Zhongguo gongchandang zhongyang weiyuanhui guanyu xiugai xianfa bufen neirong de jianyi], 26 January 18, Xinhua, 25 February 18, item 14.

³²The National People’s Congress has been described as “a rubber-stamp body with no real legislative power.” Andrew J. Nathan, “China: Back to the Future,” New York Review of Books, 10 May 18.

³³“Amendment to the People’s Republic of China Constitution Passed” [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xianfa xiuzheng’an tongguo], People’s Daily, 11 March 18; Amendment to the PRC Constitution [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xianfa xiuzheng’an], Xinhua, 11 March 18, item 45; Lin Xiaowei et al., “Collaborative News: Escorting the Convoy in the New Era, Apt Time To Amend Constitution—International Community Watches Closely as National People’s Congress Passes Constitutional Amendment” [Zonghe xiaoxi: huhang xin shidai xiuxian zhengdang shi—

Institutions of Democratic Governance

guoji shehui guanzhu quanguo renda tongguo xianfa xiuzheng'an], Xinhua, 11 March 18; Luo Zhengguang and Zhu Jiehai, "Featured Story: Historic and Dignified Moment—Reporting Deliberation and Passing of Constitutional Amendment at the First Plenum of the 13th National People's Congress" [Texie: lishixing de zhuangyan shike—ji shisan jie quanguo renda yici huiyi biaojue tongguo xianfa xiuzheng'an], Xinhua, 12 March 18.

³⁴Cheng Li and Ryan McElveen, Brookings Institution, "China's Constitutional Conundrum," 28 February 18.

³⁵Amendment to the PRC Constitution [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xianfa xiuzheng'an], Xinhua, 11 March 18, item 45.

³⁶Hong Zhenkuai, "Looking at the Xi-Style Constitutional Amendment Through the Lens of Term Limit History" [Cong renqi zhi lishi kan xi shi xiuxian], New York Times, 22 March 18; PRC Constitution, issued 4 December 82, amended 12 April 88, 29 March 93, 15 March 99, 14 March 04, 11 March 18, art. 79.

³⁷Andrew J. Nathan, "China: Back to the Future," New York Review of Books, 10 May 18. ³⁸Chris Buckley and Steven Lee Myers, "China's Legislature Blesses Xi's Indefinite Rule. It Was 2,958 to 2," New York Times, 11 March 18.

³⁹Andrew J. Nathan, "China: Back to the Future," New York Review of Books, 10 May 18.

⁴⁰"China: Abolishing Presidential Term Limits Good for Governance," Al Jazeera, 4 March 18.

⁴¹David Bandurski, "Li Datong's Open Letter," University of Hong Kong, Journalism & Media Studies Centre, China Media Project, 28 February 18; Deng Yuwen, "With an End to Term Limits, Xi Can Realise His Chinese Dream—But Will the Price for China Be Too High?" South China Morning Post, 6 March 18.

⁴²Cheng Li and Ryan McElveen, Brookings Institution, "China's Constitutional Conundrum," 28 February 18.

⁴³Wang Mengran et al., "Delegate From Jiangsu Sincerely Supports Passage of Constitutional Amendment" [Jiangsu daibiao weiyuan zhongxin yonghu xianfa xiuzheng'an tongguo], Xinhua, 12 March 18; "Giving Strong Constitutional Protection for Great Revitalization of the Chinese People" [Wei zhonghua minzu weida fuxing tigung youli xianfa baozhang], Legal Daily, 22 March 18. See also "Chinese NPC Passes Constitutional Amendment by Large Margin, Xi Jinping Begins To Rule With Unlimited Term" [Zhongguo renda gao piao tongguo xiuxian'an xi jingping kaishi wuxianqi zhizheng], Voice of America, 11 March 18.

⁴⁴"Chinese Protest Removal of Presidential Term Limits Outside China," Radio Free Asia, 15 March 18; Frances Mao, "Xi Jinping: 'Not My President' Posters Emerge Outside China," BBC, 12 March 18.

⁴⁵See, e.g., Echo Huang, "How China Reacted to the Idea of Indefinite Rule by Xi, in Memes," Quartz, 26 February 18; "Online 'Blacklist' Initiated, Many WeChat Accounts Closed Down, Zhu Xinxin 'Blacklisted and Censored' for Talking About 'Life Tenure'" [Qidong wangluo "hei mingdan" zhong weixin bei feng zhu xinxin yi "zhongshenzhi" zao "lahei"], Radio Free Asia, 1 March 18; "Stability Maintenance in Xi Jinping's 'New Era': Compressing Space for Citizens' Freedom Using Advanced Technology" [Xi jingping "xin shidai" weiren: gao keji yasuo gongmin ziyou kongjian], Radio Free Asia, 26 March 18; "Chongqing Local Lawyers Association and Lengshuijiang Justice Bureau Prohibit Lawyers From Participating in Online Discussions About 'Constitutional Amendment,' According to Web Sources" [Wang chuan chongqing difang lushi xiehui ji lengshuijiang shi sifaju yaoqiu lushi bude canyu "xiugai xianfa" wangluo taolun], Lawyers' Rights & Interests Concern Net (blog), 27 February 18; China Digital Times, "Minitrue: How to Report on the NPC," 12 March 18.

⁴⁶See, e.g., Civil Rights & Livelihood Watch, "Jiangxi Dissident Liang Bo Administratively Detained for Five Days for 'Spreading Rumors'" [Jiangxi yiwei renshi liang bo bei yi "san yao" xingqu wu tian], 21 March 18; "Former Procurator Shen Liangqing Detained Overnight for Questioning, Possibly for Criticizing Constitutional Amendment Online" [Yi zai wangshang piping xiuxian qian jianchaguan shen liangqing bei tongxiao koucha], Radio Free Asia, 7 March 18; "Detained for Satirizing Constitutional Amendment, Geng Caiwen and Huang Jingyi Released" [Wangshang fengci xiuxian bei kou geng caiwen, huang jingyi huoshi], Radio Free Asia, 27 March 18. For more information, see the following records in the Commission's Political Prisoner Database: 2014-00234 on Huang Jingyi, 2015-00336 on Geng Caiwen, 2018-00316 on Liang Bo, and 2018-00317 on Shen Liangqing.

⁴⁷"Sensitive People Forced To Leave Beijing for Stability Maintenance During Two Sessions, Netizens Detained for Satirizing Constitutional Amendment" [Lianghui weiren min'gan renshi bei po li jing wangmin feng xiuxian bei ju], Radio Free Asia, 3 March 18.

⁴⁸Rights Defense Network, "CCP Tightening Control of Speech in Higher Education Institutions, Zhongnan University of Economics and Law Female Associate Professor Zhai Jiehong Disciplined for Speech in Class After Being Reported by Student" [Zhonggong dangju gaoxiao yanlun kongzhi riqi yanku zhongnan caijing zhengfa daxue nu fujaoshou zhai jiehong yin ketang yanlun zao xuesheng gaomi bei chufen], 21 May 18.

⁴⁹Qiu Zhongsun, "Chinese Students Protest in America, Face Danger at Home," Foreign Policy, 28 May 18.

⁵⁰Susan Shirk et al., "The 19th Party Congress: A Retrospective Analysis," in Xi Takes Charge: Implications of the 19th Party Congress for China's Future, University of California at San Diego, School of Global Policy & Strategy, 21st Century China Center, October 2017, 38.

⁵¹Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, "Communiqué of the First Plenum of the 19th Chinese Communist Party Central Committee" [Zhongguo gongchandang di shijiu jie zhongyang weiyuanhui di yici quanti huiyi gongbao], 25 October 17; "General Secretary Xi Jinping's Comments to Chinese and Foreign Reporters at the 19th Political Bureau Standing Committee of the Chinese Communist Party Central Committee" [Xi jingping zongshuji zai shijiu jie zhonggong zhongyang zhengzhiju changwei tong zhongwai jizhe jianmian shi de jianghua], Xinhua, 25 October 17.

Institutions of Democratic Governance

⁵²Tony Saich, *Governance and Politics of China* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 90; Wang Xiangwei, “Analysis: How Xi Jinping Revived Old Methods by Abandoning Intraparty Democracy,” *South China Morning Post*, 5 November 17.

⁵³“Xi Jinping in Charge: Key Takeaways From China’s 19th Communist Party Congress,” Albright Stonebridge Group, 27 October 17, 2; Wang Xiangwei, “Analysis: How Xi Jinping Revived Old Methods by Abandoning Intraparty Democracy,” *South China Morning Post*, 5 November 17; Zhao Cheng et al., “Strong Collective Leadership That Leads in the New Era—Report of the Formation of the Party’s New Institution of Central Leadership” [Linghang xin shidai de jianqiang lingdao jiti—dang de xin yi jie zhongyang lingdao jigou chansheng jishi], *Xinhua*, 26 October 17. See also Alice L. Miller, “The Road to the 19th Party Congress,” *Stanford University*, Hoover Institution, *China Leadership Monitor*, No. 51 (Fall 2016), 30 August 16, 9–10.

⁵⁴Zhao Cheng et al., “Strong Collective Leadership That Leads in the New Era—Report of the Formation of the Party’s New Institution of Central Leadership” [Linghang xin shidai de jianqiang lingdao jiti—dang de xin yi jie zhongyang lingdao jigou chansheng jishi], *Xinhua*, 26 October 17.

⁵⁵Wang Xiangwei, “Analysis: How Xi Jinping Revived Old Methods by Abandoning Intraparty Democracy,” *South China Morning Post*, 5 November 17; Li Zhen et al., “Explained by Party International Liaison Department’s Cartoon: How Does Chinese Communist Party Select Party and Government Leaders and Cadres” [Zhonglianbu manhua jiedu: zhonggong zenyang xuanba dangzheng lingdao ganbu], *People’s Daily*, 10 May 16; Liu Siyang et al., “Record of the Formation of a New Party Leadership Institution” [Dang de xin yi jie zhongyang lingdao jigou chansheng jishi], *People’s Daily*, 24 October 07.

⁵⁶Committee for a Workers’ International, “Xi Jinping: How Strong Is China’s Strongman?” 17 November 17; Liu Siyang et al., “Record of the Formation of a New Party Leadership Institution” [Dang de xin yi jie zhongyang lingdao jigou chansheng jishi], *People’s Daily*, 24 October 07; “Highlights of Report Delivered to the General Assembly by Comrade Hu Jintao on Behalf of the 16th Central Committee” [Hu jintao tongzhi daibiao di shiliu jie zhongyang weiyuanhui xiang dahui zuo de baogao zhai deng], *People’s Daily*, 18 October 07.

⁵⁷Joseph Fewsmith, “The 19th Party Congress: Ringing in Xi Jinping’s New Age,” *Stanford University*, Hoover Institution, *China Leadership Monitor*, No. 55 (Winter 2018), 23 January 18, 16–17.

⁵⁸Zhao Cheng et al., “Strong Collective Leadership That Leads in the New Era—Report of the Formation of the Party’s New Institution of Central Leadership” [Linghang xin shidai de jianqiang lingdao jiti—dang de xin yi jie zhongyang lingdao jigou chansheng jishi], *Xinhua*, 26 October 17.

⁵⁹Lu Bingquan, “Is Xi Jinping Setting a Precedent or Breaking the Rules?” [Xi jingping kaichuang xianhe haishi pohuai guiju?], *Ming Pao*, 7 November 17.

⁶⁰Wang Xiangwei, “Analysis: How Xi Jinping Revived Old Methods by Abandoning Intraparty Democracy,” *South China Morning Post*, 5 November 17.

⁶¹Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies” [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige de jue ding], *Xinhua*, 4 March 18; “Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues ‘Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies’” [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfa “shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang’an”], *Xinhua*, 21 March 18; State Council, Institutional Reform Plan [Guowuyuan jigou gaige fang’an], 17 March 18; “State Council Structural Reform Plan Passed at First Session of the 13th National People’s Congress” [Shisan jie quanguo renda yici huiyi pizhun guowuyuan jigou gaige fang’an], *Xinhua*, 17 March 18.

⁶²Mercator Institute for China Studies, “China Update 7/2018: 23 March–12 April 18,” 12 April 18.

⁶³See, e.g., Keith Bradsher and Chris Buckley, “China’s Communist Party Centralizes Power Over Finance and Pollution Control,” *New York Times*, 12 March 18; Chris Buckley and Keith Bradsher, “When Xi Speaks, Chinese Officials Jump. Maybe Too High,” *New York Times*, 16 March 18; Chris Buckley, “China Gives Communist Party More Control Over Policy and Media,” *New York Times*, 21 March 18; Jun Mai, “China Unveils Bold Overhaul To Tighten Communist Party Control,” *South China Morning Post*, 22 March 18; “China Unveils ‘Revolutionary’ Plan to Give Communist Party Even More Power,” *Bloomberg*, 12 March 18; Willy Wo-Lap Lam, “At China’s ‘Two Sessions,’ Xi Jinping Restructures Party-State To Further Consolidate Power,” *Jamestown Foundation*, *China Brief*, Vol. 18, Issue 5, 26 March 18, 1–2.

⁶⁴Shannon Tiezzi, “Carl Minzner on China’s Post-Reform Era,” *The Diplomat*, 4 April 18; Council on Foreign Relations, “Unrivaled Power: The Lifting of China’s Presidential Term Limits,” 22 March 18; Matthias Stepan and Sabine Muscat, “In Xi’s China, the Party Morphs Into the State,” *Mercator Institute for China Studies*, *MERICs Blog—European Voices on China*, 7 March 18.

⁶⁵Shannon Tiezzi, “Carl Minzner on China’s Post-Reform Era,” *The Diplomat*, 4 April 18.
⁶⁶“Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues ‘Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies’” [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfa “shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang’an”], *Xinhua*, 21 March 18, secs. 1(6), (7); “Head of Party Organization Department Chen Xi To Head Chinese Academy of Governance, Tuo Zhen Becomes Chief Editor of People’s Daily” [Zhongzu buzhang chen xi jian guojia xingzheng xueyuan yuanchang tuo zhen ren renmin ribao zongbianjil], *Radio Free Asia*, 4 April 18.

⁶⁷“Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues ‘Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies’” [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfa “shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang’an”], *Xinhua*, 21 March 18, secs. 1(13), (14).

⁶⁸*Ibid.*, secs. 1(11)–(12), 3(35).

⁶⁹*Ibid.*, sec. 3(35)–(36); Anne-Marie Brady, *Marketing Dictatorship: Propaganda and Thought Work in Contemporary China* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2008), 17.

⁷⁰“Central Organization Department and Central Propaganda Department Issue ‘Notice on Initiating the ‘New Era of Promoting Patriotic Striving Spirit and Contributing Meritorious

Institutions of Democratic Governance

Service' Campaign That Deeply Penetrates the Large Number of Intellectuals' [Zhongyang zuzhi bu zhongyang xuanchuan bu yinfa "guanyu zai guangda zhishi fenzi zhong shenru kaizhan 'hongyang aiguo fendou jingshen, jiangong liye xin shidai' huodong de tongzhi"], Xinhua, 31 July 18; "Circular From Central Organization Department and Central Propaganda Department Regarding Thoroughly Carrying Out the 'New Era of Promoting Patriotic Striving Spirit and Contributing Meritorious Service' Activities Among a Wide Range of Intellectuals" [Zhonggong zhongyang zuzhi bu zhonggong zhongyang xuanchuanbu guanyu zai guangda zhishi fenzi zhong shenru kaizhan "hongyang aiguo fendou jingshen, jiangong liye xin shidai" huodong de tongzhi], Xinhua, 31 July 18, sec. II(2).

⁷¹ "Chinese Communist Party Issues Notice, Intellectuals Must Be Brainwashed and Patriotic" [Zhonggong fa tongzhi zhishi fenzi xu xi'nao aiguo], Radio Free Asia, 2 August 18.

⁷² Freedom House, "Freedom in the World 2018—China," last visited 27 March 18.

⁷³ Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige de jue ding], Xinhua, 4 March 18; "Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues 'Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies'" [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfa "shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang'an"], Xinhua, 21 March 18.

⁷⁴ Jiang Jie and Zhu Jichai, "Account of the National Supervisory Commission's Creation—Move To Build a System To Strengthen Supervision Over Party and State" [Jianquan dang he guojia jiandu tixi de chuangzhi zhi ju—guojia jiancha weiyuanhui chansheng jishi], Xinhua, 24 March 18; Nectar Gan, "Xi Jinping Thought—The Communist Party's Tighter Grip on China in 16 Characters," South China Morning Post, 25 October 17; "Chinese Communist Party Amends Constitution To Create Supervisory Commission, Strengthens Anticorruption Detention Measures" [Zhonggong xiuxian she jiancha wei qianghua fanfu juya cuoshi], Radio Free Asia, 27 February 18. The establishment of the National Supervisory Commission was done pursuant to the Party's recommendation. Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige de jue ding], Xinhua, 4 March 18; "Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues 'Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies'" [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfa "shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang'an"], Xinhua, 21 March 18.

⁷⁵ PRC Supervision Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo jiancha fa], passed 20 March 18, art. 15.

⁷⁶ Ma Ling, "Evaluating Institutional Robustness and Soundness of People's Congress Through the Establishment of the Supervisory Commission" [Cong jiancha weiyuanhui de sheli kan renmin daibiao dahui zhidu de jianquan he wanshan], Journal of Soochow University, No. 4 (2017), reprinted in Research Centre for Constitutional and Administrative Law, Calaw.cn.Net, 1 December 2017.

⁷⁷ "Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Issues 'Plan for Deepening Reform of Party and Government Agencies'" [Zhonggong zhongyang yinfa "shenhua dang he guojia jigou gaige fang'an"], Xinhua, 21 March 18.

⁷⁸ Dimitar Gueorguiev and Jonathan Stromseth, Brookings Institution, "New Chinese Agency Could Undercut Other Anti-Corruption Efforts," Order From Chaos (blog), 6 March 18; Central Commission for Discipline Inspection and National Supervisory Commission, "Why Do the Central Commission for Discipline Inspection and National Supervisory Commission Work Together?" [Weishenme zhongyang jiwei yu guojia jiancha weiyuanhui yao heshu bangong?], 5 February 18; Central Commission for Discipline Inspection and National Supervisory Commission, "Introduction of CCDI and NSC's Website" [Zhongyang jiwei guojia jianwei wangzhan jianjie], 20 March 18.

⁷⁹ Liang Jun, "Minister of Supervision Yang Xiaodu: National Supervisory Commission Led by Party and Supervised by NPC" [Jianchabu buzhang yang xiaodu: jiancha wei jieshou dang de lingdao he renda de jiandu], People's Daily, 5 March 18.

⁸⁰ PRC Supervision Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo jiancha fa], passed 20 March 18, art. 15.

⁸¹ Dimitar Gueorguiev and Jonathan Stromseth, Brookings Institution, "New Chinese Agency Could Undercut Other Anti-Corruption Efforts," Order From Chaos (blog), 6 March 18; "China's Anti-Corruption Campaign Expands With New Agency," BBC, 20 March 18; Gordon Watts, "Behind the Face of China's New Anti-Corruption Boss," Asia Times, 26 March 18; Josephine Ma, "Revealed: The Far-Reaching Powers of China's New Super Anticorruption Agency," South China Morning Post, 13 March 18.

⁸² "China's Supervisory Commission Director Yang Xiaodu Oversees More Than 100 Million People" [Zhongguo jiancha wei zhuren yang xiaodu jiandu yiyi duo ren], Voice of America, 18 March 18.

⁸³ Amnesty International, "China: New Supervision Law a Systemic Threat to Human Rights," 20 March 18.

⁸⁴ Flora Sapio, "Shuanggui and Extralegal Detention in China," China Information, Vol. 22, No. 1 (March 2008), 14–15.

⁸⁵ PRC Supervision Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo jiancha fa], passed 20 March 18, arts. 22, 43; Ma Shaomeng, "Investigating Both Giving and Receipt of Bribe Requires Replacing 'Double Designation (Lianggui)' With Confinement (Liuzhi)" [Shouhui xinghui yiqi cha biran yaoqiu yong liuzhi qudai "lianggui" cuoshi], Chinese Social Sciences Net, 14 March 18; Mercator Institute for China Studies, "China's National Supervision Commission," last visited 8 May 18.

⁸⁶ Samantha Hoffman, "Managing the State: Social Credit, Surveillance and the CCP's Plan for China," Jamestown Foundation, China Brief, Vol. 17, No. 11, 17 August 17.

⁸⁷ State Council, "Social Credit System Construction Program Outline (2014–2020)" [Shehui xinyong tixi jianshe guihua gangyao (2014–2020 nian)], 14 June 14; "China Outlines Its First Social Credit System," Xinhua, reprinted in Global Times, 27 June 14. For an unofficial English translation, see "Planning Outline for the Construction of a Social Credit System (2014–2020)," translated in China Copyright and Media (blog), 25 April 15.

Institutions of Democratic Governance

⁸⁸ State Council, “Social Credit System Construction Program Outline (2014–2020)” [Shehui xinyong tixi jianshe guihua gangyao (2014–2020 nian)], 14 June 14; “China Outlines Its First Social Credit System,” Xinhua, reprinted in *Global Times*, 27 June 14; Marieke Ohlberg et al., “Central Planning, Local Experiment: The Complex Implementation of China’s Social Credit System,” *Mercator Institute for China Studies, MERICS China Monitor*, 12 December 17, 6; Fokke Obbema et al., “China Rates Its Own Citizens—Including Online Behaviour,” *de Volkskrant*, 25 April 15; Celia Hatton, “China ‘Social Credit’: Beijing Sets Up Huge System,” *BBC*, 26 October 15.

⁸⁹ Rogier Creemers, “China’s Social Credit System: An Evolving Practice of Control,” *Social Science Research Network*, 9 May 18.

⁹⁰ Fokke Obbema et al., “China Rates Its Own Citizens—Including Online Behaviour,” *de Volkskrant*, 25 April 15; Celia Hatton, “China ‘Social Credit’: Beijing Sets Up Huge System,” *BBC*, 26 October 15; Klaus Segbers, “The Chinese Way—Our Model?” *Freie Universität, Center of Global Politics, Global Matters*, 8 December 17.

⁹¹ Mirjam Meissner et al., “Is Big Data Increasing Beijing’s Capacity for Control?” *Asia Society, ChinaFile*, 12 August 16; Julie Makinen, “China Prepares To Rank Its Citizens on ‘Social Credit,’” *Los Angeles Times*, 22 November 15; Fokke Obbema et al., “China Rates Its Own Citizens—Including Online Behaviour,” *de Volkskrant*, 25 April 15; Jeremy Daum, “China Through a Glass, Darkly,” *China Law Translate (blog)*, 24 December 17.

⁹² Marianne von Blomberg, “The Social Credit System’s Greatest Leap Goes Unnoticed,” *Mapping China*, 18 April 18.

⁹³ People’s Bank of China, “Public Notice: Table of Information Regarding Entities Granted Permission To Establish Personal Credit Service” [Sheli jingying geren zhengxin yewu de jigou xuke xinxi gongshi biao], 22 February 18; State Council, *Credit Reporting Industry Management Regulations* [Zhengxin ye guanli tiaoli], issued 21 January 13, effective 15 March 13, art. 2; People’s Bank of China, “Credit Reporting Organization Management Measures” [Zhenxin jigou guanli banfa], effective 20 December 13, art. 5; Liu Jingfeng, “Baihang Credit Service Opens for Business, Pilot Entities Seek Transformation” [Baihang zhengxin ruchang yuan shidian jigou qiu zhuanxing], *Beijing News*, 31 May 18; Luo Ruixin, “Baihang Opens for Business, Enters the First Market-Oriented Personal Data Collection Entity” [Baihang zhengxin kaiye shoujia shichanghua geren zhengxin jigou ruchang], *Caijing*, 23 May 18.

⁹⁴ People’s Bank of China, “Public Notice Regarding Relevant Status of Baihang Credit Scoring Limited Liability Company (Preparatory)” [Guanyu baihang zhengxin youxian gongsi (chou) xiangguan qingkuang de gongshi], 4 January 18; Marianne von Blomberg, “The Social Credit System’s Greatest Leap Goes Unnoticed,” *Mapping China*, 18 April 18.

⁹⁵ National Internet Finance Association of China, “Introduction to the Association” [Xiehui jianjie], last visited 3 April 18; People’s Bank of China, “Public Notice Regarding Relevant Status of Baihang Credit Scoring Limited Liability Company (Preparatory)” [Guanyu baihang zhengxin youxian gongsi (chou) xiangguan qingkuang de gongshi], 4 January 18.

⁹⁶ Song Jie, “How Did Alibaba and Tencent Give Away Data to ‘Credit Network?’” [Ali tengxun ruhe ba shuju gongxian gei “xin lian?”], *China Economic Weekly*, 5 March 18; Many Koetse, “Baihang and the Eight Personal Credit Programmes: A Credit Leap Forward,” *What’s on Weibo*, 10 June 18.

⁹⁷ Song Jie, “How Did Alibaba and Tencent Give Away Data to ‘Credit Network?’” [Ali tengxun ruhe ba shuju gongxian gei “xin lian?”], *China Economic Weekly*, 5 March 18.

⁹⁸ Zhang Junbin, “Enabling the Implementation of Law Is the Biggest Step Forward” [Rang falu keyi luodi shi zui zhongda de jinbu], *China Youth Daily*, 22 May 18; People’s Bank of China, “Public Notice: Table of Information Regarding Entities Granted Permission To Establish Personal Credit Service” [Sheli jingying geren zhengxin yewu de jigou xuke xinxi gongshi biao], 22 February 18; “Customers’ Information Selected by Default, Company of ‘Alipay Annual Statement Incident’ Called in for Interview” [Moren gouxuan yonghu xinxi “zhifubao niandu zhangdan shijian” dangshi qiye bei yuetan], *Xinhua*, 10 January 18; PRC Law of Standardization [Zhonghua renmin gonghe guo biao zhun fa], passed 29 December 88, amended 4 November 17, effective 1 January 18, art. 2.

⁹⁹ “Customers’ Information Selected by Default, Company of ‘Alipay Annual Statement Incident’ Called in for Interview” [Moren gouxuan yonghu xinxi “zhifubao niandu zhangdan shijian” dangshi qiye bei yuetan], *Xinhua*, 10 January 18; Standardization Administration and General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine, “Information Security Technology—Personal Information Security Specification” [Xinxi anquan jishu geren xinxi anquan guifan], issued 29 December 17, effective 1 May 18. According to Samm Sacks of the Center for Strategic & International Studies, the Information Security Technology—Personal Information Security Specification is meant to provide guidelines for implementing the PRC Cybersecurity Law. Samm Sacks, Center for Strategic & International Studies, “New China Data Privacy Standard Looks More Far-Reaching Than GDPR,” 29 January 18; Samm Sacks, Center for Strategic & International Studies, “China’s Emerging Data Privacy System and GDPR,” 9 March 18.

¹⁰⁰ Zhang Junbin et al., “‘Credit Network’ Comes Into Existence, Data Remains a Difficulty” [“Xinlian” luodi nandian haizai shuju], *China Youth Daily*, 6 March 18.

¹⁰¹ Tracey Xiang, “ChinaFintech—Consumer Credit Reporting Agency Baihang Signs up 120+ Data Partners,” *China Tech Biz*, 30 June 18.

¹⁰² Many Koetse, “Baihang and the Eight Personal Credit Programmes: A Credit Leap Forward,” *What’s on Weibo*, 10 June 18. See also Samm Sacks, Center for Strategic & International Studies, “New China Data Privacy Standard Looks More Far-Reaching Than GDPR,” 29 January 18.

¹⁰³ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, arts. 9(4), 14(1), 12; Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A (III) of 10 December 48, arts. 10, 13.

Institutions of Democratic Governance

¹⁰⁴National Development and Reform Commission et al., Opinion on Appropriately Restricting Persons Specified To Have Lost Credit in Serious Ways From Taking the Train Within a Certain Time Period and on Promoting the Construction of a Social Credit System [Guanyu zai yiding qixian nei shidang xianzhi teding yanzhong shixinren chengzuo huoche tuidong shehui xinyong tixi jianshe de yijian], issued 2 March 18, effective 1 May 18, sec. 4(1).

¹⁰⁵National Development and Reform Commission et al., Opinion on Appropriately Restricting Persons Specified To Have Lost Credit in Serious Ways From Taking Civilian Aircraft Within a Certain Time Period and on Promoting the Construction of a Social Credit System [Guanyu zai yiding qixian nei shidang xianzhi teding yanzhong shixinren chengzuo minyong hangkongqi tuidong shehui xinyong tixi jianshe de yijian], issued 2 March 18, effective 1 May 18, sec. 4(1).

¹⁰⁶National Development and Reform Commission et al., Opinion on Appropriately Restricting Persons Specified To Have Lost Credit in Serious Ways From Taking the Train Within a Certain Time Period and on Promoting the Construction of a Social Credit System [Guanyu zai yiding qixian nei shidang xianzhi teding yanzhong shixinren chengzuo huoche tuidong shehui xinyong tixi jianshe de yijian], issued 2 March 18, effective 1 May 18, sec. 2(5); National Development and Reform Commission et al., Opinion on Appropriately Restricting Persons Specified To Have Lost Credit in Serious Ways From Taking Civilian Aircraft Within a Certain Time Period and on Promoting the Construction of a Social Credit System [Guanyu zai yiding qixian nei shidang xianzhi teding yanzhong shixinren chengzuo minyong hangkongqi tuidong shehui xinyong tixi jianshe de yijian], issued 2 March 18, effective 1 May 18, sec. 2(5).

¹⁰⁷Maya Wang, Human Rights Watch, “China’s Chilling ‘Social Credit’ Blacklist,” 12 December 17.

¹⁰⁸Gong Peijia, “National Development and Reform Commission Deputy Director Zhang Yong: People Who Lost Credit and Who Are Untrustworthy Restricted From Taking Planes and Trains” [Guojia fagaiwei fuzhuren zhang yong: shixinzhe laolai xianzhi cheng feiji zuo huoche], China Times, 6 March 18.

¹⁰⁹“Some Worry That China’s Skynet Surveillance Might Infringe Privacy” [Zhongguo tianwang jiankong bei you huo qin hai geren yinsi], Voice of America, 26 September 17.

¹¹⁰“Public Security Surveillance Systems Stride Toward Internet High Definition” [Gong’an jiankong xitong xiang wangluo gaoqing hua maijin], HC360.com, reprinted in Procuratorate Daily, 1 August 12.

¹¹¹“Monitoring You With 20 Million Surveillance Cameras, Has the Skynet Project Infringed on Privacy?” [2000 wan shexiangtou kanzhe ni de tianwang gongcheng qinfan yinsi le ma], China News Service, reprinted in CCTV, 29 September 17. For more information on “stability maintenance,” see Jason Todd, “China’s Rigid Stability—Yu Jianrong Analyses a Predicament,” Australian Centre on China in the World, China Story, 27 January 13.

¹¹²“Some Worry That China’s Skynet Surveillance Might Infringe Privacy” [Zhongguo tianwang jiankong bei you huo qin hai geren yinsi], Voice of America, 26 September 17.

¹¹³Chen Lei, “How To Realize Complete Coverage for Public Safety Video Surveillance” [Gonggong anquan shipin jiankong ruhe shixian quan fugai], Legal Daily, 13 February 18.

¹¹⁴Yang Xueyi, “‘Skynet’: Installing a Pair of Sensitive ‘Magical Eyes’ for Security and Defense Institutions” [“Tianwang”: gei anfang zhuang le shuang minrui “fayan”], Worker’s Daily, 23 March 18.

¹¹⁵Party Central Committee and State Council, Opinion on Implementing Strategy To Rejuvenate Villages [Zhonggong zhongyang guowuyuan guanyu shishi xiagun zhenxing zhanlue de yijian], 2 January 18, para. 6(5); Chen Lei, “How To Realize Complete Coverage for Public Safety Video Surveillance” [Gonggong anquan shipin jiankong ruhe shixian quan fugai], Legal Daily, 13 February 18.

¹¹⁶“Yicai Research: Artificial Intelligence and Sharp Eyes Projects Moving Forward Together, Development in This Field Is Speeding Up!” [Yicai yan xuan: zhinenghua he xueliang gongcheng shuanglun qudong, zhege hangye zheng jiasu fazhan!], Yicai, 5 March 18.

¹¹⁷Wenxin Fan et al., “China Snares Innocent and Guilty Alike To Build World’s Biggest DNA Database,” Wall Street Journal, 26 December 17.

¹¹⁸Ibid. See also Human Rights Watch, “China: Minority Region Collects DNA From Millions,” 13 December 17.

¹¹⁹Wenxin Fan et al., “China Snares Innocent and Guilty Alike To Build World’s Biggest DNA Database,” Wall Street Journal, 26 December 17.

¹²⁰Ibid.

¹²¹Ibid.; Human Rights Watch, “China: Minority Region Collects DNA From Millions,” 13 December 17.

¹²²“Readers’ Comments” [Duzhe pinglun], Caijing, 5 February 18; Human Rights Watch, “China: Minority Region Collects DNA From Millions,” 13 December 17. Commission staff verified that as of May 11, 2018, the draft legislation that proposes to place certain restrictions on surveillance systems had not been enacted. Ministry of Public Security, Public Security Video and Image Data System Management Regulations (Draft for Solicitation of Public Comments) [“Gonggong anquan shipin tuxiang xinxi xitong guanli tiaoli (zhengqiu yijian gao)”], 28 November 16, art. 11. Commission staff further notes that the lack of an effective law protecting privacy in this context contradicts a claim made in an official news article. “Facial Recognition, AI and Big Data Poised To Boost Chinese Public Safety,” Global Times, reprinted in People’s Daily, 17 October 17.

¹²³UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, General Comment No. 25: The Right To Participate in Public Affairs, Voting Rights and the Right of Equal Access to Public Service, CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.7, 7 December 96, item 12.

¹²⁴“Many People Disappeared or Detained in China on ‘June Fourth’ Sensitive Day, Internet Control Strengthened” [“Liusi” ming’anri zhongguo duoren shilian bei zhua wangkong jiaqiang], Radio Free Asia, 4 June 18; “Strict Control on June Fourth Anniversary Successively Lifted, Two Rights Defenders in Guangdong Continued To Be Out of Contact” [Liusi zhounian yankong luxu jiejin guangdong er weiqian renshi reng shilian], Radio Free Asia, 6 June 18; Rights De-

Institutions of Democratic Governance

fense Network, “Dissident Shen Liangqing Summoned by Hefei Police on Day of June Fourth, Xi’an Police Threatened Ma Xiaoming at His Home” [Liusi dangri yiyi renshi shen liangqing zao hefei jingfang chuanhuan ma xiaoming zao xi’an jingfang shangmen weixie], 5 June 18; Rights Defense Network, “Rights Defenders in Many Places Illegally Detained, Summoned, and Have Freedom Restricted on the Eve and Day of June Fourth” [Liusi qianxi he dangri duodi weiquan renshi bei dang feifa jiya, chuanhuan huo bei xianzhi ziyou], 5 June 18.

¹²⁵ Rights Defense Network, “Rights Defenders in Many Places Illegally Detained, Summoned, and Have Freedom Restricted on the Eve and Day of June Fourth” [Liusi qianxi he dangri duodi weiquan renshi bei dang feifa jiya, chuanhuan huo bei xianzhi ziyou], 5 June 18.

¹²⁶ See, e.g., Rights Defense Network, “Stability Maintenance During 19th Party Congress, Nanjing Democracy Advocate Wang Jian Detained on Suspicion of Picking Quarrels and Provoking Trouble Because of Speech, Administratively Detained for 15 Days” [19 da weiwen nanjing minzhu renshi wang jian yinyan huozui bei shexian “xunxin zishi” xingzheng juliu 15 tian], 20 October 17; “Creators of Popular Rights Defense Songs, Xu Lin and Liu Sifang, Successively Detained” [Chuangzuo weiquan gequ kuaizhi renkou xu lin he liu sifang xiangji beizhual, Radio Free Asia, 27 September 17; “Participant in Sea Memorial for Liu Xiaobo Detained by ‘Facial Recognition’” [Canyu liu xiaobo haji renshi yi bei “renlian shibie” zao zhuabu], Radio Free Asia, 22 May 18.

¹²⁷ “Participant in Sea Memorial for Liu Xiaobo Detained by ‘Facial Recognition’” [Canyu liu xiaobo haji renshi yi bei “renlian shibie” zao zhuabu], Radio Free Asia, 22 May 18.

¹²⁸ Ibid. For more information on Liu Xiaobo, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2004-03114.

¹²⁹ Ibid.

¹³⁰ Rights Defense Network, “The Real Situation of Qin Yongmin’s Trial” [Qin yongmin an tingshen zhenshi qingkuang], 19 May 18; Rights Defense Network, “Qin Yongmin’s Indictment” [Qin yongmin qisushu], 2 July 16; “Tight Security at Qin Yongmin’s Trial, Onlooking Citizens Escorted Away” [Qin yongmin an kaiting jiebei senyan weiquan gongmin bei daizou], Radio Free Asia, 11 May 18. For more information on Qin Yongmin, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2004-02138.

¹³¹ Rights Defense Network, “The Real Situation of Qin Yongmin’s Trial” [Qin yongmin an tingshen zhenshi qingkuang], 19 May 18; Rights Defense Network, “Qin Yongmin’s Indictment” [Qin yongmin qisushu], 2 July 16; “Over Three Years After Qin Yongmin Was Detained, Trial To Be Held Friday” [Qin yongmin bei ya chaoguo san nian zhouwu kai shen], Radio Free Asia, 8 May 18.

¹³² “Over Three Years After Qin Yongmin Was Detained, Trial To Be Held on Friday.” [Qin yongmin bei ya chaoguo san nian zhouwu kai shen], Radio Free Asia, 8 May 18.

¹³³ Rights Defense Network, “Wuhan Dissident Qin Yongmin Heavily Sentenced to 13 Years in Prison” [Wuhan yiyi renshi qin yongmin zao zhongpan 13 nian], 11 July 18.

¹³⁴ Rights Defense Network, “Monthly Report on Detained Political Prisoners and Prisoners of Conscience in Mainland China (May 31, 2018) Issue No. 32 (Total 761 Persons) (Part 1)” [Zhongguo dalu zaiya zhengzhifan, liangxinfaan yuedu baogao (2018 nian 5 yue 31 ri) di 32 qi (gong 761 ren) (di 1 bufen)], 31 May 18; Nomaan Merchant, “China Detains Editor of Human Rights Website for Subversion,” Associated Press, 25 November 16.

¹³⁵ PRC Electoral Law of the National People’s Congress and Local People’s Congresses [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo quanguo renmin daibiao dahui he difang geji renmin daibiao dahui xuanju fa], passed 1 July 79, amended 10 December 82, 2 December 86, 28 February 95, 27 October 04, 14 March 10, 29 August 15, art. 2.

¹³⁶ See, e.g., Qing Zu, “Renewing the Scene, Renewing the Vitality” [Huanchu xin qixiang huanchu xin huoli], Qinghai Daily, 18 January 18; “Training Held for Elections for New Village-Level ‘Two Committees’ Across the Province” [Quansheng cun “liang wei” huan jie xuanju peixunban juban], Shaanxi Daily, 28 January 18; “Strengthen Party’s Leadership Throughout the Entire Election Process” [Ba jiaqiang dang de lingdao guanchuan huan jie gongzuo quan guocheng], Henan Daily, 2 April 18.

¹³⁷ “Local People’s Congress Elections in China: Independent Candidates Face Increasing Difficulties” [Zhongguo jiceng renda xuanju: duli houxuanren chujing geng jiannan], Deutsche Welle, 1 February 18.

¹³⁸ See, e.g., “In Village Leader Election in Laizhou, Shandong, Former Elected Village Head Detained and Was Unable To Participate in Election” [Shandong laizhou cun zhuren xuanju qian minxuan cunzhang bei ju wufa canxuan], Radio Free Asia, 15 January 18; Civil Rights & Livelihood Watch, “Wan Xiaoyun, From Qianjiang, Hubei, To Be Released on Bail Soon, but Indicted by Procuratorate” [Hubei qianjiang wan xiaoyun qubao qiman jiangzhi que bei jianchayuan qisu], 15 December 17; Yao Lifa, Rights Defense Network, “Independent Candidate From Yongqing County, Gansu Province, Qu Mingxue Interrogated on Eve of ‘Two Sessions’ in Beijing” [Gansu sheng yongqing xian duli houxuanren qu mingxue zai beijing “lianghui” qianxi bei xunwen], 1 March 18; Rights Defense Network, “Urgent Attention Needed: Lawyer Yu Wensheng Detained by Beijing Police This Morning” [Jinji guanzhu: yu wensheng lushi jin zao bei beijing jingfang zhuabu], 19 January 18; “Detained for Promoting Intraparty Election of General Secretary, Zi Su’s Retirement Payment Cut off” [Changyi dangnei xuanju zongshuji bei kou zi su zao tingfa tuixiujin], Radio Free Asia, 8 February 18.

¹³⁹ Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A (III) on 10 December 48, art. 21. Article 21 of the UDHR provides that, “Everyone has the right to take part in the government of his country, directly or through freely chosen representatives The will of the people shall be the basis of the authority of government; this will shall be expressed in periodic and genuine elections which shall be by universal and equal suffrage and shall be held by secret vote or by equivalent free voting procedures.”

¹⁴⁰ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 25.

Institutions of Democratic Governance

¹⁴¹In Laizhou, Shandong, Village Leader Election, Former Elected Village Head Detained and Was Unable To Participate in Election” [Shandong laizhou cun zhuren xuanju qian minxuan cunzhang bei ju wufa canxuan], Radio Free Asia, 15 January 18.

¹⁴²Ibid.

¹⁴³State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18; State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18.

¹⁴⁴“Regulating Red-Letterhead Documents, Opening Up the ‘Last Mile’ of Rule-Based Government” [Guifan hongtou wenjian, datong fazhi zhengfu de “zuihou yi gongli”], Southern Metropolitan Daily, 19 January 18; Zhang Cong, “Bringing ‘Red-Letterhead Documents’ More in Line With Regulations” [Rang “hongtou wenjian” gengjia guifan], People’s Daily, 14 February 18; Zhu Hengshun, “The Original Intention of Legislation Is To Rein in ‘Arbitrary Power’” [Lifa de benyi zai yueshu quanli “renxing”], Xinhua, 12 March 15.

¹⁴⁵State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, arts. 3, 9; State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 3. For a comparison with older versions of the regulations, see Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, effective 1 January 02, art. 3; Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, effective 1 January 02, art. 3.

¹⁴⁶State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 13. See also National People’s Congress, “Chapter Four: Local Law or Autonomous Region Regulations, and Separate Regulations or Rules” [Di si zhang difangxing fagui, zizhi tiaoli he danxing tiaoli, guizhang], 1 August 01.

¹⁴⁷State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 13; State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 3. See also National People’s Congress, “Chapter Three: Administrative Regulations” [Di san zhang xingzheng fagui], 1 August 01.

¹⁴⁸State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 13; State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 15.

¹⁴⁹Shen Kui, “Participatory Rulemaking in China Needs Even More Effort,” Regulatory Review, 9 April 18; Jamie P. Horsley, Brookings Institution, “China Implements More Participatory Rulemaking Under Communist Party,” 15 March 18.

¹⁵⁰State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, arts. 3, 9; State Council, Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, amended 22 December 17, effective 1 May 18, art. 3. For a comparison with older versions of the regulations, see Regulations on the Formulation Process of Administrative Regulations [Xingzheng fagui zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, effective 1 January 02, art. 3, 8; Regulations on the Formulation Process of Rules [Guizhang zhiding chengxu tiaoli], issued 16 November 01, effective 1 January 02, art. 3.

¹⁵¹Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Regulations on Open Party Affairs of the Chinese Communist Party (Trial) [Zhongguo gongchandang dangwu gongkai tiaoli (shixing)], effective 20 December 17, art. 8.

¹⁵²State Council, PRC Open Government Information Regulations [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo zhengfu xinxi gongkai tiaoli], issued 5 April 07, effective 1 May 08, art. 13.

¹⁵³Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Regulations on Open Party Affairs of the Chinese Communist Party (Trial) [Zhongguo gongchandang dangwu gongkai tiaoli (shixing)], effective 20 December 17, arts. 20–23.

¹⁵⁴Ibid., arts. 9–11.

¹⁵⁵Gao Bo, “Holding Corruption by the ‘Throat’” [E’zhu fubai de “yanhou”], People’s Daily, 3 March 15; Dimitar Gueorguiev and Jonathan Stromseth, Brookings Institution, “New Chinese Agency Could Undercut Other Anti-Corruption Efforts,” Order From Chaos (blog), 6 March 18; Dan Hough, “Why Has China’s Anti-Corruption Rating Barely Budged Despite Thousands of Arrests?” South China Morning Post, 23 February 18.

¹⁵⁶Jamie P. Horsley, “The Chinese Communist Party’s Experiment With Transparency,” The Diplomat, 1 February 18.

¹⁵⁷See, e.g., Lily Kuo, “37,000 Chinese Officials Punished for ‘Frugality Code’ Breaches,” Guardian, 31 July 18.

¹⁵⁸Central Commission for Discipline Inspection, “CCDI Circular on Status of Disciplinary Inspection by Discipline and Inspection Offices Nationwide in 2017” [Zhongyang jiwei tongbao 2017 nian quanguo jijian jiancha jiguan jilu shencha qingkuang], 11 January 18.

¹⁵⁹Javier C. Hernández, “The Propaganda I See on My Morning Commute,” New York Times, 28 January 18. See also Transparency International, “Corruption Perceptions Index 2017,” 21 February 18.

¹⁶⁰David Skidmore, “Understanding Chinese President Xi’s Anti-Corruption Campaign,” The Conversation, 27 October 17.

Institutions of Democratic Governance

¹⁶¹ Central Commission for Discipline Inspection, “Communiqué of Central Commission for Discipline Inspection’s Second Plenary Session During Chinese Communist Party 19th Party Congress” [Zhongguo gongchandang dishijiu jie zhongyang jilu jiancha weiyuanhui di’er ci quanti huiyi gongbao], 13 January 18.

¹⁶² “Express News: Wang Qishan Elected To Become Vice President of the People’s Republic of China” [Kuaixun: wang qishan dangxuan wei zhonghua renmin gongheguo fu zhuxi], Xinhua, 17 March 18.

¹⁶³ “Wang Qishan’s Resumé” [Wang qishan jianli], Xinhua, 17 March 18; “Party’s 19th Congress First Plenary Session Approves Candidates for Secretary, Deputy Secretary, and Standing Committee Members as Selected by CCDI’s First Plenary Session, Zhao Leji Appointed as CCDI Secretary” [Dang de shijiu jie yizhong quanwei pizhun le zhongyang jiwei diyi ci quanti huiyi xuanju chansheng shuji, fushuji he changwu weiyuanhui weiyuan renxuan, zhao leji ren zhongyang jiwei shuji], Xinhua, 25 October 17.

¹⁶⁴ Wang Qishan, “Wang Qishan: Launching a New Era, Beginning a New Journey” [Wang qishan: kaiqi xin shidai tashang xin zhengchen], People’s Daily, 7 November 17.

¹⁶⁵ Ibid.; Nectar Gan, “China’s Graft-Busters Told To Zero in on Political Loyalty and Discipline,” South China Morning Post, 13 January 18.

¹⁶⁶ Dan Hough, “Why Has China’s Anti-Corruption Rating Barely Budged Despite Thousands of Arrests?” South China Morning Post, 23 February 18.

¹⁶⁷ For more information on Liu Yao, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2008-00408.

¹⁶⁸ Human Rights in China, “Liu Yao & Wife Lai Wei’e Draft Case Timelines & Procedural Status,” 19 March 18.

¹⁶⁹ Human Rights in China, “Draft Case Summary of Liu Yao Lawyer and Whistleblower Sentenced to 20 Years in Prison for Exposing Corruption,” 19 March 18.

¹⁷⁰ “Li Jianxin, Anticorruption Hero in Guangdong, Possibly Framed, Accused of Extortion and Heavily Sentenced to 11 Years” [Guangdong fantan xia li jianxin jietan yi zao gouxian bei zhi qiaozha zhongpan 11 nian], Radio Free Asia, 2 February 18. For more information on Li Jianxin, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2016-00498.

¹⁷¹ Ibid.; Rights Defense Network, “Lawyer Lin Qilei: Development in the Case of ‘Huiyang Oubo’ Li Jianxin—Investigation and Indictment Period Expires Soon” [Lin qilei lushi: “huiyang oubo” li jian xin anqing jinzhan qingkuang—shencha qisu qixian jiji jiang jieman], 22 November 16; Rights Defense Network, “‘Huizhou Oubo’ Li Jianxin Indicted After Arrest” [“Huizhou oubo” li jianxin bei daibu hou yi bei qisu], 14 December 16; Zhu Yong, “Professional Complainant in Huizhou Suffered Chopped Fingers and Acid Attack, Right Eye Blinded From Being Hacked” [Huizhou zhiye jubao ren zao duan zhi po liusuan you yan bei kan shiming], Southern Metropolitan Daily, 9 July 13.