



CONGRESSIONAL-EXECUTIVE COMMISSION ON CHINA

STAFF RESEARCH REPORT
JANUARY 2024

UPR Stakeholders' Submissions Flooded with PRC-Sympathetic Reports





CONGRESSIONAL-EXECUTIVE COMMISSION ON CHINA

About the Congressional-Executive Commission on China

The Congressional-Executive Commission on China was established by the U.S.-China Relations Act of 2000 (Public Law No. 106–286) as China prepared to enter the World Trade Organization. The Commission is mandated to monitor human rights and the development of the rule of law in China.

Learn more at www.cecc.gov.

Cover image was generated by Bing Image Creator

This research project relied in part on Seamless Horizons, a search and discovery platform for investigative data maintained by C4ADS, a nonprofit organization.

UPR STAKEHOLDERS' SUBMISSIONS FLOODED WITH PRC-SYMPATHETIC REPORTS

When the United Nations Human Rights Council designed the framework for the Universal Periodic Review in 2007, one of the principles that it laid out was that the review should “[b]e a cooperative mechanism based on objective and reliable information and on interactive dialogue”¹ Since the People’s Republic of China’s first review in 2009, it has reportedly used different tactics that tend to undermine this principle, including the deployment of non-governmental organizations to support its narrative and obscure human rights violations it had committed.² This report documents the extent of this effort at the most recent UPR in January 2024 and provides evidence that many of these organizations are in fact heavily politicized, and some are under the direct control of the Chinese Communist Party.

I. Background

The People’s Republic of China (PRC) defended its human rights record at the fourth cycle of the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) before the United Nations Human Rights Council on January 23, 2024. As is customary in the UPR process, the body receives in advance reports from stakeholders, including non-governmental organizations (NGOs), regarding the human rights situation in the country being reviewed. The Civil Society Unit of the United Nations Department of Global Communications explained that an NGO is “any non-profit, voluntary citizens’ group which is organized on a local, national or international level.”³ Some NGOs are organized around specific issues such as human rights and may maintain relationships with U.N. offices and agencies.⁴

According to a study, NGO reports submitted for the UPR can take different positions in relation to the government being reviewed, ranging from “systematically critical” to “sympathetic” and “laudatory.”⁵ The author of the study used the term “government-sympathetic NGOs” to denote NGOs that “only lightly critique and more often praise their home government”⁶ Assertions made by an NGO in the UPR report favoring a government do not necessarily indicate that it is organized by the government or that it does not conduct charitable or other legitimate non-profit activities.⁷ And some of these reports contain helpful analyses

or recommendations. Nevertheless, a high percentage of government-sympathetic reports can skew the picture of human rights conditions in the country being reviewed. The present report adopts this definition of “government-sympathetic” and rephrases it as “PRC-sympathetic” to clarify the China context, while acknowledging that “sympathetic” can be broadly interpreted and does not assume any particular relationship (or lack thereof) an NGO may have with the Chinese government or Communist Party.

II. Nearly Half of UPR Reports Embrace the PRC’s Narrative

For China’s UPR, 162 stakeholders’ reports were submitted.⁸ An examination by the staff of the Congressional-Executive Commission on China (Commission) found that 80 of these 162 stakeholders’ reports can be considered “PRC-sympathetic” because they have one or both of the following features: (a) omission of material facts concerning the PRC’s human rights violations identified in other NGO submissions, in the compilation of materials submitted by the office of the U.N. High Commissioner for Human Rights, or in member states’ questions; or (b) they mirror the assertions made in the PRC’s national report, which two China experts described as a “work of fiction” by propaganda authorities.⁹

As shown in the Appendix below, 41 of the 80 stakeholders’ reports were submitted by organizations based in mainland China, 23 in Hong Kong and Macau, and 16 in countries other than China: Cuba (5), Egypt (1), Iran (4), Russia (3), Venezuela (3), all of which are identified as “not free” according to Freedom House’s Freedom in the World Reports.¹⁰ With regard to the UPR review session, Reuters reported that “China has been lobbying non-Western countries to praise its human rights record” ahead of the UPR, sending diplomats notes with “specific speaking points to raise”¹¹

III. Organizational Charters Show a Lack of Independence

In addition to the contents of the reports, Commission staff also reviewed other markers indicating an organization's ties to the PRC government or the Chinese Communist Party. Of the 41 mainland China-based organizations, the charters of 27 are available online. Twenty-four of these 27 charters (about 88 percent) contain language requiring loyalty to the Party. Charters operating under this requirement and that have a known date of adoption are all dated after 2014, suggesting that domestic NGOs are increasingly required to formalize Party loyalty in recent years.

In one instance, a discrepancy between the Chinese charter and its English translation supports an inference of deliberate concealment of an organization's political stance. The United Nations Association of China is one of the 24 organizations whose charter requires Party loyalty, but the charter's English translation omits this requirement,¹² which suggests an intention to project an inaccurate image to the English-speaking audience.

Five other organizations¹³ have posted discrepant charters on their websites, but the evidence of intent to conceal is less conclusive because the dates on the Chinese and English versions do not match. Specifically, the Party loyalty requirement is stated in the newer Chinese charters, all of which postdate 2017, but it is absent in the English translation that is based on the older versions of the charters.¹⁴ Because the older Chinese charters are unavailable online, and therefore make comparison impossible, it cannot be determined whether the discrepancies indicate an intent to conceal or that the Party loyalty requirement is a recent addition. Regardless, either conclusion supports an inference of a lack of independence.

IV. Party Presence in State-Affiliated Non-Governmental Organizations

A lack of independence compromises the objectivity and reliability of reports submitted by PRC-sympathetic organizations. In the case of mainland China-based

organizations, Commission staff found evidence of the presence of a Party branch in 15 of the 41 organizations. This finding, however, does not preclude the existence of Party branches or other forms of political influence in the other organizations. Party branches ensure political conformity, and their presence is a strong indication that the organization is not independent.¹⁵ In particular, some organizations are de facto Party or government entities, including the following:

1. The charter of Amity Foundation (TAF) provides that the organization's operations are overseen by a provincial branch of the United Front Work Department, a Party department.¹⁶
2. The China Committee on Religion and Peace (CCRP) is an entity within the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference, which is part of the Party's united front system.¹⁷
3. The China Ethnic Minorities' Association for External Exchanges (JS6) is managed by the PRC National Ethnic Affairs Commission (a State Council department) and is directed by the Party's united front department.¹⁸
4. The charter of the China Institute of Labour Relations (CULR) provides that the institute be led by a Party committee.¹⁹

V. Need for Protecting the Integrity of the UPR Process

Organizations sympathetic to the PRC have a record of making submissions at U.N. reviews, which detracts from the proper examination of the PRC's human rights record.²⁰ For example, in the 2023 U.N. review of China's compliance with a core international human rights instrument—the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)—at least 23 stakeholders' submissions reportedly were made by government-organized non-governmental organizations (GONGO) or other entities with ties to the Chinese Communist Party or government.²¹ A rights researcher opined that “[d]eploying GONGOs is an obstructionist tactic the Chinese government increasingly uses when U.N.

committees assess China's performance in implementing the treaties it has ratified."²² Not only do GONGO-like inputs obscure important human rights issues at the UPR, they also lend legitimacy to the tactic whereby allies of member states with poor human rights records use these reports to defend each other at the review.²³

PRC-sympathetic NGOs additionally take up the limited speaking time available to NGOs during the Human Rights Council plenary session when the final outcome report is debated and adopted.²⁴ Organizations that have been granted consultative status by the United Nations Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) may make general comments at the plenary session.²⁵ In the case of China's UPR, 30 of the 80 PRC-sympathetic NGOs have special consultative status and two of them have general consultative status. Among the mainland China-based organizations with consultative status, at least 18 of them are not independent by reason of their charter or the presence of a Party branch, as shown in the Appendix below.

To reduce the deleterious effect of government-sympathetic organizations on the integrity of the process, any initial application for consultative status or application for reclassification—regardless of the country of origin—could be adjudicated with knowledge of the relative degree to which a country's political system allows civil society, including NGOs, to operate openly and independently. In China's case, the political reality is such that civil society groups are not at liberty to make objective and unbiased submissions even if they are given some limited space to conduct nonpolitical activities domestically. The presence of Communist Party branches in organizations is particularly relevant to an eligibility requirement for being accorded consultative status.

To be accorded consultative status, the applicant organization would have to, among other things, show that its members are able to "exercise effective control over its policies and actions through the exercise of voting rights or other appropriate democratic and transparent decision-making processes."²⁶ In addition,

any member of the organization who is designated by governmental authorities must not “interfere with the free expression of views of the organization.”²⁷ In China, neither of these requirements can be met when the Party demands full political loyalty as documented above. Considerations of a country’s political control over NGOs likewise can extend to the quadrennial applications for reclassification by an organization already in consultative status.²⁸ In addition, U.N. bodies can use information such as that contained in this report to ensure an accurate assessment of countries’ human rights practices and to raise public awareness regarding abuses of U.N. processes.

Appendix: Data Concerning PRC-Sympathetic Organizations

Explanation of notations used in the table below:

- “N/A” means that the charter of the organization cannot be located.
- “Unk.” stands for “unknown,” which means that the existence of a Party branch cannot be determined.
- “G” means general consultative status granted by the United Nations Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC).
- “S” means special consultative status granted by the ECOSOC.

	UN-assigned document code	Organization Name	Does charter require loyalty to Party?	Is there a Party branch?	Prominently promote Party policies on	ECOSOC consultative status	Other notes
Organizations based in Mainland China							
1	ACEF2005	All-China Environment Federation	Yes ²⁹	Yes ³⁰	Yes ³¹	S	
2	BCLARC	Beijing Children’s Legal Aid and Research Center	N/A	Unk.	No	S	
3	BDPF	Beijing NGO Association for International Exchanges	Yes ³²	Unk.	No	S	

4	CAFIU	Chinese Association for International Understanding	N/A	Unk.	No	S	
5	CANGO China	China Association for NGO Cooperation	N/A	Yes ³³	No	S	
6	CAPDTC	China Association for Preservation and Development of Tibetan Culture	No ³⁴	Unk.	No		
7	CAPVD	China Association of Persons with Visual Disabilities	Yes ³⁵	Unk.	Yes ³⁶		
8	CCA(China)	China Charity Alliance	Yes ³⁷	Yes ³⁸	Yes ³⁹	S	
9	CCRP	China Committee on Religion and Peace	Yes ⁴⁰	Unk.	No		This organization is part of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference.
10	CEAIE	China Education Association for International Exchange	Yes ⁴¹	Unk.	Yes ⁴²	S	
11	CFHRD	China Foundation for Human Rights Development	Yes ⁴³	Yes ⁴⁴	Yes ⁴⁵		
12	CHINAFPA	China Family Planning Association	N/A	Unk.	N/A	S	
13	CHRS-CASS	Centre for Human Rights Studies, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	N/A	Yes ⁴⁶	Yes ⁴⁷		
14	Chunhui Children	Chunhui Children's Foundation	Yes ⁴⁸	Yes ⁴⁹	Yes ⁵⁰		
15	CIDF	China Internet Development Foundation	Yes ⁵¹	Yes ⁵²	Yes ⁵³		
16	CNIE	China NGO Network for International Exchanges	Yes ⁵⁴	Unk.	No	G	
17	CPAPD	Chinese People's Association for Peace and Disarmament	Yes ⁵⁵	Unk.	No	S	
18	CQCESD	Chongqing Centre for Equal Social Development	N/A	Yes ⁵⁶	No	S	
19	CSEF	YouChange China Social Entrepreneur Foundation	Yes ⁵⁷	Yes ⁵⁸	No	S	
20	CSHRS	China Society for Human Rights Studies	Yes ⁵⁹	Unk.	Yes ⁶⁰	S	
21	CSRH	Center for the Study of Human Rights at Nankai University	N/A	Unk.	Yes ⁶¹		
22	CTRC	China Tibetology Research Center	N/A	Yes ⁶²	Yes ⁶³		
23	CWRS China	Chinese Women's Research Society	Yes ⁶⁴	Unk.	Yes		Chinese Women's Research Society is run by Women's

							Studies Institute of China (WSIC), which in turn is part of the state-sponsored All-China Women's Federation.
24	GreenovationHub	Beijing Greenovation Institute for Public Welfare Development	N/A	Unk.	No		
25	MUPAC	Minzu Unity and Progress Association of China	N/A	Unk.	No		
26	NSCF	New Sunshine Charity Foundation	Yes ⁶⁵	Yes ⁶⁶	Yes ⁶⁷	S	
27	TAF	Amity Foundation	Yes ⁶⁸	Yes ⁶⁹	No	S	The charter provides that the organization's operations be overseen by a provincial branch of the United Front Work Department, a Party department.
28	UNA-China	United Nations Association of China	Yes ⁷⁰	Unk.	No	G	
29	WEDC	World Eco-Design Conference	N/A	Unk.	No	S	
30	WFAS	World Federation of Acupuncture-Moxibustion Societies	No ⁷¹	Yes ⁷²	Yes ⁷³	S	
31	WFCMS	World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies	No ⁷⁴	Unk.	No	S	
32	Z.G.M	ZHONGGUANCUN Green Mine Industry Alliance	Yes ⁷⁵	Unk.	No	S	
33	JS6	China Ethnic Minorities' Association for External Exchanges	Yes ⁷⁶	Unk.	No	S	China Ethnic Minorities' Association for External Exchanges (CEMAEE) is listed as the author on the cover of Joint Submission 6. CEMAEE is managed by the PRC National Ethnic Affairs Commission, a government body. ⁷⁷
34	JS37	Shaanxi Patriotic Volunteer Association	Yes ⁷⁸	Unk.	Yes ⁷⁹	S	Joint Submission 37 was made by the Shaanxi Patriotic Volunteer Association.
35	CALC	China-ASEAN Legal Research Center	N/A	Unk.	No		
36	CEPF	China Environmental Protection Foundation	Yes ⁸⁰	Yes ⁸¹	No	S	
37	ChMA	Chinese Medical Association	Yes ⁸²	Yes ⁸³	Yes ⁸⁴		

38	CTS	Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University	N/A	Unk.	No		
39	CULR	China University of Labor Relations	Yes ⁸⁵	Unk.	No		Organization is led by a Party committee. ⁸⁶
40	CYDF	China Youth Development Foundation	Yes ⁸⁷	Unk.	Yes ⁸⁸		
41	NWUPL, FRI	Frontier Research Institute of Northwest University of Politics and Law	N/A	Unk.	N/A		
Organizations based in Hong Kong and Macau							
1	AAIL	Asian Academy of International Law					
2	ADY	Association of Democratic Youth					
3	C(M)TCEDP	China(Macao)Tibet's Cultural and Economic Development Promotion Association (China)					
4	HKAYC	Hong Kong Association of Young Commentators					
5	HKFLU	Women Affairs Committee of The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions					
6	HKIWA	The Hong Kong Island Women's Association					
7	MACAO YOUTH FEDERATION	MACAO YOUTH FEDERATION				S	
8	MSHRS	Macao Society for Human Rights Studies					
9	NTWYOCs	New Territories West Yau Oi Cooperation Society					
10	FNTY	Federation of New Territories Youth					
11	FOS	Federation of Outstanding Students					
12	halofund	Halo Fund Limited					Hong Kong Free Press reported that the report of Halo Fund Limited (halofund) was edited by the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau, a Hong Kong government department. ⁸⁹ The government reviewed the report but denied making

							substantive contribution to it.
13	HKFLU-LEC	Labour Education Committee of The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions					
14	KWOF	KOWLOON WOMEN'S ORGANISATIONS FEDERATION					
15	LawyersHK	Lawyers HK Limited					
16	New Line Youth Volunteer	New Line Youth Volunteer Service Groups					
17	The HKMLPA	Hong Kong and Mainland Legal Profession Association					
18	TPRC1959	Tai Po Rural Committee					
19	TPRYG2019	Tai Po Rural Youth Group					
20	YCCA	Youth Concentric Association Limited					
21	WGAM	Women's General Association of Macau					
22	YLAY	YLAY					
23	Youth Vision HK	Youth Vision HK					
Organizations based outside of China, e.g., Cuba, Russia, Iran							
1	ANEC Cuba	National Association of Economists and Accountants of Cuba					
2	EFCA	Egyptian Chinese Friendship Association					
3	FANJ	Fundación Antonio Núñez Jiménez de la Naturaleza y el Hombre				S	
4	FMC	Federación de Mujeres Cubanas					
5	Friends of L'Humanite	Foundation for Independent Journalism Support "Society of Friends of L'Humanite"					
6	FUNDALATIN	FUNDALATIN				S	
7	Fundavivienda	Fundación Venezolana por el Derecho a la Vivienda					

8	Género con Clase	Fundación Género con Clase					
9	IFWA	International Foundation Witnesses Ashoora				S	
10	IGCP	Information Group on Crimes against the Person					
11	IPWR	Institute for Protecting Women's Rights				S	
12	IREC	Iranian Elite Research Center				S	
13	ISDNGO	Institute of Sustainable Development				S	
14	Project Verum	Autonomous non-profit human rights organization "Project Verum"					
15	UNJC	Unión Nacional de Juristas de Cuba				S	
16	JS2	Asociación Cubana de las Naciones Unidas				S	

¹ Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1. Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council, adopted June 18, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1, para. 3, <https://perma.cc/GT4D-SYEN>.

² Sophie Richardson and Rana Siu Inboden, "Beijing Is Pouring Resources into Its UN Human Rights Review—All to Prevent Any Real Review from Taking Place," *ChinaFile*, January 22, 2024, <https://perma.cc/MPV4-E2P7>.

³ "About Us," webpage of the Civil Society Unit, Outreach Division, United Nations Department of Global Communications, United Nations, accessed January 23, 2024, <https://perma.cc/A65E-CG43>.

⁴ "About Us," webpage of the Civil Society Unit, Outreach Division, United Nations Department of Global Communications, United Nations, accessed January 23, 2024, <https://perma.cc/A65E-CG43>.

⁵ Laura Landolt, "Rival Transnational Advocacy Networks and Middle East Politics at the UN Human Rights Council" in *The Routledge Handbook on Human Rights and the Middle East and North Africa*, ed. Anthony Tirado Chase (New York: Routledge, 2010), 158.

⁶ Laura Landolt, "Rival Transnational Advocacy Networks and Middle East Politics at the UN Human Rights Council" in *The Routledge Handbook on Human Rights and the Middle East and North Africa*, ed. Anthony Tirado Chase (New York: Routledge, 2010), 158.

⁷ Laura Landolt, "Rival Transnational Advocacy Networks and Middle East Politics at the UN Human Rights Council" in *The Routledge Handbook on Human Rights and the Middle East and North Africa*, ed. Anthony Tirado Chase (New York: Routledge, 2010), 158. See, e.g., Tao Muqun, "全球最大圣经厂「爱德」30年印1.5亿本 立下社会企业新里程" [The world's largest Bible factory "Amity" has printed 150 million copies in 30 years, establishing a new milestone for social enterprises], *Christian Daily*, December 20, 2016, <https://perma.cc/7R9D-XXR9>; "让逆行者有力量, 华泰、爱德基金会联合赋能民间救援队" [Power to those who go against all odds, Huatai and Amity Foundation jointly empower civil rescue teams], *Xinhua*, July 13, 2022, <https://perma.cc/9GJR-23TY>.

⁸ Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders' Submissions on China, A/HRC/WG.6/45/CHN/3, November 20, 2023, <https://perma.cc/VJ9T-C8RF>.

⁹ Sophie Richardson and Rana Siu Inboden, "Beijing Is Pouring Resources into Its UN Human Rights Review—All to Prevent Any Real Review from Taking Place," *ChinaFile*, January 22, 2024, <https://perma.cc/MPV4-E2P7>.

¹⁰ Freedom House, *Freedom in the World 2023*, <https://perma.cc/6PEV-6849> (Cuba), <https://perma.cc/XA8J-EQRC> (Egypt), <https://perma.cc/76YE-97N3> (Iran), <https://perma.cc/DP5W-SKSD> (Russia), <https://perma.cc/JUC6-FE7S> (Venezuela).

¹¹ Emma Farge, “Exclusive: China Lobbies Countries to Praise Its Rights Record ahead of UN Review – Diplomats,” Reuters, January 22, 2024, <https://perma.cc/7PPG-YRGT>. See also Anouk Wear, “China’s Universal Periodic Review Tracks Its Influence at the UN,” *China Brief*, Jamestown Foundation, January 19, 2024, <https://perma.cc/5TSY-UJZM>.

¹² “中国联合国协会章程” [Charter of the United Nations Association of China], passed July 4, 2018, art. 2, <https://perma.cc/8AAF-HVQ9>; “Constitution of the United Nations Association of China,” passed July 4, 2018, art. 2, <https://perma.cc/R4GA-4YMP>.

¹³ These five organizations are 1) All-China Environment Federation, 2) China Committee on Religion and Peace, 3) China Education Association for International Exchange, 4) China Environmental Protection Foundation, and 5) Chinese People’s Association for Peace and Disarmament.

¹⁴ “中华环保联合会章程” [Charter of All-China Environment Federation], All-China Environment Federation, passed March 26, 2019, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/PUN5-TJZE>; “Rules of Procedure of All-China Environment Federation,” All-China Environment Federation, passed April 22, 2005, <https://perma.cc/K47H-WZJV>. “中国宗教界和平委员会章程” [Charter of China Committee on Religion and Peace], China Committee on Religion and Peace, passed July 3, 2019, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/9SEH-VTSN>; “Charter Introduction,” China Committee on Religion and Peace, passed 1994, amended 2009, <https://perma.cc/4PHF-4WHH>. “中国教育国际交流协会章程” [Charter of China Education Association for International Exchange], China Education Association for International Exchange, passed October 16, 2019, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/D8BA-3TJS>; “Charter,” China Education Association for International Exchange, November 30, 2014, <https://perma.cc/GYN9-TW8F>. “中华环境保护基金会章程” [Charter of the China Environmental Protection Foundation], December 11, 2020, art. 4, <https://perma.cc/KX9B-3E4N>; “Constitution,” China Environmental Protection Foundation, passed February 20, 2006, <https://perma.cc/KT2W-6YCK>. “中国联合国协会章程” [Charter of the United Nations Association of China], passed July 4, 2018, art. 2, <https://perma.cc/8AAF-HVQ9>; “Constitution of the United Nations Association of China,” passed July 4, 2018, art. 2, <https://perma.cc/R4GA-4YMP>.

¹⁵ Lu Zhiliang, “发挥党支部主体作用” [Giving effect to Party branches’ role], *People’s Daily*, September 8, 2017, <https://perma.cc/AP59-YCGC>.

¹⁶ “机构章程” [Organization charter], accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/EGT9-M4CZ>.

¹⁷ “中国人民政治协商会议” [Chinese People’s Political Consultative Conference], <https://perma.cc/7XR4-BR2P>.

¹⁸ “主管社团” [Managed social groups], webpage of the PRC National Ethnic Affairs Commission, accessed January 12, 2024, <https://perma.cc/7SGU-BSWD>.

¹⁹ “学校章程” [School Charter], China Institute of Labour Relations, accessed January 16, 2024, art.13, <https://perma.cc/ZK6G-R393>.

²⁰ Parth Sharma, “Going GONGO: How Chinese Civil Society Groups Influence the UN,” *Young Australians International Affairs*, September 27, 2023, <https://perma.cc/NZL5-5JSE>; Sui-Lee Wee and Stephanie Nebehay, “At U.N., China Uses Intimidation Tactics to Silence Its Critics,” *Reuters*, October 15, 2015, <https://perma.cc/7ZP7-KNRJ>.

²¹ William Nee, “How China Tries to Bamboozle the United Nations,” *Diplomat*, February 11, 2023, <https://perma.cc/45KE-ANXQ>.

²² William Nee, “How China Tries to Bamboozle the United Nations,” *Diplomat*, February 11, 2023, <https://perma.cc/45KE-ANXQ>. See also, Anouk Wear, “Hong Kong Finds Its Voice at the UN—And Uses It to Cheerlead for Beijing,” *ChinaFile*, December 20, 2023, <https://perma.cc/K9EG-MD9C>. The Hong Kong government in recent years adopted a similar approach.

²³ “Basic Facts about the UPR,” webpage of the Human Rights Council, United Nations, accessed January 24, 2024, <https://perma.cc/JJP3-ZYPC>; Fiona McGaughey, “From Gatekeepers to GONGOs,” *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights* 36 (2): 125–26; Laura Landolt, “Rival Transnational Advocacy Networks and Middle East Politics at the UN Human Rights Council” in *The Routledge Handbook on Human Rights and the Middle East and North Africa*, ed. Anthony Tirado Chase (New York: Routledge, 2010), 158; General Assembly, Resolution adopted by the General Assembly, A/RES/60/251, April 3, 2006, para. 5(e), <https://perma.cc/3ZV5-WBGT>.

²⁴ Laura Landolt, “Rival Transnational Advocacy Networks and Middle East Politics at the UN Human Rights Council” in *The Routledge Handbook on Human Rights and the Middle East and North Africa*, ed. Anthony Tirado Chase (New York: Routledge, 2010), 158; Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1. Institution-building of the United

Nations Human Rights Council, adopted June 18, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1, para. 31, <https://perma.cc/GT4D-SYEN>; Human Rights Council, Statement by the President, A/HRC/PRST/OS/16/1, December 9, 2022, para. 4, <https://perma.cc/62TH-FEQH>; United Nations Economic and Social Council, Consultative Relationship between the United Nations and Non-Governmental Organizations, Resolution 1996/31, para. 35, <https://perma.cc/8JQ9-X9LG>.

²⁵ Department of Economic and Social Affairs, United Nations, “How to apply for consultative status with ECOSOC?,” accessed January 24, 2024, <https://perma.cc/GT7A-XGHC>; Human Rights Council, Resolution 5/1. Institution-building of the United Nations Human Rights Council, adopted June 18, 2007, A/HRC/RES/5/1, para. 31, <https://perma.cc/GT4D-SYEN>; United Nations Economic and Social Council, Consultative Relationship between the United Nations and Non-Governmental Organizations, Resolution 1996/31, para. 35, <https://perma.cc/8JQ9-X9LG>.

²⁶ United Nations Economic and Social Council, Consultative Relationship between the United Nations and Non-Governmental Organizations, Resolution 1996/31, para. 12, <https://perma.cc/8JQ9-X9LG>.

²⁷ United Nations Economic and Social Council, Consultative Relationship between the United Nations and Non-Governmental Organizations, Resolution 1996/31, para. 12, <https://perma.cc/8JQ9-X9LG>.

²⁸ United Nations Economic and Social Council, Consultative Relationship between the United Nations and Non-Governmental Organizations, Resolution 1996/31, para. 61, <https://perma.cc/8JQ9-X9LG>.

²⁹ “中华环保联合会章程” [Charter of All-China Environment Federation], All-China Environment Federation, passed March 26, 2019, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/PUN5-TJZE>.

³⁰ “联合会党支部举行“不忘初心、牢记使命”主题教育第二次学习研讨” [Party branch of Federation hosts the second seminar with the theme of “remaining true to our original aspiration and keeping our mission firmly in mind”], All-China Environment Federation, October 30, 2019, <https://perma.cc/3GJN-FY8N>.

³¹ “党建群团” [Party building groups], All-China Environment Federation, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/8UTL-J56Q>.

³² “协会章程” [Organization charter], Beijing NGO Network for International Exchanges, passed November 26, 2017, <https://perma.cc/T8N8-RMN7>.

³³ China Association for NGO Cooperation, “2022 Annual Report,” accessed January 16, 2024, 17, <https://perma.cc/L83Y-E325>.

³⁴ “中国西藏文化保护与发展协会章程” [Charter of China Association for Preservation & Development of Tibetan Culture], China Association for Preservation & Development of Tibetan Culture, January 14, 2019, <https://perma.cc/7TRP-F4X6>.

³⁵ “盲协章程” [Charter of Visual Disabilities Association], China Association of Persons with Visual Disabilities, passed September 19, 2023, <https://perma.cc/T38W-YSV6>.

³⁶ “中国盲人协会简介” [Introduction of Chian Association of Persons with Visual Disabilities], Chian Association of Persons with Visual Disabilities, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/M4X3-7LSC>.

³⁷ “中国慈善联合会章程” [Charter of China Charity Alliance], China Charity Alliance, passed May 11, 2019, art. 5, <https://perma.cc/4HUQ-NTQD>.

³⁸ “中国慈善联合会党支部制度手册” [China Charity Federation Party Branch System Manual], China Charity Federation, May 23, 2023, <https://perma.cc/MA3L-68XU>.

³⁹ “党建活动” [Party building activities], China Charity Alliance, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/9H7P-EYU9>.

⁴⁰ “中国宗教界和平委员会章程” [Charter of China Committee on Religion and Peace], China Committee on Religion and Peace, passed July 3, 2019, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/9SEH-VTSN>.

⁴¹ “中国教育国际交流协会章程” [Charter of China Education Association for International Exchange], China Education Association for International Exchange, passed October 16, 2019, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/D8BA-3TJS>.

⁴² “时政要闻” [Current political news], China Education Association for International Exchange, access January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/B9TS-7GXF>.

⁴³ “中国人权发展基金会章程” [Charter of China Foundation for Human Rights Development], China Foundation for Human Rights Development, passed November 18, 2020, <https://perma.cc/X2LX-ZM5N>.

⁴⁴ “党支部加强和改进思想政治工作实施办法” [Implementation measures for strengthening and improving work concerning political thought by Party branch], China Foundation for Human Rights Development, July 5, 2021, <https://perma.cc/D9QW-NJWN>.

⁴⁵ Webpage of China Foundation for Human Rights Development, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/FFF6-QDL3>.

-
- ⁴⁶ “中国社会科学院党组传达学习党的二十大精神” [Party branch of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences delivers the spirit of studying the Party’s 20th National Congress], October 25, 2022, <https://perma.cc/2AHX-PVR5>.
- ⁴⁷ “Homepage of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences,” accessed January 21, 2024, <https://perma.cc/RS76-BTC3>.
- ⁴⁸ “北京春晖博爱基金会章程” [Charter of Chunhui Children’s Foundation], passed September 19, 2021, <https://perma.cc/YN52-6SUN>.
- ⁴⁹ “春晖党支部书记参加 第二联合党委高质量开展党史学习教育专题组织生活会” [Chunhui Party Branch Secretary participated in the Second Joint Party Committee’s high-quality organizational life meeting on party history study and education], Chunhui Children’s Foundation, September 3, 2021, <https://perma.cc/F8D2-Q9JD>.
- ⁵⁰ “党建专栏” [Party building column], webpage of Chunhui Children’s Foundation, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/37HA-TM6X>.
- ⁵¹ “中国互联网发展基金会章程” [China Internet Development Foundation], China Internet Development Foundation, passed July 19, 2021, <https://perma.cc/A7LB-FDVH>.
- ⁵² “中国互联网发展基金会党支部召开专题民主生活会” [Party branch of China Internet Development Foundation held a special democratic life meeting], November 14, 2023, <https://perma.cc/L9RQ-HBHG>.
- ⁵³ “Homepage of China Internet Development Foundation,” accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/TK7D-BHPY>.
- ⁵⁴ “中国民间组织国际交流促进会章程” [Charter of China NGO Network for International Exchanges], passed July 5, 2017, <https://perma.cc/Q9AV-C3CZ>.
- ⁵⁵ “中国人民争取与裁军协会章程” [Charter of Chinese People’s Association for Peace and Disarmament], amended August 2020, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/4ZD4-RNM8>.
- ⁵⁶ “机构人员” [Organization staff], accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/P93Y-R9N6>.
- ⁵⁷ “友成企业家乡村发展基金会章程” [Charter of YouChange China Social Entrepreneur Foundation], passed July 6, 2022, art. 4, <https://perma.cc/8ZRE-FU9B>.
- ⁵⁸ “关于我们” [About Us], accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/349H-HK6U>.
- ⁵⁹ “中国人权研究会章程” [Charter of China Society for Human Rights Studies], China Society for Human Rights Studies, passed July 19, 2022, <https://perma.cc/44WP-J8TC>.
- ⁶⁰ “Website of China Society for Human Rights Studies,” accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/X26L-2P7X>.
- ⁶¹ “Departments & Institutes,” website of Zhou Enlai School of Government, accessed January 22, 2024, <https://perma.cc/VW79-ZUZG>; “School Leaders,” webpage of Zhou Enlai School of Government, accessed January 22, 2024, <https://perma.cc/EL9F-FHQ7>.
- ⁶² “【学习二十大】办公室党支部紧扣三个环节确保学习贯彻党的二十大精神走深走实” [[Studying the 20th National Congress] Office’s party branch closely follows three links to ensure that the study and implementation of the spirit of the 20th National Congress of the Communist Party of China is in-depth and practical], China Tibetology Research Center, March 16, 2023, <https://perma.cc/EN26-KFYZ>.
- ⁶³ “中国藏学研究中心简介” [Introduction to the China Tibetology Research Center], September 26, 2021, <https://perma.cc/XP5G-DLUA>.
- ⁶⁴ “中华全国妇女联合会章程” [Charter of the Chinese Women’s Research Society], passed October 26, 2023, <https://perma.cc/5T6D-KFW6>.
- ⁶⁵ “北京新阳光慈善基金会章程” [Charter of New Sunshine Charity Foundation], passed September 19, 2020, <https://perma.cc/WT4D-QR42>.
- ⁶⁶ “新阳光党支部认真学习党的二十大精神” [New Sunshine’s Party Branch earnestly studies the spirit of the Party’s 20th National Congress], October 17, 2022, <https://perma.cc/3LL3-UN8L>.
- ⁶⁷ “党建专栏” [Party building column], webpage of New Sunshine Charity Foundation, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/PUW8-3DNL>.
- ⁶⁸ “机构章程” [Charter of Amity Foundation], passed April 18, 2018, arts. 3, 5, <https://perma.cc/EGT9-M4CZ>.
- ⁶⁹ “爱德基金会 2020 年度报告” [2020 annual report of Amity Foundation], accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/9J8R-J8QW>.
- ⁷⁰ “中国联合国协会章程” [Charter of the United Nations Association of China], passed July 4, 2018, art. 2 <https://perma.cc/8AAF-HVQ9>.
- ⁷¹ “世界针灸学会联合会章程” [Charter of World Federation of Acupuncture-Moxibustion Societies], passed November 22, 1987, amended December 2, 2017, art. 2, <https://perma.cc/T7UN-ZGKU>.

-
- ⁷² “践行党史学习教育，我为群众办实事——2021年”爱心梨园”扶贫助残党建活动在房山区温馨家园举行” [Practice Party history study and education, do practical things for the masses—the 2021 “Love Pear Garden” Party-building event for poverty alleviation and helping the disabled was held in the warm home in Fangshan District], April 30, 2021, <https://perma.cc/33JZ-YQYS>.
- ⁷³ Chen Zhepu, “【主题教育】世界针灸学会联合会、中国针灸学会”感党恩、听党话、跟党走”大型惠民义诊服务活动走进磴口县中蒙医院” [[Themed education] The World Federation of Acupuncture-Moxibustion Societies and China Association of Acupuncture and Moxibustion jointly host a large-scale people-benefiting event in China-Mongolia Hospital with the theme of “gratitude to the Party, listen to the Party, and follow the Party], January 5, 2024, <https://perma.cc/VD9D-HFBR>.
- ⁷⁴ “世界中医药学会联合会章程” [Charter of World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies], passed October 21, 2017, <https://perma.cc/MN6A-UECC>.
- ⁷⁵ “中关村绿色矿山产业联盟章程” [Charter of ZHONGGUANCUN Green Mine Industry Alliance], passed January 19, 2019, <https://perma.cc/8GE4-QBY3>.
- ⁷⁶ “中国少数民族对外交流协会章程” [Charter of China Ethnic Minorities’ Association For External Exchanges], passed November 14, 2019, <https://perma.cc/P2NC-X77W>.
- ⁷⁷ “简介” [Brief introduction], webpage of the PRC national Ethnic Affairs Commission, accessed January 22, 2024, <https://perma.cc/TA9L-JL7E>.
- ⁷⁸ “陕西省爱国主义志愿者协会章程（2021版）” [Charter of Shaanxi Patriotic Volunteer Association (2021 version)], passed July 12, 2015, amended December 23, 2020, arts. 2–4, 22(1), <https://perma.cc/T9R2-AQ7V>.
- ⁷⁹ “中央倡导” [Advocacy for the Central [government/Party]], webpage of Shaanxi Patriotic Volunteer Association, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/54ET-3K4J>.
- ⁸⁰ “中华环境保护基金会章程” [Charter of the China Environmental Protection Foundation], December 11, 2020, art. 4, <https://perma.cc/KX9B-3E4N>.
- ⁸¹ “党建引领发展 科技守护自然 基金会党支部赴华为展厅参观学习” [Party building leads to technology development and environment protection; foundation’s Party branch goes to Huawei exhibition hall to visit and study], China Environmental Protection Foundation, November 17, 2023, <https://perma.cc/LZ9W-EZ63>.
- ⁸² “中华医学会章程” [Charter of the Chinese Medical Association], passed May 18, 2021, art. 3, <https://perma.cc/48XG-EFC2>.
- ⁸³ “党委（党群）办公室” [Office of Party committee (Party and mass organization)], September 4, 2017, <https://perma.cc/4SEG-QVCX>.
- ⁸⁴ “党建工作” [Party building work], webpage of the Chinese Medical Association, accessed January 23, 2024, <https://perma.cc/4VYU-N6ZK>.
- ⁸⁵ “学校章程” [School Charter], China Institute of Labour Relations, accessed January 16, 2024, arts. 5, 6, 12(1), 13, <https://perma.cc/ZK6G-R393>.
- ⁸⁶ “学校章程” [School Charter], China Institute of Labour Relations, accessed January 16, 2024, art.13, <https://perma.cc/ZK6G-R393>.
- ⁸⁷ “中国青少年发展基金会章程” [Charter of China Youth Development Foundation], passed December 21, 2020, arts 3, 4, <https://www.cydf.org.cn/#/about/orgBrief?type=2>.
- ⁸⁸ “党建工作” [Party building work], webpage of China Youth Development Foundation, accessed January 16, 2024, <https://perma.cc/C4UZ-GTKT>.
- ⁸⁹ Hillary Leung, “Hong Kong Gov’t Dep’t Found to Have Made Changes to NGO’s Submission to UN Rights Body,” *Hong Kong Free Press*, February 9, 2023, <https://perma.cc/33FM-365H>.