# II. Human Rights

# FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

#### Introduction

During the 2014 reporting year, the Chinese government and Communist Party continued to strengthen controls over freedom of expression, particularly online expression, violating international standards and protections for freedom of expression in China's Constitution and other domestic legislation. As a result, people ranging from independent journalists and media professionals to local organizers and rights lawyers faced censorship, official harassment, and detention amid ongoing crackdowns, in some cases due to sensitivity surrounding the 25th anniversary of the 1989 Tiananmen protests. Government and Party officials showed heightened, high-level concern regarding their ability to control the Internet and signaled renewed efforts to strengthen their control over the Internet. Such efforts appeared to target the online activity of rights and democracy advocates, as well as others who used the Internet to express peaceful criticism of the government or Party.

# International Standards on Free Expression

This past year, the Chinese government and Communist Party continued to restrict expression in ways that contravened international human rights standards. According to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)—which China has signed <sup>1</sup> and stated its intent to ratify <sup>2</sup>—and the UN Special Rapporteur on the Promotion and Protection of the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression, expression may be restricted only if such restrictions are (1) for the purpose of respecting the rights or reputations of others or protecting national security, public order, public health or morals, or the general welfare; (2) set forth in law; and (3) necessary and the least restrictive means to achieve the purported aim.<sup>3</sup> Regarding requirement (1), an October 2009 UN Human Rights Council (UNHRC) resolution stated that restrictions on "discussion of government policies and political debate," "peaceful demonstrations or political activities, including for peace or democracy," and "expression of opinion and dissent" are inconsistent with Article 19(3) of the ICCPR.<sup>4</sup> At the October 2013 sestimated the control of the ICCPR. At the October 2013 sestimated the control of the ICCPR. At the October 2013 sestimated the control of the ICCPR. sion of the UNHRC's Universal Periodic Review (UPR) of the Chinese government's human rights record, member states expressed concerns over restrictions on freedom of expression in China, including expression online, and urged China to ratify the ICCPR.5 In its official response to the UPR recommendations, the Chinese government stated that China's Constitution, laws, and government protect freedom of expression in China<sup>6</sup> but it did not provide further information on any specific protections for freedom of expression.7

Some government and Party sources appealed to the concept of "Internet sovereignty" to defend the claim that China has sole authority to set standards for governance of the Internet within its borders. For example, a June 2014 article in the People's Daily—the official news media of the Communist Party—asserted that

"the concept of 'Internet sovereignty' conforms to the rules of international law" and that "other countries do not have the right to interfere." The UNHRC, to which China was reelected in November 2013, 10 has emphasized that international standards for freedom of expression online apply to all countries, regardless of state borders. In a June 2012 resolution, the UNHRC affirmed that "the same rights that people have offline must also be protected online, in particular freedom of expression, which is applicable regardless of frontiers and through any media of one's choice." 11

# Growth and Control of the Internet and Mobile Communications EXPANDING OVERALL ACCESS

China's Internet landscape has experienced dramatic growth in recent years, particularly in the number of Internet users accessing the Web through mobile devices. According to the China Internet Network Information Center, which operates under the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology (MIIT),<sup>12</sup> there were 632 million Internet users in China by the end of June 2014, bringing Internet users to 46.9 percent of the total population.<sup>13</sup> Also by late June 2014, 527 million people in China reportedly accessed the

Internet from mobile devices, amounting to 83.4 percent of all Internet users in China.<sup>14</sup>

Amid this growth, the Chinese government continued to take steps to expand the country's telecommunications infrastructure and provide greater Internet access. For example, in December 2013, MIIT issued 4G licenses to three Chinese telecom operators, <sup>15</sup> one of which—China Telecom—reportedly announced it would establish the world's largest 4G network <sup>16</sup> and offer commercial 4G services in 340 Chinese cities in 2014. <sup>17</sup> In a March 2014 government work report to the National People's Congress, Premier Li Keqiang stated the government would extend broadband connectivity to rural villages, increase Internet speeds, and develop 4G mobile communications. <sup>18</sup>

# MAINTAINING GOVERNMENT AND PARTY CONTROL OF ONLINE CONTENT

The government and Party expressed heightened, high-level concerns regarding their ability to control the Internet and signaled a renewed effort to strengthen their control over the Internet. For example, the November 2013 Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Third Plenum Decision on Certain Major Issues Regarding Comprehensively Deepening Reforms called explicitly for the "management" <sup>19</sup> and "supervision" <sup>20</sup> of the Internet, as well as the "supervision" of online public opinion, <sup>21</sup> themes government and Party sources have emphasized in recent years. <sup>22</sup> The Commission observed documents from government and Party Web sites this past year that echoed these themes. <sup>23</sup> For example, in February 2014, during the first meeting of the newly established Central Internet Security and Informatization Leading Group, a high-level group chaired by President Xi Jinping, Xi reportedly "called for innovative methods to spread mainstream values and stimulate positive energy while maintaining proper guidance of online opinions in terms of timing, intensity and impact." <sup>24</sup>

Some reports described the Internet or online public opinion as a "struggle," <sup>25</sup> "battleground," <sup>26</sup> or "new challenge and new test" <sup>27</sup> for authorities. A People's Liberation Army Daily report stated:

Enemy forces use the Internet to advocate forcefully for Western values such as "constitutional democracy" and "universal values," wantonly discrediting our country's social system . . . . [We] absolutely cannot let erroneous ideological trends tarnish the image of the country and the Party.<sup>28</sup>

Such reports cited as their basis remarks that Xi made at an August 2013 "national propaganda and ideology work meeting" <sup>29</sup> and interpreted Xi's remarks to include strengthening control over the Internet. <sup>30</sup>

Chinese officials continued campaigns to control the expanding reach of microbloggers. In the latter half of 2013, authorities reportedly began to investigate hundreds of Sina Weibo microbloggers, detaining over 100 \$^{31}\$—including prominent microbloggers known as "Big V" users because of their large followings and verified status \$^{32}\$—as part of what some international media described as a crackdown. \$^{33}\$ For example, in July 2014, the social media accounts of "Big V" and outspoken political commentator Li Chengpeng were closed. \$^{34}\$ Following these developments, the total number of Weibo posts dropped \$^{35}\$ as much as 70 percent from early 2011 to late 2013, according to a study conducted at East China Normal University. \$^{36}\$ On March 13, 2014, authorities closed an unspecified number of accounts on WeChat, a mobile social media platform owned by Tencent that reportedly gained users who left Weibo. \$^{37}\$ In August 2014, the State Internet Information Office released the Interim Provisions for the Management of the Development of Instant Messaging Tools in Providing Public Information Services, \$^{38}\$ which prohibits public microblog accounts that have not received approval from posting or reposting political news. \$^{39}\$

### CENSORSHIP OF ONLINE CONTENT

Chinese authorities continued to block and filter sensitive online content, in some cases through censorship campaigns. For example, officials blocked online reports regarding protests against the construction of a paraxylene ("PX") plant in Maoming city, Guangdong province. Officials also blocked online reports regarding corruption investigations of Zhou Yongkang, former Minister of Public Security and Secretary of the Communist Party Central Committee Political and Legal Affairs Commission; Zhou's son Zhou Bin; and Li Dongsheng, former Vice Minister of Public Security. Censorship initiatives included a "Sweep Away Pornography, Strike Down False Media" campaign, which some commentators noted gave authorities leeway to strengthen government and Party control over the Internet more broadly. The campaign's leadership included a joint government-Party entity under the Party's Central Propaganda and Ideology Work Leading Group, which itself was chaired by Liu Yunshan, a member of the Political Bureau of the Communist Party Central Committee. In April 2014, authorities revoked some of Sina's online publication licenses after reportedly finding pornographic content on Web sites run by Sina.

commentators noted the revocations appeared to be connected to the growing influence of Sina Weibo,<sup>47</sup> which filed for an initial public offering in the United States shortly before the revocations.<sup>48</sup>

In the months preceding June 4, 2014—the 25th anniversary of the violent suppression of the 1989 Tiananmen protests—authorities blocked and filtered a range of online content related to the protests. For example, in June 2014, the University of Toronto's Citizen Lab verified more than 60 Tiananmen-related keywords censored on Weibo, 9 of which were new additions in 2014.<sup>49</sup> Authorities also deleted online discussion of and blocked online searches for content related to former Party General Secretary Hu Yaobang, whose death in 1989 triggered the Tiananmen protests.<sup>50</sup>

Authorities also increased content restrictions on Internet television content providers. In or shortly before mid-July 2014, China's media regulator, the State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film and Television (SAPPRFT), met with China's seven licensed Internet television content providers and instructed them to filter unapproved content,<sup>51</sup> including "content from commercial video websites," as well as "unauthorized foreign movies, short movies and other video products." 52 SAPPRFT reportedly also instructed Internet television content providers to remove third-party apps from their devices and barred Internet television content providers from entering into business agreements with companies under investigation by SAPPRFT.<sup>53</sup> As of mid-July 2014, SAPPRFT reportedly ordered Internet television content providers not to work with LeTV, a licensed Internet television content provider suspected of violating content restrictions.<sup>54</sup> All these actions followed requirements issued by SAPPRFT in 2011 55 that reportedly restrict content provided through Internet television services.56

# Censorship of U.S. Companies' Online Content

According to international media reports, U.S. company LinkedIn—which began operating in China in 2014 <sup>57</sup>—began censoring sensitive content that originated in China. <sup>58</sup> Censorship reportedly extended to both Chinese- and English-language versions of the site, <sup>59</sup> as well as to users based in Hong Kong or outside of China. <sup>60</sup> For example, a United Kingdom-based artist previously based in China reported some of her LinkedIn posts were censored. <sup>61</sup> A student in Hong Kong reported LinkedIn censored a link he posted for a video that reportedly "express[ed] support for relatives and friends of those killed during the Tiananmen crackdown." <sup>62</sup>

#### Censorship of U.S. Companies' Online Content—Continued

Shortly before the 25th anniversary of the violent suppression of the 1989 Tiananmen protests, U.S. company Google began experiencing online service disruptions in China. GreatFire.org, an organization that monitors online censorship in China, 4 reported on June 2, 2014, that "all Google services in all countries, encrypted or not, are now blocked in China . . . . [T]he block covers Google Hong Kong . . ., Google.com and all other country specific versions . . . ." 5 Chinese authorities did not claim responsibility for the disruptions, but international media reports linked the disruptions to broader attempts by authorities to censor online content, as well as sensitivity surrounding the Tiananmen anniversary. Reuters quoted a Google spokesman as saying "We've checked extensively and there's nothing wrong on our end."

Rules regarding censorship of online content in China remained opaque. Internet regulations contain vague and broad prohibitions on content that "harms the honor or interests of the nation," <sup>68</sup> "spreads rumors," <sup>69</sup> or "disrupts national policies on religion," <sup>70</sup> but they do not define these concepts or contain criteria to determine when content has violated one of these prohibitions. <sup>71</sup> On March 1, 2014, the Implementing Regulations of the PRC Law on the Protection of State Secrets (Implementing Regulations)—which extends to information on the Internet <sup>72</sup>—entered into force <sup>73</sup> but did not clarify what could be classified as state secrets. <sup>74</sup> For example, the Implementing Regulations stipulated that authorities should not classify as state secrets "matters that should be public in accordance with the law" <sup>75</sup> but did not explain what kinds of information the law entitles the public to access. <sup>76</sup>

# Punishment of Citizens for Free Expression

Authorities continued to detain and harass rights and democracy advocates, Internet writers, human rights lawyers, citizen journalists, and others who exercised their constitutional right to freedom of speech,<sup>77</sup> in a crackdown that some international media and individuals in China described as the worst in recent decades.<sup>78</sup> Authorities used vaguely worded criminal charges and extralegal harassment to punish citizens for free expression, as the following selected cases illustrate:

- In September 2013, officials in Tianshui city, Gansu province, criminally detained 16-year-old microblog user Yang Zhong (aka Yang Hui) on suspicion of "picking quarrels and provoking trouble" for online posts. 79 Yang had posted comments urging people to protest an allegedly hasty investigation by local authorities that had ruled the death of a karaoke club worker to be a suicide. 80 Police released Yang a week later, following an outcry among Weibo users protesting Yang's detention. 81
- In February 2014, officials in Beijing municipality summoned for questioning human rights advocate Hu Jia on charges of "picking quarrels and provoking trouble" and interrogated him regarding allegedly sensitive Twitter postings.<sup>82</sup> At the time, Hu reportedly was under home confinement.<sup>83</sup> Au-

thorities released Hu from home confinement in June 2014,84 and in July 2014, Hu was beaten on the street by men he be-

lieved to be plainclothes police.85

- In late February 2014, Chinese artist and poet Liu Xia was reportedly hospitalized, <sup>86</sup> and later discharged. <sup>87</sup> Authorities have held Liu under illegal home confinement since October 2010, following the December 2009 conviction of her husband, Nobel Peace Prize laureate Liu Xiaobo. <sup>88</sup> According to Reuters, she suffered from "heart problems, possibly severe depression, and other ailments made worse during her time under guard." <sup>89</sup> On February 27, Radio Free Asia reported authorities discharged Liu Xia from the hospital after her condition improved, according to friend He Jian. <sup>90</sup> Following her hospitalization, her lawyer Mo Shaoping reported he had "very little information" regarding her condition or location. <sup>91</sup> Chinese officials have said "there are no charges" against her and officials "[have] taken no legal enforcement measures" against her. <sup>92</sup>
- In March 2014, public security officials in Beijing criminally detained "citizen journalists" Liu Xuehong, Xing Jian, and Wang Jing on suspicion of "picking quarrels and provoking trouble" <sup>93</sup> after they reported on a self-immolation and other protests in Tiananmen Square. <sup>94</sup>
- In April 2014, a Beijing court sentenced Qin Zhihui to three years in prison for allegedly "defam[ing] celebrities and the government." <sup>95</sup> A September 2013 joint interpretation issued by the Supreme People's Court and the Supreme People's Procuratorate authorizes officials to imprison online authors if "defamatory" content is reposted at least 500 times or visited at least 5,000 times online. <sup>96</sup> According to Xinhua, one of Qin's posts was reposted 11,000 times. <sup>97</sup>

### Criminal Punishment and Harassment Surrounding the 25th Anniversary of the Tiananmen Protests

The crackdown on free expression spanned June 4, 2014—the 25th anniversary of the 1989 Tiananmen protests—during which time authorities harassed, imprisoned, and detained a variety of individuals who sought to commemorate the protests in private meetings, memorial services, or online spaces. The following are sample cases:

• Authorities placed Ding Zilin, former leader of the advocacy group Tiananmen Mothers, under surveillance at her home in Beijing. When filmmaker He Yang attempted to visit Ding in March 2014, authorities reportedly detained him on suspicion of "endangering national security" and released him after he agreed not to film subject matter related to the 1989 protests. After Ding passed leadership of Tiananmen Mothers to successor You Weijie, authorities reportedly disconnected You's phone line. Later, authorities forced Ding to stay out of Beijing until after June 4. Lot

#### Criminal Punishment and Harassment Surrounding the 25th Anniversary of the Tiananmen Protests—Continued

- On March 24, 2014, a district court in Suzhou municipality, Jiangsu province, sentenced Gu Yimin to one year and six months in prison for "inciting subversion of state power." <sup>102</sup> Gu's lawyers reportedly were assaulted by unknown assailants outside the court. <sup>103</sup> Officials detained Gu in June 2013 after he posted a cartoon online referencing the 1989 protests. <sup>104</sup>
- On April 24, 2014, authorities criminally detained journalist Gao Yu on suspicion of "leaking state secrets" to a foreign Web site. <sup>105</sup> According to a Xinhua report, Gao provided a central government document to an overseas Web site, but the report did not elaborate on the nature of the document. <sup>106</sup> Gao reportedly was planning to attend a private meeting with others to commemorate the 1989 protests; authorities later detained some of those who attended the meeting. <sup>107</sup>
- In May 2014, authorities in Zhengzhou city, Henan province, detained participants in a February 2014 memorial service commemorating former Communist Party leaders Hu Yaobang and Zhao Ziyang and the victims of the violent suppression of the 1989 protests. Officials detained organizers Yu Shiwen and Chen Wei—a married couple—as well as participants Shi Yu, Fang Yan, and Hou Shuai, on suspicion of "gathering a crowd to disturb order in a public place." 109 Officials also criminally detained Shi, Fang, and Hou's defense lawyer Chang Boyang as he prepared to visit them in detention. 110
- In late May or early June 2014, officials in Chaozhou municipality, Guangdong province, criminally detained Zhang Kunle on suspicion of "picking quarrels and provoking trouble" after Zhang called for online essay submissions regarding the 1989 protests. 111 Previously, authorities reportedly "compelled" Zhang to leave Shenzhen municipality, where he was living, and return to his family home in Chaozhou, due to heightened sensitivity surrounding the 25th anniversary of the 1989 protests. 112
- On June 9, 2014, officials in Beijing reported that university student Zhao Huaxu had been criminally detained on suspicion of "teaching criminal methods." <sup>113</sup> In a May 24 Twitter post, Zhao uploaded a link to a document she had written called "June 4th Anniversary—A Conceptual Plan for Using Pseudo Base Station." <sup>114</sup> Pseudo base station technology allows users to broadcast information to mobile phones outside official communication networks. <sup>115</sup>

# Press Freedom

The government and Party continued to control the press in violation of international standards. In its 2014 World Press Freedom Index, Reporters Without Borders ranked China 175th out of 180 countries. It noted that "daily 'directives' to the traditional media from the Department of Propaganda, the constant online censorship, the growing number of arbitrary arrests and the detention of the largest number of journalists and netizens in the world . . . have made China a model of censorship and repression." International experts have identified as a major challenge to free expression media serving "as government mouthpieces instead of as independent bodies operating in the public interest." Is

#### POLITICAL CONTROL OF MEDIA THROUGH REGULATION

The State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film and Television (SAPPRFT), enhanced its system of strict controls and licensing requirements for media professionals. In order to report the news legally, domestic newspapers, magazines, Web sites, and journalists must obtain a license or accreditation from the government. 119 In 2014, SAPPRFT began requiring the country's 250,000 news reporters and staff to participate in a political training program as part of the annual press card renewal process. 120 The program reportedly would include a test with content related to "socialism with Chinese characteristics" and the "Marxist view on the press." 121 On June 18, 2014, SAPPRFT released a circular instructing media organizations to forbid journalists from publishing reports that are critical without receiving approval from their employers, from reporting on issues outside of their designated issue areas, and from publishing critical reports through their own personal Web sites or publications. 122

SAPPRFT also issued the Measures on the Management of Information Obtained by Press Personnel in the Conduct of Their Duties (the Measures), 123 which placed vague restrictions on the ability of journalists and other media professionals to release information obtained in the conduct of their work. 124 For example, the Measures prohibit media professionals from "violating the terms of confidentiality agreements"—which the Measures require media professionals to sign with their employers 125—"by providing information obtained in the conduct of their work to other domestic or foreign media or websites. . . ." 126 The Measures' definition of such information includes "various kinds of information and materials, and all journalistic products collected and processed, including state secrets, commercial secrets, and information that has not been publicly disclosed." 127 The Measures do not clarify what constitutes a state secret. 128 [For more information on the regulation of state secrets, see Censorship of Online Content in this section.]

## PUNISHMENT OF DOMESTIC JOURNALISTS

Outspoken journalists and newspaper staff continued to face reprisals for making sensitive comments or conducting investigative reporting. For example, on September 30, 2013, authorities approved the arrest of journalist Liu Hu on defamation charges <sup>129</sup> after he published information alleging official corruption. <sup>130</sup> According to the Washington Post, Wang Qinglei, a journalist with state-run China Central Television, was fired after calling China's media environment "stifling" online. <sup>131</sup> Tencent journalist Zhang Jialong reported that he was fired in May 2014 after discussing press freedom in a meeting with U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry and publishing an article in Foreign Policy in which he asked for U.S. assistance to "tear down . . . the Great Firewall" (i.e., China's national system of Internet surveillance and censorship). <sup>132</sup> According to a November 2013 South China Morning Post (SCMP) article, Caijing media group forced journalist Luo Changping to leave the magazine and move to Caijing's research institute after he exposed information implicating a high-level official in corruption. <sup>133</sup> In May 2014, public security officials in Bei-

jing reportedly detained Xin Jian, an employee of the Chongqing bureau of Japanese newspaper Nihon Keizai Shimbun, on suspicion of "picking quarrels and provoking trouble," after Xin reportedly helped journalists interview high-profile public interest lawyer Pu Zhiqiang. A November 2013 SCMP article quoted Luo Changping as saying, "The position real investigative journalism is in is not ideal. The environment is getting worse, the space is getting smaller . . . ." 135 Journalists in Hong Kong also reported continuing threats to press freedom, citing violent attacks on media professionals, self-censorship among journalists, and pressure from the Hong Kong and central governments and mainland Chinese businesses. 136 [For more information on press freedom in Hong Kong, see Section VI—Developments in Hong Kong and Macau.]

#### PUNISHMENT OF FOREIGN JOURNALISTS

International media organizations and U.S. Government officials expressed heightened concerns over the ability of foreign journalists to report independently in China. <sup>137</sup> In a May 2014 survey conducted by the Foreign Correspondents Club of China (FCCC), 99 percent of respondents "[did] not think reporting conditions in China [met] international standards," and zero respondents believed conditions had improved since the previous year. 138 Respondents to FCCC surveys also reported official harassment of reporters, news assistants, and sources; attempts to block coverage of issues authorities deemed "sensitive"; restrictions on travel to the Xinjiang Uighur Autonomous Region and Tibetan areas of China; cyber attacks and the blocking of foreign media Web sites in China; and visa delays and denials.<sup>139</sup> In December 2013, Chinese authorities delayed visa renewals for approximately two dozen journalists working for the New York Times (NYT) and Bloomberg. 140 Some reports linked the late renewals to prominent 2012 reports by the NYT and Bloomberg on the overseas assets of Chinese leaders' family members. 141 In a December 2013 statement, then NYT Executive Editor Jill Abramson acknowledged that Chinese officials "pointedly objected" to investigative reports by the NYT about China's leaders. 142 Chinese authorities reportedly also warned foreign reporters against reporting on the 25th anniversary of the 1989 Tiananmen protests. 143 The following cases highlight some of the ongoing challenges foreign journalists faced during the reporting year:

• On November 9, 2013, the NYT reported that the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) declined to grant journalist Paul Mooney a resident journalist visa to begin a new reporting job for Thomson Reuters. 144 The MFA reportedly did not provide a reason for their decision. 145

• On January 22, 2014, Time reported that Chinese authorities and "plainclothes thugs" harassed reporters with the Cable News Network, British Broadcasting Corporation, and Sky News as they attempted to cover the trial of rights advocate Xu Thiyong 146

• On January 30, 2014, NYT correspondent Austin Ramzy departed China after officials declined to issue him press creden-

tials. $^{147}$ 

• On February 9, 2014, the China Law & Policy blog reported that NYT correspondent Chris Buckley and NYT Beijing bureau head Philip Pan were still awaiting press credentials, which they had been waiting for since 2012.148

#### Notes to Section II-Freedom of Expression

<sup>1</sup>United Nations Treaty Collection, Chapter IV, Human Rights, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, last visited 23 June 14. China signed the convention on October 5,

1998.

2 See, e.g., State Council Information Office, "White Paper on Progress in China's Human Rights in 2012," reprinted in Xinhua, 14 May 13; Permanent Mission of the People's Republic of China to the UN, "Aide Memoire," reprinted in United Nations, 13 April 06; State Council, European Council, Prime Minister's Office of Sweden, and European Commission, "Joint Statement of the 12th China-EU Summit," reprinted in Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 30 November 09. Upon presenting its candidacy for the 2013 UN Human Rights Council elections, China reportedly promised to "further protect civil and political rights," although it did not specifically state intent to ratify the ICCPR. UN General Assembly, Note Verbale Dated 5 June 2013 from the Permanent Mission of China to the United Nations Addressed to the President of the General Assembly, A/68/90, 6 June 13.

3 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 19(3); UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Promotion and Protection of the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression, Frank La Rue, A/HRC/17/27, 16 May 11, para.

<sup>4</sup>UN GAOR, Hum. Rts. Coun., 12th Sess., Promotion and Protection of All Human Rights, Civil, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Including the Right to Development, adopted by Human Rights Council resolution 12/16, A/HRC/RES/12/16, 12 October 09, para.

adopted by Human Rights Council resolution 12/16, A/HRC/RES/12/16, 12 October 09, para. 5(p)(i).

<sup>5</sup>UN GAOR, Hum. Rts. Coun., 25th. Sess., Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: China (Including Hong Kong, China and Macao, China), A/HRC/25, 4 December 13, paras. 126, 129, 176, 178, 186.1, 186.21, 186.127, 186.136, 186.137, 186.138, 186.151, 186.152, 186.153, 186.154, 186.155, 186.156, 186.157, 186.159, 186.160, 186.230.

<sup>6</sup>UN GAOR, Hum. Rts. Coun., 25th. Sess., Agenda Item 6, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review: China, Addendum, A/HRC/25/5/Add.1, 27 February 14, 186.115, 186.137, 186.149, 186.156, 186.159, 186.170 (position of the Chinese government regarding recommendations).

<sup>7</sup>Ibid

Tibid.

\*\*The Commission has not observed an official or uniform definition of the term "Internet sovereignty," but Fang Binxing offers his own explanation of the term in Wang Yuan, "Internet Sovereignty: An Issue Difficult To Avoid" [Wangluo zhuquan: yi ge bu rong huibi de wentil, People's Daily, 23 June 14. Fang Binxing reportedly developed key components of China's national system of surveillance and censorship, commonly known as the Great Firewall. See, e.g., "Great Firewall Father Speaks Out," Global Times, 18 February 11.

\*\*Wang Yuan, "Internet Sovereignty: An Issue Difficult To Avoid" [Wangluo zhuquan: yi ge bu rong huibi de wentil, People's Daily, 23 June 14.

\*\*IOSee, e.g., Jonathan Kaiman, "China Granted Seat on UN's Human Rights Council," Guardian, 13 November 13.

\*\*IUN GAOR, Hum. Rts. Coun., 20th. Sess., Promotion and Protection of All Human Rights, Civil, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Including the Right to Development, Agenda Item 3, A/HRC/20/L.13, 29 June 12, para. 1; "Human Rights Council Backs Internet Freedom," Agence France-Presse, reprinted in Vanguard, 5 July 12.

\*\*I² Lu Wei, "Chinese Domain Set To Surf," China Daily, 7 July 10.

\*\*I³ China Internet Network Information Center, "The 34th Statistical Report on Internet Development in China" [Di 34 ci zhongguo hulian wangluo fazhan zhuangkuang tongji baogao], July 2014, 4.

\*\*I¹ Ibid.\*\*

<sup>14</sup> Ibid.

<sup>15</sup> Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, "Ministry of Industry and Information Technology Grants 4G Licenses" [Gongye he xinxihua bu fafang 4G paizhaol, 4 December 13; "China Mobile Expands 4G Network in Beijing," China Daily, 12 December 13; "China Issues 4G Licenses," Xinhua, reprinted in Economic and Commercial Counsellor's Office of the Mission of the People's Republic of China to the European Union, 3 December 13.

<sup>16</sup> "World's Lagrant 4G Notwork To Be Established Navt Year, Terminal 4G Sales Predicted

of the People's Republic of China to the European Chion, 3 December 13.

16 "World's Largest 4G Network To Be Established Next Year, Terminal 4G Sales Predicted To Exceed 100 Million Next Year" [Mingnian jiang jiancheng quanqiu zuida 4G wangluo, yuji mingnian 4G zhongduan xiaoshouliang chao 1 yi], Southern Daily, 19 December 13.

17 Shen Jingting, "China Mobile Set for 4G services in 340 cities," China Daily, 18 December

13.

18 State Council, "Report on the Work of the Government," reprinted in Xinhua, 5 March 14,

sec. 3(3).

19 Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Certain Major Issues Regarding Comprehensively Deepening Reforms [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian shenhua gaige ruogan zhongda wenti de jueding], reprinted in Xinhua, 15 November 13, sec. 13(50).

20 Ibid., sec. 10(36).

<sup>22</sup>See, e.g., Zhang Xiaoming, "Standardizing Interactions Between the Government and the People in the Management of Public Opinion" [Guifan wangluo yuqing guanli zhong de zhengmin hudong guanxi], Study Times, reprinted in Seeking Truth, 9 June 13; "Chinese Offi-

ciai Media Focuses on Internet Management; Internet Users Worry About Limits to Anticorruption" [Zhongguo guan mei jujiao wangguan wangmin danxin fanfu shou xian], BBC, 23 December 12; "Opinion: Strengthening of Internet Management Has Won Popular Support" [Sheping: jiaqiang hulianwang guanli shi derenxin de], Global Times, 21 December 12; "China Continues To Strengthen Internet Management: Internet Spring Difficult Name (Theory Continues To Strengthen Internet Management: Internet Spring Difficult Name (Theory Continues To Strengthen Internet Management: Internet Spring Difficult Name (Theory Continues To Strengthen Internet Management Internet Management Internet Spring Difficult Name (Theory Continues To Strengthen Internet Management Internet Managemen cial Media Focuses on Internet Management; Internet Users Worry About Limits

[Sheping: jiaqiang hulianwang guanli shi derenxin del, Global Times, 21 December 12; "China Continues To Strengthen Internet Management; Internet Spring Difficult Now" [Zhongguo chixu jiaqiang wangguan wangluo chuntian nan xian], BBC, 21 December 12.

23 "Xi Jinping Leads Internet Security Group," Xinhua, 27 February 14; "Student Recruitment Brochure for First 'Internet Public Opinion Management for Professionals' Seminar" [Shou qi "wangluo yuqing guanli shi" yanxiu ban zhaosheng jianzhang], Xinhua, 26 February 14; Zou Jixiang et al., "Chairman Xi's 'Eight Emphases' Specify Direction" [Xi zhuxi "ba ge qiangdiao" zhiming fangxiang], Seeking Truth, 17 January 14; Peng Zhubin, "Speed Up the Completion of the Internet Management Leadership System" [Jiakuai wanshan hulianwang guanli lingdao tizhi], reprinted in Hunan Provincial Bureau of Civil Affairs, 12 December 13; Communist Party Central Commission for Discipline Inspection and Ministry of Supervision, "Analysis of the Third Plenum 'Decision,' No. 5: How To Strengthen and Advance Restrictions and Supervision of the Exercise of Power by Leading Cadres" [Sanzhong quanhui "jueding" jiedu zhi wu: ruhe Third Plenum 'Decision,' No. 5: How To Strengthen and Advance Restrictions and Supervision of the Exercise of Power by Leading Cadres" [Sanzhong quanhui "jueding" jiedu zhi wu: ruhe jiaqiang he gaijin dui zhuyao lingdao ganbu xingshi quanli de zhiyue he jiandu], 4 December 13; Zeng Huafeng et al., "An Interpretation of Important Initiatives in the 'Decision' of the Third Plenum of the 18th Party Congress" [Dang de shiba jie san zhong quanhui "jueding" zhongyao jucuo shiyi], People's Liberation Army Daily, 22 November 13; Xi Jinping, "Explanation Regarding the 'Chinese Communist Party Central Committee Decision on Certain Major Issues Regarding Comprehensively Deepening Reforms'" [Guanyu "zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian shenhua gaige ruogan zhongda wenti de jueding" de shuoming], Xinhua, reprinted in Central People's Government, 15 November 13; Lan Zhengyan, "Military's Propaganda and Ideological Work Must Be at the Forefront' Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 October 13.

24 "Xi Jinping Leads Internet Security Group," Xinhua, 27 February 14. See also Paul Mozur, "China's Xi Presides Over Internet Security Committee—Update," Wall Street Journal, 27 February 14.

ruary 14.

25 Zou Jixiang et al., "Chairman Xi's 'Eight Emphases' Specify Direction" [Xi zhuxi "ba ge qiangdiao" zhiming fangxiang], Seeking Truth, 17 January 14; Lan Zhengyan, "Military's Propaganda and Ideological Work Must Be at the Forefront" [Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 October 13.

26 Ibid.

<sup>27</sup>Lan Zhengyan, "Military's Propaganda and Ideological Work Must Be at the Forefront" [Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 October 13; Sun Shougang, "Having a Responsibility To Defend the Country, Taking Responsibility To Defend the Country, and Defending the Country With Utmost Responsibility" [Shou tu youze, shou tu fuze, shou tu jinzel, China Association for Culture Construction, reprinted in State Council Information Office, 9 September 13.

<sup>28</sup>Lan Zhengyan, "Military's Propaganda and Ideological Work Must Be at the Forefront" [Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 Oc-

[Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 October 13.

29 Xu Jingyue and Hua Chunyu, "Xi Jinping: Ideological Work Is Extremely Important Work of the Party" [Xi jinping: yishixingtai gongzuo shi dang de yi xiang jiduan zhongyao de gongzuo], Xinhua, 20 August 13; Zou Jixiang et al., "Chairman Xi's 'Eight Emphases' Specify Direction" [Xi zhuxi 'ba ge qiangdiao' zhiming fangxiang], Seeking Truth, 17 January 14; Lan Zhengyan, "Military's Propaganda and Ideological Work Must Be at the Forefront" [Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 October 13; Sun Shougang, "Having a Responsibility To Defend the Country, Taking Responsibility To Defend the Country, and Defending the Country With Utmost Responsibility" [Shou tu youze, shou tu fuze, shou tu jinze], China Association for Culture Construction, reprinted in State Council Information Office, 9 September 13.

30 Zou Jixiang et al., "Chairman Xi's 'Eight Emphases' Specify Direction' [Xi zhuxi "ba ge

fuze, shou tu jinze], China Association for Culture Construction, reprinted in State Council Information Office, 9 September 13.

30 Zou Jixiang et al., "Chairman Xi's Eight Emphases' Specify Direction" [Xi zhuxi "ba ge qiangdiao" zhiming fangxiang], Seeking Truth, 17 January 14; Lan Zhengyan, "Military's Propaganda and Ideological Work Must Be at the Forefront" [Jundui xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo yao zou zai qianlie], People's Liberation Army Daily, 29 October 13; Sun Shougang, "Having a Responsibility To Defend the Country, Taking Responsibility To Defend the Country, and Defending the Country With Utmost Responsibility" [Shou tu youze, shou tu fuze, shou tu jinze], China Association for Culture Construction, reprinted in State Council Information Office, 9 September 13. For background information on Xi's August 2013 speech, see Qian Gang, "Parsing the 'Public Opinion Struggle,'" China Media Project, 24 September 13.

31 Malcolm Moore, "China Kills Off Discussion on Weibo After Internet Crackdown," Telegraph, 30 January 14; David Wertime, "Closing Time? China's Social Media Crackdown Has Hit Weibo Hard," Tea Leaf Nation, 30 January 14; Chris Buckley, "Crackdown on Bloggers Is Mounted by China," New York Times, 10 September 13; Zhong Xuefeng and Niu Muge, "Police Campaign Against Spread of 'Net Rumors' Intensifies," Caixin, 29 August 13; "Company Boss Arrested for Creating Online Rumors," Xinhua, 26 August 13.

32 See, e.g., Lessons From Tiananmen and Implications for the United States, Hearing of the U.S.-China Economic and Security Review Commission, 15 May 14, Written Testimony of David Wertime, Senior Editor, Foreign Policy; Josh Chin, "Out on Bail, Chinese Social Media Star Xue Manzi Returns to Weibo," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 19 April 14; Kevin Tang, "For Chinese Blogger Charles Xue Gets Bail After Illness," BBC, 17 April 14; Kevin Tang, "For Chinese Blogger Charles Xue Gets Bail After Illnes," Buzzfeed, 30 September 13; Phil Muncaster, "China's 'Big Vs' Disown Selves Online To A

<sup>33</sup> See, e.g., Tyler Roney, "China's Sudden WeChat Crackdown," Diplomat, 14 March 14; Malcolm Moore, "China Kills Off Discussion on Weibo After Internet Crackdown," Telegraph, 30 January 14; David Wertime, "Closing Time? China's Social Media Crackdown Has Hit Weibo Hard," Tea Leaf Nation, 30 January 14. See also CECC, 2013 Annual Report, 10 October 13,

Hard," Tea Leaf Nation, 30 January 14. See also CECC, 2013 Annual Report, 10 October 13, 61.

34 Patrick Boehler, "Outspoken Commentator Li Chengpeng Silenced on Chinese Social Media," South China Morning Post, 8 July 14; Tom Philips, "Li Chengpeng: Football Commentator to Voice of the People," Telegraph, 7 March 14; Shan Renping, "Shan Renping: @LiChengpeng Closed, Destined To Happen Sooner or Later" [Shan renping: @lichengpeng bei xiaohao, zaowan zhuding fasheng], Global Times, reprinted in Global Times Net, 8 July 14.

35 Paul Mozur, "Crossing Lines: Sina Punishes More Than 100,000 Weibo Accounts," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 13 November 13; Tyler Roney, "China's Sudden WeChat Crackdown," Diplomat, 14 March 14; Malcolm Moore, "China Kills Off Discussion on Weibo After Internet Crackdown," Telegraph, 30 January 14; David Wertime, "Closing Time? China's Social Media Crackdown Has Hit Weibo Hard," Tea Leaf Nation, 30 January 14.

36 Malcolm Moore, "China Kills Off Discussion on Weibo After Internet Crackdown," Telegraph, 30 January 14; Gerry Shih and Yimou Lee, "Analysis—Weibo Debut Highlights Complicated Dance With Chinese Censors," Reuters, 18 April 14.

37 Tyler Roney, "China's Sudden WeChat Crackdown," Diplomat, 14 March 14; David Wertime, "Exclusive: Surprising Crackdown on China's Hottest Social Media Platform," Foreign Policy, 13 March 14; China Digital Times, "Partial List of Deleted WeChat Accounts," 13 March 14; In Johnson, "An Online Shift in China Muffles an Open Forum," New York Times, 4 July 14.

14.

38 State Internet Information Office, Interim Provisions for the Management of the Development of Instant Messaging Tools in Providing Public Information Services [Jishi tongxin gongju gongzhong xinxi fuwu fazhan guanli zanxing guiding], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 7 August 14; China Economic Information Network, "State Internet Information Office Spokesperson Answers Reporters' Questions Regarding the 'Interim Provisions for the Management of the Development of Instant Messaging Tools in Providing Public Information Services'" [Wangxinban fayanren jiu "jishi tongxin gongju gongzhong xinxi fuwu fazhan guanli zanxing guiding" da jizhe wen], 8 Au-

State Internet Information Office, Interim Provisions for the Management of the Development of Instant Messaging Tools in Providing Public Information Services [Jishi tongxin gongzu gongzhong xinxi fuwu fazhan guanli zanxing guiding], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 7 August 14,

art. 7.

40 Shannon Tiezzi, "Maoming Protests Continue in Southern China," Diplomat, 5 April 14.

41 Jason Q. Ng, "How Chinese Internet Censorship Works, Sometimes," ChinaFile, 13 March
14; Patrick Boehler, "Beijing Paper's Investigative Report on Zhou Yongkang's Son Censored,"
South China Morning Post, 27 February 14; "Censors Crack Down on Li Dongsheng—Zhou
Yongkang Rumors," Want China Times, 26 December 13.

Yongkang Rumors," Want China Times, 26 December 13.

42 National "Sweep Away Pornography, Strike Down False Media" Working Group, State Internet Information Office, Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, and Ministry of Public Security, Announcement Regarding Launching the Special Operation To Strike Down Pornographic Information Online (Guanyu kaizhan daji wangshang yinhui seqing xinxi zhuanxiang xingdong gonggao], 13 April 14; "Making the Internet the Primary Battleground for 'Sweeping Away Pornography and Striking Down False Media'" [Ba hulianwang zuowei "saohuang dafei" de zhu zhanchang], People's Daily, 16 January 14; "Striking Down Pornographic Information Online, Creating a Clean, Bright, and Harmonious Cyberspace" [Daji wangshang yinhui seqing xinxi, yingzao qinglang hexie wangluo kongjian], Seeking Truth, 14 April 14.

48 See, e.g., Li Hui and Michael Martina "China Stone Un Durge of Online Durge Academy and Michael Martina" (China Stone Un Durge of Online Durge Academy Linkeller).

April 14.

<sup>43</sup> See, e.g., Li Hui and Michael Martina, "China Steps Up Purge of Online Porn Amid Wider Censorship Push," Reuters, 21 April 14; Paul Carsten and Michael Martina, "Sina Penalized for Porn as China Censorship Bodies Jockey for Power," Reuters, 25 April 14; Zhang Jialong, "China's New Internet Crackdown: Not About Porn," Foreign Policy, Tea Leaf Nation, translated by David Wertime, 16 April 14; Tyler Roney, "China's Latest Porn Purge Underway," Diplomat, 18 April 14; Fong Juk-kwan, "Sina Encounters Calamity in Sweeping Away Online Pornography, Young Netizens Joke About 'Experiencing the Cultural Revolution'" [Wangluo saohuang xinlang zao yang, nianqing wangmin xixue "jingli wen'ge"], InMediaHK, 26 April 14; Zhang Jialong, "Circumstances of My Dismissal From Tencent," reprinted in China Change, 24 May 14.

<sup>44</sup> "Sweep Away Pornography, Strike Down False Media" Working Group, "About Us" [Guanyu women], last visited 23 June 14.

<sup>45</sup> Zhang Hailin, "High-Grade' Central Leading Groups" ["Gaojingjian" de zhongyang lingdao xiaozu] People's Digest, Issue 11, 2013; "Biography" [Renwu jianli], Xinhua, last visited 23 June 14.

xiaozu] People's Digest, Issue 11, 2010; Diography Treemwayaran, 14.

46"National Office Against Pornographic and Illegal Publications Communication Regarding the Situation of Investigating and Dealing With Sina's Alleged Dissemination of Pornographic Information" [Quanguo saohuang dafei ban tongbao guanyu chachu xinlangwang shexian chuanbo yinhui seqing xinxi de qingkuang], Xinhua, 24 April 14.

47 See, e.g., Li Hui and Michael Martina, "China Steps Up Purge of Online Porn Amid Wider Censorship Push," Reuters, 21 April 14; Fong Juk-kwan, "Sina Encounters Calamity in Sweeping Away Online Pornography, Young Netizens Joke About 'Experiencing the Cultural Revolution'" [Wangluo saohuang xinlang zao yang, nianqing wangmin xixue "jingli wen'ge"], InMediaHK, 26 April 14; Adam Pasick, "Sina Weibo's IPO Will Have a Government Censorship Discount." Quartz, 17 March 14.

48 U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission, Form F-1 Registration Statement Under the Securities Act of 1933: Weibo Corporation, 14 March 14.

curities Act of 1933: Weibo Corporation, 14 March 14.

49 Jason Q. Ng, "64 Tiananmen-Related Words China Is Blocking Online Today," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time (blog), 4 June 14.

<sup>50</sup>Zoe Li, "Twenty-Five Years Later, Tiananmen Square No Less Taboo for China's Censors,"

CNN, 16 April 14.

51 Marbridge Consulting, "GAPPRFT To Regulate Internet TV Platform License Holders," 15 July 14; Zheng Peishan et al., "SAPPRFT Reorganizes the Box, Alibaba and LeTV Obstructed" [Guangdianzongju zhengdun hezi, ali leshi shouzu], Caixin, 16 July 14; Zheng Peishan et al., "Internet TV, Set-Top Box Makers Slapped With More Content Restrictions," Caixin, 17 July

 $^{52}$  Zheng Peishan et al., "Internet TV, Set-Top Box Makers Slapped With More Content Restrictions," Caixin, 17 July 14.  $^{53}$  Ibid.

<sup>54</sup>Tan Min et al., "[Exclusive] LeTV's Deep Regulatory Crisis (Update)" [[Dujia] leshi shenxian

jianguan weiji (gengxin)], Caixin, 17 July 14.

55 State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film and Television, "Operations and Management Requirements for Organizations With Internet Television Licenses" [Chiyou hulianwang dianshi paizhao jigou yunying guanli yaoqiul, reprinted in Ministry of Commerce, 28 October 11. This document, reprinted on the official Web site of the Ministry of Commerce, requires a password to view. The Commission has not observed a publicly available copy of the document.

requires a password to view. The Commission has not observed a publicly available copy of an document.

56 Dong Tongjian, "Gov't Order May Fray Television Set-Top Market," Global Times, 29 June 14; Zheng Peishan et al., "Internet TV, Set-Top Box Makers Slapped With More Content Restrictions," Caixin, 17 July 14.

57 Paul Mozur, "LinkedIn Said It Would Censor in China. Now That It Is, Some Users Are Unhappy," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 4 June 14.

58 See, e.g., Paul Mozur, "LinkedIn Said It Would Censor in China. Now That It Is, Some Users Are Ünhappy," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 4 June 14; Peter Cai and Fergus Ryan, "In the Shadow of Tiananmen, LinkedIn Succumbs to China's Censorship," Business Spectator. 4 June 14: Tania Branigan, "LinkedIn Under Fire for Censoring Tiananmen Business Spectator, 4 June 14; Tania Branigan, "LinkedIn Succumbs to China's Censorship," Business Spectator, 4 June 14; Tania Branigan, "LinkedIn Under Fire for Censoring Tiananmen Square Posts," Guardian, 4 June 14.

59 Peter Cai and Fergus Ryan, "In the Shadow of Tiananmen, LinkedIn Succumbs to China's Censorship," Business Spectator, 4 June 14.

Censorsinj, Business Spectator, 4 June 14.

60 Ibid.

61 GreatFire.org, "Google Disrupted Prior to Tiananmen Anniversary; Mirror Sites Enable Uncensored Access to Information," 2 June 14; Tania Branigan, "LinkedIn Under Fire for Censoring Tiananmen Square Posts," Guardian, 4 June 14.

62 Paul Mozur, "LinkedIn Said It Would Censor in China. Now That It Is, Some Users Are Unhappy," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 4 June 14.

63 GreatFire.org, "Google Disrupted Prior to Tiananmen Anniversary; Mirror Sites Enable Uncensored Access to Information," 2 June 14; "China Crackdown on Google Reflects Tiananmen Anniversary," Bloomberg News, 4 June 14; "China Disrupts Google Services Ahead of Tiananmen Anniversary," Reuters, 2 June 14; Kim Hjelmgaard, "Google's China Services Disrupted Before Anniversary," USA Today, 2 June 14.

64 GreatFire.org, "What Are You Trying To Accomplish?" last visited 23 June 14.

65 GreatFire.org, "Google Disrupted Prior to Tiananmen Anniversary, Mirror Sites Enable Uncensored Access to Information," 2 June 14.

66 China Crackdown on Google Reflects Tiananmen Anniversary," Bloomberg, 4 June 14;

67 China Disrupts Google Services Ahead of Tiananmen Anniversary," Reuters, 2 June 14;

68 State Council, Measures for the Administration of Internet Information Services [Hulianwang xinxi fuwu guanli banfa], issued and effective 25 September 00, art. 15(3).

<sup>69</sup> Ibid., art. 15(6). <sup>70</sup> Ibid., art. 15(5).

71 Ibid.

<sup>72</sup> State Council, Implementing Regulations for the PRC Law on the Protection of State Secrets [Zhonghua renmin gonghe guo baoshou guojia mimi fa shishi tiaoli], issued 17 January 14, effective 1 March 14., art. 32(8).

<sup>74</sup> For analyses of the Implementing Regulations, see Richard Silk, "China's Secret Anti-Secrecy Act," Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 3 February 14; Hogan Lovells, "New State Secrets Implementing Regulations: More of a Damp Fizzle Than a Bang?" March

2014.

75 State Council, Implementing Regulations for the PRC Law on the Protection of State Secrets [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo baoshou guojia mimi fa shishi tiaoli], issued 17 January 14, effective 1 March 14, art. 5.

<sup>77</sup>PRC Constitution, issued 4 December 82, amended 12 April 88, 29 March 93, 15 March 99,

77 PRC Constitution, issued 4 December 82, amended 12 April 88, 29 March 93, 15 March 99, 14 March 04, art. 35.
18 Malcolm Moore, "China's Human Rights Situation Worst in Decades," Telegraph, 2 March 14; Tom Phillips, "Chinese Activists Face Jail as Crackdown Continues," Telegraph, 7 April 14; Human Rights Watch, "China: Reverse Judgment in Show Trial of Xu Zhiyong," 26 January 14; "China Detains Two Rights Lawyers in Widening Crackdown on Activists," Reuters, 17 May 14.
79 Jonathan Kaiman, "China Detains Teenager Over Web Post Amid Social Media Crackdown," Guardian, 20 September 2013; Zhangjiachuan Public Security Bureau: "Regarding Yang X Suspected of Picking Quarrels and Provoking Trouble" [Zhangjiachuan gongan: guanyu yang mou shexian xunxin zishi yi an], freeweibo.com, 20 September 13. For Commission analysis, see "Gansu Teenager Detained Under New Rules on Online Rumors," CECC China Human Rights and Rule of Law Update, No. 2, 23 December 13.

80 Andrew Jacobs, "China's Crackdown Prompts Outrage Over Boy's Arrest," New York Times, 23 September 13; Oiwan Lam, "Chinese Teenager Accused of Spreading Rumors Online Arrested," Global Voices Online, 23 September 13. For Commission analysis, see "Gansu Teenager Detained Under New Rules on Online Rumors," CECC China Human Rights and Rule of Law Update, No. 2, 23 December 13.

81 "Detained Gansu Teen Tweeter Expelled From School After Release," Radio Free Asia, 24

September 13.

september 13.

§2 Rights Defense Network, "Police Again Take Hu Jia Into Custody for Questioning on Suspicion of 'Picking Quarrels and Provoking Trouble'" [Hu jia zai bei jingfang yi shexian "xunxin zishi" daizou zhuanhuan], 25 February 14; Verna Yu, "Activist Hu Jia Accepts He Faces Jail Again After Latest Police Questioning," South China Morning Post, 27 February 14.

\*\*Sa Verna Yu, "Activist Hu Jia Accepts He Faces Jail Again After Latest Police Questioning," South China Morning Post, 27 February 14; "Hu Jia's Soft Detention Ends, Returns to Tiananmen" [Jieshu ruanjin de hu jia, chonghui tiananmen], Deutsche Welle, 9 June 14.

\*\*4"Hu Jia's Soft Detention Ends, Returns to Tiananmen" [Jieshu ruanjin de hu jia chonghui tiananmen], Deutsche Welle, 9 June 14.

tananmen], Deutsche Welle, 9 June 14.

85 Rebecca Valli, "Prominent Chinese Activist Beaten in Beijing," Voice of America, 17 July

14. For more information on Hu Jia's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database
record 2004-05295.

86 Sui-Lee Wee, "Wife of China's Jailed Nobel Laureate Liu Hospitalized," Reuters, 19 February 14; Tania Branigan, "Nobel Winner's Wife Liu Xia Speaks Out From House Arrest
Through Her Poems," Guardian, 15 January 14. For more information on Liu Xia's case, see

Through Her Poems," Guardian, 15 January 14. For more information on Liu Xia's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2010-00629.

87 "Liu Xia Discharged, Condition Improves" [Liu xia chuyuan, bingqing haozhuan], Radio Free Asia, 27 February 14. For Commission analysis, see "Detained Liu Xia Hospitalized as Health Reportedly Worsens," Congressional-Executive Commission on China, 27 March 14.

88 Frontline Defenders, "China: Liu Xia, Wife of Liu Xiaobo, Appeals to Chinese Government Amid Worsening Health While Under House Arrest," 3 December 13; "Liu Xia Discharged, Condition Improves" [Liu xia chuyuan, bingqing haozhuan], Radio Free Asia, 27 February 14; UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, Opinion No. 16/2011 (China), A/HRC/WGAD/2011/16, 5 May 11, para. 7. For more information on Liu Xia's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2010-00629 Database record 2010-00629.

<sup>89</sup> Sui-Lee Wee, "Wife of China's Jailed Nobel Laureate Liu Hospitalized," Reuters, 19 Feb-

ruary 14.

90 "Liu Xia Discharged, Condition Improves" [Liu xia chuyuan, bingqing haozhuan], Radio

ruary 14.

90 "Liu Xia Discharged, Condition Improves" [Liu xia chuyuan, bingqing haozhuan], Radio Free Asia, 27 February 14.

91 Didi Kirsten Tatlow, "Two Prominent Women Under Detention Are Hospitalized," New York Times, Sinosphere (blog), 21 February 14.

92 UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention, Opinion No. 16/2011 (China), A/HRC/WGAD/2011/16, 5 May 11, para. 9.

93 Huang Qi, 64 Tianwang, "Three 64 Tianwang Journalists Criminally Detained in Beijing" [Liusi tianwang san jizhe beijing zao xingshi juliu], 10 March 14.

94 Committee to Protect Journalists, "Three Journalists Detained After Reporting on Tiananmen," 18 March 14; Huang Qi, 64 Tianwang, "Three 64 Tianwang Journalists Criminally Detained in Beijing" [Liusi tianwang san jizhe beijing zao xingshi juliu], 10 March 14. For more information on these cases, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database records 2014-00123 on Liu Xuehong, 2014-00125 on Xing Jian, and 2014-00104 on Wang Jing.

95 "Internet Rumormonger Gets 3-Year Jail Term," Xinhua, 17 April 14.

96 Supreme People's Court and Supreme People's Procuratorate, Interpretation on Several Questions Regarding Applicable Law When Handling the Use of Information Networks To Commit Defamation and Other Sueh Criminal Cases [Zuigao renmin fayuan, zuigao renmin jianchayuan guanyu banli liyong xinxi wangluo shishi feibang deng xingshi anjian shiyong falu ruogan wenti de jieshil, issued 2 September 13 and 5 September 13, effective 10 September 13, art. 2(1); PRC Criminal Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xingfa], passed 1 July 79, amended 14 March 97, effective 1 October 97, amended 25 December 99, 31 August 01, 29 December 01, 28 December 02, 28 February 05, 29 June 06, 28 February 09, 25 February 11, art. 246. See also Xu Xin, "Xu Xin: Exceeding the Law To Combat Rumors Is Much More Damaging Than the Rumors Themselves" [Xu xin: chaoyue falu daji yaoyan, weihai yuan shenyu yaoyan], Caijing, 10 September 13.

98 Malcolm Moore and Tom Phillips, "Tiananmen Victims' Families Feel the Heat." London

Caijing, 10 September 13.

97 "Internet Rumormonger Gets 3-Year Jail Term," Xinhua, 17 April 14.

98 Malcolm Moore and Tom Phillips, "Tiananmen Victims' Families Feel the Heat," London Daily Telegraph, reprinted in Leader-Post, 30 April 14; Human Rights in China, "China Escalates Persecution Before 25th Anniversary of June Fourth," 8 May 14.

99 Malcolm Moore and Tom Phillips, "Tiananmen Victims' Families Feel the Heat," London Daily Telegraph, reprinted in Leader-Post, 30 April 14.

100 Tyler Roney, "Arrests, Censorship and Propaganda: China's Tiananmen Anniversary Dance," Diplomat, 2 May 14.

101 Human Rights in China, "China Escalates Persecution Before 25th Anniversary of June Fourth," 8 May 14; "Tiananmen Mother Stopped From Memorializing During 25th Anniversary of June Fourth," Surveilled and Prohibited From Meeting With Journalists for 24 Hours" ["Liu si" 25 zhounian tiananmen muqin gongji bei zu, 24 xiaoshi shou jiankong jin jian jizhe], Radio Free Asia, 28 May 14.

Free Asia, 28 May 14.

102 Rights Defense Network, "Gu Yimin Tried and Sentenced in 'Inciting Subversion Case,' Lawyers Beaten and Injured" [Gu yimin "shandian an" kaiting xuanpan, daili lushi bei dashang], 24 March 14. For more information on Gu Yimin's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2013-00215.

103 Ibid.

104 "Netizen Forwards June Fourth Picture, Is Criminally Detained, QQ Groups Eagerly Disseminate Picture Depicting Model of Sacrifice and Bravery" [Wangmin zhuan liu si tupian bei xingju, QQ qun re chuan jidian bajiu yinglie tu], Radio Free Asia, 4 June 13; "Dissident Gu Yimin Arrested on Incitement Charge, Du Bin's Younger Sister Holds Up Sign in Protest Outside Detention Center" [Yiyi renshi gu yimin bei kou shandong zui daibu, du bin meimei kanshousuo wai jupai kangyi], Radio Free Asia, 17 June 13; Rights Defense Network, "Jiangsu Dissident Gu Yimin Arrested for 'Inciting Subversion Charge'" [Jiangsu yiyi renshi gu yimin bei yi "shexian shandong dianfu zui" daibu], 15 June 13.

105 Charlie Campbell, "Chinese Journalist Arrested Amid Crackdown for Tiananmen Anniver-

bei yi "shexian shandong dianfu zui" daibul, 15 June 13.

105 Charlie Campbell, "Chinese Journalist Arrested Amid Crackdown for Tiananmen Anniversary," Time, 8 May 14.

106 "Gao Yu Suspected of Illegally Supplying State Secrets Internationally, Criminally Detained" [Gao yu shexian wei jingwai feifa tigong guojia mimi zui bei xingshi juliul, Xinhua, 8 May 14.

107 Rights Defense Network, "Rights Defense Network' Statement Regarding Beijing Authorities' Oppression of People Who Attended 'June Fourth' Discussion Forum" ["Weiquanwang" jiu beijing dangju daya canjia "liu si" yantaohui renshi de shengming], 7 May 14; Malcolm Moore and Tom Phillips, "Tiananmen Victims' Families Feel the Heat," London Daily Telegraph, reprinted in Leader-Post, 30 April 14; Michael Forsythe and Chris Buckley, "Journalist Missing Ahead of Tiananmen Anniversary," New York Times, 29 April 14. For more information on Gao's background, see International Press Association, "Gao Yu, China," last visited 23 June 14.

108 China Free Press, "Chen Wei, Yu Shiwen Detained for Organizing Popular June Fourth Memorial Event" [Yin zuzhi minjian liu si gongji huodong chen wei, yu shiwen zao jubul, 29 May 14. For more information on the criminal detention and arrest of memorial participants, see "Retribution for Multiple People Who Attended 'June Fourth' Memorial, Authorities Establish Special Group To Investigate" [Canyu "liu si" gongji duo ren bei qiuhou suanzhang, dangju chengli zhuan'an zu diaochal, Radio Free Asia, 27 May 14; Rights Defense Network, "Retribution Against Multiple People Criminally Detained Several Months After June Fourth Memorial, Lawyer Prevented From Visiting" [Liu si gongji shu yue hou zao qiuhou suanzhang duo ren bei xingju, lushi huijian shouzul, 30 May 14.

108 Ibid, "June Fourth Stability Maintenance Measures Increase, Multiple People Detained" [Liu si weiwen cuoshi jiada, duo ren bei jul, Radio Free Asia, 29 May 14. For more information on those gases see the Commission? Political Priscary Detables and participants.

[Liu si weiwen cuoshi jiada, duo ren bei jul, Radio Free Asia, 29 May 14. For more information on these cases, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database records 2014-00192 on Yu Shiwen, 2014-00191 on Chen Wei, 2014-00194 on Shi Yu, 2014-00196 on Fang Yan, and 2014-00196.

00195 on Hou Shuai

110 "June Fourth Stability Maintenance Measures Increase, Multiple People Detained" [Liu si

110 "June Fourth Stability Maintenance Measures Increase, Multiple People Detained" [Liu si weiwen cuoshi jiada, duo ren bei jul, Radio Free Asia, 29 May 14; Rights Defense Network, "Retribution Against Multiple People Criminally Detained Several Months After June Fourth Memorial, Lawyer Prevented From Visiting" [Liu si gongji shu yue hou zao qiuhou suanzhang duo ren bei xingju, lushi huijian shouzul, 30 May 14. For more information on Chang Boyang's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00252.
111 Rights Defense Network, "Post-'80 Youth Zhang Kunle Criminally Detained for Posting June Fourth Essay Online" [80 hou qingnian zhang kunle yin zai wangshang juban liu si zhengwen bei xingjul, 2 June 14; "Guangdong Rights Defender Youth Zhang Kunle Calls for 'June Fourth' Essay Submissions Online, Criminally Detained" [Guangdong weiquan qingnian zhang kunle juban wangshang "liu si" zhengwen bei xingjul, Radio Free Asia, 2 June 14. For more information on Zhang Kunle's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00198.

more information on Zhang Kunle's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00198.

112 Rights Defense Network, "Post-'80 Youth Zhang Kunle Criminally Detained for Posting June Fourth Essay Online" [80 hou qingnian zhang kunle yin zai wangshang juban liu si zhengwen bei xingjul, 2 June 14.

113 China Change, "Young Chinese Twitter User Arrested for Proposing Method To Spread Truth About June Fourth Massacre," 9 June 14; "Woman Uses Foreign Web Site To Transmit Criminal Methods, Criminally Detained by Beijing Police" [Yi nuzi liyong jingwai wangzhan chuanshou fanzui fangfa bei beijing jingfang xingjul, China News Net, 9 June 14. For more information on Zhao Huaxu's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00904

114 For an image of the Twitter post, see China Change, "Young Chinese Twitter User Arrested for Proposing Method To Spread Truth About June 4th Massacre," 9 June 14.
 115 "Woman Uses Foreign Web Site To Transmit Criminal Methods, Criminally Detained by Beijing Police" [Yi nuzi liyong jingwai wangzhan chuanshou fanzui fangfa bei beijing jingfang xingju], China News Net, 9 June 14.
 116 Reporters Without Borders, "World Press Freedom Index 2014," February 2014, 31.
 117 Ibid 16

<sup>117</sup> Ibid., 16.

118 UN Human Rights Council, "Tenth Anniversary Joint Declaration: Ten Key Challenges to Freedom of Expression in the Next Decade," Addendum to Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Promotion and Protection of the Rights to Freedom of Opinion and Expression, A/HRC/14/

23/Add.2, 25 March 10, art. 1(a).

119 State Council Information Office and Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, Provisions on the Administration of Internet News Information Services [Hulianwang xinwen xinxi fuwu guanli guiding], issued and effective 25 September 05, arts. 11, 14; State Council, Regulations on the Administration of Publishing [Chuban guanli tiaoli], issued 25 December 01, effective 1 February 02, arts. 15, 36; General Administration of Press and Publication, Measures

ferfective I February O2, arts. 19, 36; General Administration of Press and Fublication, Measures for Administration of News Reporter Cards [Xinwen jizhe zheng guanli banfa], issued 24 August 09, effective 15 October 09, arts. 11, 12, 16.

120 State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film, and Television, Circular Regarding the Launch of Editorial Staff Job Training [Guanyu kaizhan xinwen caibian renyuan gangwei peixun de tongzhi], 29 September 13; Benjamin Carlson, "China Will Require Its 250,000 Journalists To Pass a 'Marxism Test,'" Global Post, 21 December 13.

121 State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film, and Television, Circular Regarding the Launch of Editorial Staff Job Training [Guanyu kaizhan xinwen caibian renyuan gangwei

peixun de tongzhi], 29 September 13, sec. 3.

122 State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film, and Television, Circular Regarding the Situation of the Investigation and Handling of Cases of News Organizations and Journalists, Including the "Henan Youth Daily," Breaking the Law [Guanyu "henan qingnian bao" deng xinwen danwei he jizhe weifa anjian chachu qingkuang de tongzhi], issued 16 June 14. See also Megha Rajagopalan, "China Bans Unauthorized Critical Coverage by Journalists," Reuters, 18

June 14.
123 State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film, and Television, Measures on the Management of Information Obtained by Press Personnel in the Conduct of Their Duties

[Xinwen congye renyuan zhiwu xingwei xinxi guanli banfa], issued 30 June 14.

Publish 'Unpublicized Information,' Time, 9 July 14; Kiki Zhao, "Chinese Journalists Warned Not To Work With Foreign Media," New York Times, Sinosphere (blog), 10 July 14.

125 State Administration of Press, Publication, Radio, Film, and Television, Measures on the Management of Information Obtained by Press Personnel in the Conduct of Their Duties

[Xinwen congye renyuan zhiwu xingwei xinxi guanli banfa], issued 30 June 14, art. 5.

126 Thid

<sup>127</sup> Ibid., art. 2.

128 Ibid.

129 "China Arrests Journalist Who Posted Claims of Graft Online," Bloomberg, 11 October 13. <sup>130</sup> Ibid.; Patrick Boehler, "Award-Winning Journalist Luo Changping on the State of Chinese Media," South China Morning Post, 8 November 13. For more information on Liu Hu's case, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2013-00315.

131 Simon Denyer, "Chinese Journalists Face Tighter Censorship, Marxist Retraining," Wash-

ington Post, 10 January 14.

132 Zhang Jialong, "Circumstances of My Dismissal From Tencent," reprinted in China Change, 24 May 14; Zhang Jialong, "Everything I Wish I'd Told John Kerry," Foreign Policy,

19 February 14.

133 Zhang Hong, "Hard-Hitting Caijing Editor Luo Changping Removed From Post: Sources," South China Morning Post, 28 November 13.

134 "China Detains Assistant at Japanese Newspaper in Latest Action Ahead of Tiananmen Anniversary," Associated Press, reprinted in Fox News, 28 May 14; Hannah Beech, "Weirdly,

Chinese Journalists Can No Longer Publish 'Unpublicized Information,'" Time, 9 July 14.

135 Patrick Boehler, "Award-Winning Journalist Luo Changping on the State of Chinese Media," South China Morning Post, 8 November 13.

136 See, e.g., Hong Kong Journalists Association, "First Hong Kong Press Freedom Index Announced," 23 April 14; Sarah Hoffman, PEN American Center, "Attacks and Censorship in Hong Kong," 25 March 14; International Federation of Journalists, "Back to a Maoist Future—Press Freedom in China 2013," January 2014, 38, 41–42, 45–46.

137 Malcolm Moore, "New York Times and Bloomberg Facing Expulsion From China," Telegraph, 5 December 13; Damian Grammaticas, "Will China Expel Foreign Journalists?" BBC, 10 December 13; "Beijing 'Tightens Controls' on Foreign Journalists," Radio Free Asia, 9 December

 $^{13}\mathrm{.}$   $^{138}\mathrm{Foreign}$  Correspondents Club of China, "FCCC Annual Working Conditions Report 2014," 30 May 14.

139 Thid

 $^{140}\,\mathrm{Mark}$  Landler and David E. Sanger, "China Pressures U.S. Journalists, Prompting Warn-

Nark Landier and David E. Sanger, China Fressures U.S. Journalists, Prompting Warning From Biden," New York Times, 4 December 13.

141 See, e.g., Mary Kay Magistad, "Is Beijing About To Pull the Plug on Two Major American News Operations in China?" Public Radio International, 12 December 13; Malcolm Moore, "New York Times and Bloomberg Facing Expulsion From China," Telegraph, 5 December 13; Damian Grammaticas, "Will China Expel Foreign Journalists?" BBC, 10 December 13.

142 China's Treatment of Foreign Journalists, Staff Roundtable of the Congressional-Executive Commission on China, 11 December 13. Written Statement of the New York Times Submitted

Commission on China, 11 December 13, Written Statement of the New York Times. Submitted by Jill Abramson, Executive Editor, New York Times, Presented by Edward Wong, Correspondent, New York Times.

<sup>143</sup>Rebecca Valli, "Tiananmen Crackdown Casts Long Shadow Over China's Press," Voice of America, 29 May 14; "Foreign Journalists in China Harassed Over Tiananmen Square Anniversary," Guardian, Greenslade Blog (blog), last visited 31 July 14.

144 Andrew Jacobs, "Reporter for Reuters Won't Receive China Visa," New York Times, 9 No-

<sup>146</sup>Emily Rauhala, "CNN, BBC Reporters Covering China Activist Trial Manhandled on Live TV," Time, 22 January 14.

147 William Wan, "China Forces New York Times Reporter To Leave Country," Washington

Post, 30 January 14.

<sup>148</sup> Elizabeth M. Lynch, "Another One Bites the Dust but Does Anyone Care? Congress Is Silent as NY Times Reporter Leaves Beijing," China Law & Policy (blog), 9 February 14. See also Adam Gabbatt, "China Forces New York Times Reporter Chris Buckley To Leave Country," Guardian, 31 December 12; "Visa Issue in China Forces Out Times Reporter," New York Times, 31 December 12.