SPECIAL TOPIC: FORCED EVICTIONS IN BEIJING MUNICIPALITY 1

Authorities Carry Out Mass Evictions Following Deadly Fire

In November 2017, authorities in Beijing municipality responded to a fire in a migrant neighborhood with a campaign of forced evictions. On November 18, 2017, a fire broke out in an apartment building in Xinjian No. 2 village, Xihongmen township, Daxing district, Beijing, killing 19 people. 2 Of the 19 victims, 17 were migrants, meaning they were registered in localities outside of Beijing under the Chinese government's household registration (hukou) system.<sup>3</sup> On November 20, the Beijing government officially launched a 40-day campaign of "major inspections, major sweeps, and major rectifications," <sup>4</sup> which resulted in large-scale forced evictions and demolitions in migrant neighborhoods across Beijing.5 Videos posted online showed blocks of demolished buildings as well as police kicking in doors, smashing store windows, and destroying evictees' belongings.6 Affected residents reported being forced to leave their homes within three days,7 with some given a few hours' notice or less.8 Authorities reportedly cut water and electricity to force residents out of their homes,9 actions in contravention of the PRC Administrative Enforcement Law, which requires authorities carrying out evictions to provide time for residents to apply for legal redress, and forbids authorities from cutting access to utilities. 10 Although the Commission did not observe official reports on the number of people evicted during the campaign, international media estimated that the evictions affected tens of thousands, most of whom were migrants from outside Beijing. 11 In addition, according to government statistics, there were 132,000 fewer migrants in Beijing at the end of 2017 compared to 2016. 12

Reports of migrant evictions continued to emerge from Beijing and other localities after November 2017. Radio Free Asia (RFA) reported another deadly fire in the Chaoyang district of Beijing on December 13, which was followed by additional forced evictions. In late December, officials in Yanjiao township, Sanhe city, Langfang municipality, Hebei province, which neighbors Beijing, evicted residents from several apartment buildings housing migrants, with police reportedly injuring some residents in the process. In January 1, 2018, RFA reported that authorities in Beijing and Hebei continued to conduct forced evictions. In January 24, Beijing municipal officials announced plans to demolish an additional 40 square kilometers of "illegal structures" in 2018. In the summer of 2018, Beijing authorities reportedly closed or demolished garment factories and wholesale markets where many migrants worked.

## Migrants, Locals, and the Public Respond

Some migrants and locals attempted to confront local officials over the evictions.  $^{18}$  In one protest in Feijia village in Chaoyang district, a large group gathered outside a government office chanting: "Violent evictions violate human rights."  $^{19}$  In addition, RFA reported that over 100 Beijing hukou-holding residents of Xinjian village blocked a road to protest the eviction campaign, which they asserted had left them homeless. $^{20}$ 

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs),<sup>21</sup> companies,<sup>22</sup> and individuals <sup>23</sup> offered assistance to displaced migrants. For example, one report posted to social media described a local group of cycling enthusiasts who, after helping one of their evicted members move, posted a message on social media offering to help others.<sup>24</sup> One group member described being inundated with phone calls, both from evictees requesting help and individuals offering assistance.<sup>25</sup> He noted that he also received calls from across China thanking

him for helping evicted migrants.<sup>26</sup>

Internet users engaged in online debates and criticized the eviction campaign on Chinese social media. According to Chinese and international media, internet users widely shared images and videos of the migrant worker evictions on Chinese social media.<sup>27</sup> Internet users reportedly criticized the evictions and the harsh tactics government officials employed,<sup>28</sup> and social media users shared personal stories as well as social and legal analyses.<sup>29</sup> Internet users also criticized as derogatory the use of the term "low-end population" (diduan renkou) in local government documents to describe the migrants.<sup>30</sup> Groups of scholars, lawyers, and others organized and circulated online several open letters criticizing the evictions.<sup>31</sup>

### Party and Government Response Features Censorship and Repression

On November 27, 2017, Beijing Communist Party Secretary Cai Qi convened a meeting of district-level committee secretaries to discuss public safety concerns in Beijing, stating that local governments should "pay attention to means and methods" while carrying out the eviction campaign and avoid "simplification" and "impatience." <sup>32</sup> On December 12, Cai met with a group of service workers, noting that many migrants worked in service industries and

had made contributions to Beijing's development.<sup>33</sup>

Beyond its public statements, the government also responded by restricting domestic reporting on the evictions and censoring online discussion.<sup>34</sup> China Digital Times published a leaked censorship directive instructing Web portals and news media not to repost articles or independently report on the evictions.<sup>35</sup> The microblog site Weibo blocked searches for "low-end population," and the social media platform WeChat deleted posts using the term.<sup>36</sup> Authorities also censored open letters <sup>37</sup> and other articles posted online discussing the evictions,<sup>38</sup> as well as some of the messages civil society groups posted offering assistance to evicted migrants.<sup>39</sup>

Authorities detained an artist for sharing videos of the evictions and also detained six others, reportedly for helping the artist flee. The Beijing-based artist Hua Yong filmed demolished neighborhoods,<sup>40</sup> his interviews with evictees,<sup>41</sup> and local Beijing *hukou*holders' disputes with local officials,<sup>42</sup> posting the footage to social media.<sup>43</sup> After local officials attempted to stop Hua from filming a meeting, residents helped Hua flee the area.<sup>44</sup> On or around December 10, authorities detained at least six residents who had helped Hua leave,<sup>45</sup> and on December 15, authorities detained Hua in Tianjin municipality.<sup>46</sup> Authorities reportedly released all seven on bail <sup>47</sup> and forced Hua to leave Beijing and return to his hometown in another province.<sup>48</sup> Authorities reportedly detained Hua again in July 2018 in connection with the arbitrary detention of a

woman who protested against President and Party General Secretary Xi Jinping.<sup>49</sup>

Context: The Hukou System and Urbanization Policies

The *hukou* system, established in 1958,<sup>50</sup> classified Chinese citizens as being urban or rural and effectively tied them to a locality.<sup>51</sup> According to the National Bureau of Statistics of China, in 2017, 291 million people in China did not live in their *hukou* location.<sup>52</sup> Yet the provision of certain government services, such as education, remains tied to one's *hukou* location, which is, in general, inherited from one's parents.<sup>53</sup> In 2014, the government began to reform the hukou system to gradually eliminate the urban-rural distinction and allow some migrants to obtain *hukou* in smaller cities.<sup>54</sup> Chinese sociologist Sun Liping <sup>55</sup> has noted, however, that due to uneven development across different regions in China, "resources and opportunities are mainly concentrated in a few large cities." <sup>56</sup>

The Chinese government continues to use the *hukou* system to restrict internal migration,<sup>57</sup> and obtaining *hukou* in large cities such as Beijing remains difficult.<sup>58</sup> In April 2018, the Beijing municipal government issued rules governing applications for Beijing *hukou* that awards points to applicants based on criteria such as education level and home ownership.<sup>59</sup> In order to apply, residents must have contributed to social insurance in Beijing for seven consecutive years.<sup>60</sup> Thus, migrants working in industries that often fail to provide social insurance in accordance with the PRC Social Insurance Law,<sup>61</sup> like construction <sup>62</sup> and courier services,<sup>63</sup> will be ineligible to apply for a Beijing *hukou*.<sup>64</sup> [For more information on social insurance, see Section II—Worker Rights.]

Some observers viewed the eviction campaign that began in November 2017 as part of the Beijing government's long-term plan to limit the population of Beijing.<sup>65</sup> In September 2017, central authorities approved Beijing municipal authorities' Beijing General City Plan (2016–2035),<sup>66</sup> which sets a cap for Beijing's population at 23 million by 2020.<sup>67</sup> Chinese media noted that the fire seemed to have accelerated existing demolition plans.<sup>68</sup> In the months leading up to the fire, Beijing authorities had reportedly demolished schools for migrant children <sup>69</sup> and markets and shops where many migrants worked.<sup>70</sup> Although the Beijing government issued a draft opinion in May 2018 calling for the expansion of dormitories for migrant workers, the draft opinion specifies that the addition of these rental units must conform to the general city plan.<sup>71</sup>

Beijing is not the only large city in China to set population limits, despite reports of worker shortages in major cities in some sectors. For example, in December 2017, central authorities approved a plan from Shanghai municipality to cap that city's population at approximately 25 million by 2035. In January 2018, officials at a State Council Standing Committee meeting discussed encouraging migrant workers to return to the countryside to start businesses as part of the government's development strategy for rural areas. According to government statistics, the populations of both Beijing and Shanghai declined in 2017, swith one expert attributing the decline in part to efforts in both cities to evict migrants.

### Special Topic: Forced Evictions in Beijing Municipality

4

Chinese authorities have a history of carrying out forced evictions in the name of urban development. International rights organizations documented widespread forced evictions prior to the 2008 Beijing Olympics and Expo 2010 in Shanghai municipality. In 2014, the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights urged China "to ensure that any relocation necessary for city renewal is carried out after prior consultation with the affected individuals . . .."  $^{79}$ 

# International Human Rights Standards and Domestic Law

Actions taken by Chinese government officials enforcing the eviction campaign in Beijing contravene both international standards  $^{80}$  and Chinese law.  $^{81}$  In addition, the reported censorship and restrictions on the press and civil society during the eviction campaign violate international human rights standards guaranteeing freedom of expression  $^{82}$  and association.  $^{83}$  Restrictions on movement and discrimination arising from the hukou system contravene international human rights standards guaranteeing freedom of residence.  $^{84}$ 

#### Notes to Section II—Special Topic: Forced Evictions in Beijing Municipality

<sup>1</sup>For more in-depth analysis of this topic, see "Campaign of Forced Evictions in Beijing Contravenes International Human Rights Standards," Congressional-Executive Commission on

China, 14 March 18.

2 "List of Victims of Fire in Daxing, Beijing, Made Public, Police Criminally Detain 18" [Beijing daxing huozai yu'nanzhe mingdan gongbu jingfang xingju 18 renl, People's Daily, 20 November 17; "Citywide Launch of Major Inspections, Major Sweeps, and Major Rectifications of Safety Risks" [Quanshi kaizhan anquan yinhuan da paicha da qingli da zhengzhi], Beijing News, 20 November 17; Jiang Chenglong and Cui Jia, "Beijing Continues Its Safety Crackdown in Wake of Fire," China Daily, 27 November 17; Zheping Huang, "What You Need To Know About Beijing's Crackdown on Its 'Low-End Population,'" Quartz, 27 November 17; Benjamin Haas, "China: 'Ruthless' Campaign To Evict Beijing's Migrant Workers Condemned," Guardian, 26 November 17. 26 November 17.

<sup>3</sup> "List of Victims of Fire in Daxing, Beijing Announced, Police Criminally Detain 18" [Beijing

26 November 17.

3 "List of Victims of Fire in Daxing, Beijing Announced, Police Criminally Detain 18" [Beijing daxing huozai yunanzhe mingdan gongbu jingfang xingju 18 ren], People's Daily, 20 November 17; Benjamin Haas, "China: Ruthless' Campaign To Evict Beijing's Migrant Workers Condemned," Guardian, 26 November 17. For more information on migrant workers and China's hukou system, see, e.g., China Labour Bulletin, "Migrant Workers and Their Children," last visited 20 June 18; Mary Gallagher, Authoritarian Legality in China: Law, Workers, and the State (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017), 2-4, 7-8, 12-13; Cara Wallis, "Hukou Reform and China's Migrant Workers," University of Nottingham, Asia Research Institute, Asia Dialogue, 10 October 16.

4 Beijing Administration of Work Safety Committee Circular on Launch of Special Campaign of Major Investigations, Major Cleanup, and Major Rectification of Safety Risks [Beijing shi anquan shengchan weiyuanhui guanyu kaizhan anquan yinhuan da paicha da qingli da zhengzhi zhuanxiang xingdong de tongzhi], issued 19 November 17, sec. 4.

5 See, e.g., "Thousands of Migrant Workers in Beijing Forcibly Evicted, Resistance Mounted in at Least One Location." China Change, 29 November 17; Matt Rivers and Serenitie Wang, "Beijing Forces Migrant Workers From Their Homes in 'Savage' Demolitions," CNN, 9 December 17; China Digital Times, "Sensitive Word of the Week: Low-End Population," 30 November 17.

6 See, e.g., Boxun Watch, "'Chinese Exclusion' Inside China, Beijing Violently Drives Out Low-End Population'" [Jingnei "pai hua" beijing baoli qugan "diduan renkou"] [Video file], YouTube, 24 November 17; Boxun Watch, "'Chinese Exclusion' Inside China, Beijing Violently Evicts 'Low-End Population' (2)" [Jingnei "pai hua" beijing baoli qugan "diduan renkou" (2)] [Video file], YouTube, 26 November 17; RFA Chinese, "Beijing idduan renkou: women ye shi zhongguo ren, weishenme yao zheme duidai women?] [Video file], YouTube, 28 November 17. See also videos posted to Beijing-based

zhongguo ren, weishenme yao zheme duidai women?] [Video file], YouTube, 28 November 17. See also videos posted to Beijing-based artist Hua Yong's YouTube account on November 29 and 30, 2017, e.g., Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire (14)" [Da huo zhihou (14)] [Video file], YouTube, 29 November 17.

7 Wang Shan, "Investigation—Outsiders After the Major Fire: Where Should We Go?" [Diaocha—da huo zhihou de yixiang ren: women gai dao nali qu?], Sanlian Life Week, 27 November 17; Huang Ziyi and Li Rongde, "Thousands Evicted in Beijing Crackdown After Fatal Fire," Caixin, 24 November 17; Matt Rivers and Serenitie Wang, "Beijing Forces Migrant Workers From Their Homes in 'Savage' Demolitions," CNN, 9 December 17.

8 Emily Wang and Yi-Ling Liu, "Beijing Evictions of Migrant Workers Stir Widespread Anger," Associated Press, 29 November 17; Jun Mai, "They Came Banging and Kicking': Beijing Airport Workers Swept Up in Fire Safety Crackdown," South China Morning Post, 29 November 17; Benjamin Haas, "China: 'Ruthless' Campaign To Evict Beijing's Migrant Workers Condemned," Guardian, 26 November 17.

Guardian, 26 November 17.

<sup>9</sup> Huang Ziyi and Li Rongde, "Thousands Evicted in Beijing Crackdown After Fatal Fire," Caixin, 24 November 17; Li Rongde and Yuan Suwen, "In Rare Move, State Media Publishes Veiled Disapproval of Beijing's Fire Safety Campaign," Caixin, 27 November 17; Haowai Zhi Wai (wangixclub), "In Dreams I Did Not Know I Was a Visitor—Swan Rescue Team and People in the Cold Night" [Meng li bu zhi shen shi ke—tian'e jiuyuan dui yu han ye li de ren], WeChat nost 28 November 17

post, 28 November 17.

10 PRC Administrative Enforcement Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xingzheng qiangzhi fa], passed 30 June 11, effective 1 January 12, arts. 43–44.

11 "Ripples From Major Beijing Fire, 100 Thousand Migrants Expelled From the City" [Beijing The Property of the City of the C 11 "Kipples From Major Beijing Fire, 100 Thousand Migrants Expelled From the City" [Beijing da huo yubo dangyang quanshi 10 wan waidi ren bei zhul, Radio Free Asia, 23 November 17; Chris Buckley, "Why Parts of Beijing Look Like a Devastated War Zone," New York Times, 30 November 17; Lucy Hornby and Archie Zhang, "Beijing's Migrant Expulsion Prompts Civic Outcry," Financial Times, 28 November 17; "Thousands of Migrant Workers in Beijing Forcibly Evicted, Resistance Mounted in at Least One Location," China Change, 29 November 17. See also China Labour Bulletin, "Migrant Worker Families Face Eviction After 19 Die in Beijing Fire" 23 November 17

also China Labour Bulletin, Angrain Worker Fainnes Face 2. The Fire," 23 November 17.

12 Beijing Municipal Bureau of Statistics and Survey Office of the National Bureau of Statistics in Beijing, "Beijing Municipality 2016 Citizen Economic and Social Development Statistical Bulletin" [Beijing shi 2016 nian guomin jingji he shehui fazhan tongji gongbaol, 25 February 17, sec. 1; Beijing Municipal Bureau of Statistics and Survey Office of the National Bureau of Statistics in Beijing, "Beijing Municipality 2017 Citizen Economic and Social Development Statistical Bulletin" [Beijing shi 2017 nian guomin jingji he shehui fazhan tongji gongbaol, 27 February 18 sec. 1

ruary 18, sec. 1.

13 "After Fire in Beijing's Shibalidian Township, More Violent Evictions of the Low-End Population,' Citizens Jointly Sign Letter Urging Cai Qi To Resign" [Beijing shibalidian xiang huozai hou "diduan renkou" zai zao baoli quzhu gongmin lianshu duncu cai qi cizhi], Radio Free Asia, 14 December 17.

<sup>14</sup> Shen Fan and Li Rongde, "Beijing's Migrant Eviction Frenzy Spills Over to Hebei," Caixin, 27 December 17; "Beijing 'Low-End' Campaign Spreads, Outsiders Violently Driven Out of Sanhe, Hebei" [Beijing "diduan renkou" xingdong manyan hebei sanhe baoli qugan wailai renkoul, Radio Free Asia, 30 December 17.

15 "Chinese Artist Who Filmed Beijing's Mass Evictions Now Faces Eviction Himself," Radio

renkou], Radio Free Asia, 30 December 17.

15 "Chinese Artist Who Filmed Beijing's Mass Evictions Now Faces Eviction Himself," Radio Free Asia, 1 January 18.

16 Wu Mengda and Ji Xiaobo, "Beijing: Plans To Demolish 40 Square Kilometers of Illegal Structures, Return 1600 Hectares to Natural Space in 2018" [Beijing: 2018 nian jihua chai wei 4000 wan pingfang mi huan lu 1600 gongqing], Xinhua, 24 January 18; "Beijing To Demolish Thousands of Illegal Structures," BBC, 24 January 18.

17 "Beijing Residents Fight Back Over Renewed Forced Evictions, Demolitions," Radio Free Asia, 19 July 18; Liu Caiyu, "Wholesale Markets in Beijing Close, Vendors Leave in 'Non-Capital Industry' Reshuffle," Global Times, 6 August 18.

18 Chris Buckley, "Why Parts of Beijing Look Like a Devastated War Zone," New York Times, 30 November 17; Austin Ramzy, "Artist Flees Beijing After Filming Devastation of Mass Evictions," New York Times, 12 December 17; "Hunted After Reporting on Daxing, Beijing, Fire, Artist Hua Yong Escapes Beijing" [Baodao beijing daxing huozai zao soubu yishujia hua yong taoli beijing], Radio Free Asia, 9 December 17.

19 Eva Dou, "Rare Protests in Beijing Condemn Forced Evictions," Wall Street Journal, 10 December 17; Tom Phillips, "Hundreds Take Part in Rare Protest in Beijing Over Migrant Crackdown," Guardian, 10 December 17.

20 "Hunted After Reporting on Daxing, Beijing, Fire, Artist Hua Yong Escapes Beijing" [Baodao beijing daxing huozai zao soubu yishujia hua yong taoli beijing], Radio Free Asia, 9 December 17. For more information on the economic relationship between local hukou holders and migrant workers in China's cities, see commentary by David Bandurski in "The Beijing Mingrants" [Zhongguo zhishifenzi lianming yaoqiu beijing tingzhi qugan wailai renkoul, Voice of America, 28 November 17; Hai Yan, "Civil Society in Beijing Spontaneously Offer Assistance to 'Low-End Population,' Officials Not Pleased" [Minjian zifa jiuzhu beijing "diduan renkou" guan bu yue], Voice of America, 28 November 17: Beijing Sponta

Beijing Winter Sparks Public Outrage but Little Official Remorse," Washington Post, 27 November 17.

22 Hai Yan, "Civil Society in Beijing Spontaneously Offer Assistance to 'Low-End Population,' Officials Not Pleased" [Minjian zifa jiuzhu beijing "diduan renkou" guan bu yue], Voice of America, 27 November 17; Zheping Huang, "What You Need To Know About Beijing's Crackdown on Its 'Low-End Population,' 'Quartz, 27 November 17.

23 Haowai Zhi Wai (wangixclub), "In Dreams I Did Not Know I Was a Visitor—Swan Rescue Team and People in the Cold Night" [Meng li bu zhi shen shi ke—tian'e jiuyuan dui yu han ye li de ren], WeChat post, 28 November 17; Ye Bing, "Chinese Intellectuals Jointly Demand Beijing End Evictions of Migrants" [Zhongguo zhishifenzi lianming yaoqiu beijing tingzhi qugan wailai renkou], Voice of America, 28 November 17.

24 Haowai Zhi Wai (wangixclub), "In Dreams I Did Not Know I Was a Visitor—Swan Rescue Team and People in the Cold Night" [Meng li bu zhi shen shi ke—tian'e jiuyuan dui yu han ye li de ren], WeChat post, 28 November 17.

25 Ibid.

26 Ibid.

27 Freedom House, "China Media Bulletin: Holiday Crackdown, Beijing Netizen Outcries,

<sup>26</sup> Ibid.

<sup>27</sup> Freedom House, "China Media Bulletin: Holiday Crackdown, Beijing Netizen Outcries, Skype App Removal (Issue No. 124)," 9 December 17; Li Rongde and Yuan Suwen, "In Rare Move, State Media Publishes Veiled Disapproval of Beijing's Fire Safety Campaign," Caixin, 27 November 17; Lucy Hornby and Archie Zhang, "Beijing's Migrant Expulsion Prompts Civic Outcry," Financial Times, 28 November 17; Ye Bing, "Chinese Intellectuals Jointly Demand Beijing End Evictions of Migrants" [Zhongguo zhishifenzi lianming yaoqiu beijing tingzhi qugan wailai renkoul, Voice of America, 28 November 17. Although the government has deleted many of the original social media posts, videos of the evictions can still be found on websites outside China. See, e.g., Boxun Watch, "'Chinese Exclusion' Inside China, Beijing Violently Evicts 'Low-End Population'" [Jingnei "pai hua" beijing baoli qugan "diduan renkou"] [Video file], YouTube, 24 November 17; Boxun Watch, "'Chinese Exclusion' Inside China, Beijing Violently Evicts 'Low-End Population' (2)" [Jingnei "pai hua" beijing baoli qugan "diduan renkou" (2)] [Video file], YouTube, 26 November 17; RFA Chinese, "Beijing's 'Low-End Population': "We Are Also Chinese, Why Do They Treat Us Like This?'" [Beijing "diduan renkou": "women ye shi zhongguoren, weishenme yao zheme duidai women?"] [Video file], YouTube, 28 November 17. See also videos posted to Beijing-based artist Hua Yong's Twitter account (@Huayong798) on November 29 and 30, 2017.

30, 2017.

28 "Safety Remediation After Major Fire in Daxing, Beijing, State Media Denies Using the Opportunity To Clean Out 'Low-End Population'" [Beijing daxing da huo hou anquan zhengzhi guan mei fouren jie ji qingli "diduan renkou"], BBC, 24 November 17; Freedom House, "China Media Bulletin: Holiday Crackdown, Beijing Netizen Outcries, Skype App Removal (Issue No. 124)," 9 December 17; "The Class Allegiance of China's De Facto Voters," Chublic Opinion (blog),

124)," 9 December 17; "The Class Allegiance of China's De Facto Voters, Chunhe Opinion (1966), 10 January 18.

29 See, e.g., Haowai Zhi Wai (wangjxclub), "In Dreams I Did Not Know I Was a Visitor—Swan Rescue Team and People in the Cold Night" [Meng li bu zhi shen shi ke—tian'e jiuyuan dui yu han ye li de renl, WeChat post, 28 November 17; Sun Liping (Sun liping shehui guancha), "Sun Liping: It Was a Tragedy, but Not a Reason for Clearing the Population" [Sun liping: na jian shi shi beiju, dan bing bushi qingli renkou de liyoul, WeChat post, 21 November 17; Wang Liuyi, "Analyzing the Legality of Beijing's 'Winter Cleanup Campaign'" [Beijing shi "dongji qingli xingdong" de hefaxing fenxil, WeChat post, reprinted in China Digital Times, 28 November 17. For additional analyses of online discussion of the mass evictions, see "The Class Alle-

giance of China's De Facto Voters," Chublic Opinion (blog), 10 January 18; China Digital Times, "Sensitive Word of the Week: Low-End Population," 30 November 17; Oiwan Lam, "After Authorities Evict Beijing's 'Low-End' Residents, Chinese Ask: Where Is the Humanity?" Global Voices, 29 November 17.

30 "The Class Allegiance of China's De Facto Voters," Chublic Opinion (blog), 10 January 18; Freedom House, "China Media Bulletin: Holiday Crackdown, Beijing Netizen Outcries, Skype App Removal (Issue No. 124)," 9 December 17. See also "The Making of the Low-End Population," Vision of the Control China Media Decided Control China Media Decided China lation," University of Hong Kong, Journalism & Media Studies Centre, China Media Project,

30 November 17.

31 "Letter From Intellectuals to Central Committee of the Communist Party, NPC, State Counsister From Intellectuals to Central Committee of the Control Propulation of cil, and NPPCC on Recent Large Scale Evictions of the 'Outsider Population' in Beijing" [Zhishijie renshi jiu jinri beijing da guimo qugan "wailai renkou" shijian zhi zhonggong zhongyang, quanguo renda, guowuyuan, quanguo zhengxie xinl, reprinted in Rights Defense Network, 25 November 17; "[Show] Understanding, Kindness, Tolerance, and Care for Them! An Appeal for Immediately Ending Violent Evictions of 'Low-End Groups,' Immediately Opening An Appeal for Immediately Ending Violent Evictions of 'Low-End Groups,' Immediately Opening Relief Centers' [Lijie, shandai, kuanrong, guan'ai tamen!—guanyu liji tingzhi cubao qugan "diduan renqun", liji kaifang jiuzhu zhongxin de huyu], reprinted in Rights Defense Network, 25 November 17; "Letter Urging Beijing Communist Party Secretary Mr. Cai Qi To Resign' [Duncu beijing shiwei shuji cai qi xiansheng cizhi shu], 13 December 17, reprinted in China Banned Book News, 15 December 17. See also Ye Bing, "Chinese Intellectuals Jointly Demand Beijing End Evictions of Migrants" [Zhongguo zhishifenzi lianming yaoqiu beijing tingzhi qugan wailai renkou], Voice of America, 28 November 17; "After Fire in Beijing's Shibalidian Township, More Violent Evictions of the 'Low-End Population,' Citizens Jointly Sign Letter Urging Cai Qi To Resign" [Beijing shibalidian xiang huozai hou "diduan renkou" zai zao baoli quzhu gongmin lianshu duncu cai qi cizhi], Radio Free Asia, 14 December 17; "Full Text of Request From Jiang Ping, He Weifang, and Other Scholars and Lawyers to the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress for a Review of the Constitutionality of the Beijing Government's Campaign To Expel Nonresidents and Relevant Administrative Documents' [Jiang ping, he weifang deng xuezhe lushi dui beijing shi zhengfu qugan wailai jumin de xingdong ji qi yiju de xingzheng wenjian xiang quanguo rendahui changweihui tiqing hexianxing shencha de quanwen], 19 December 17, reprinted in Rights Defense Network, 24 December 17, reprinted in Rights Defense Network, 24 December 17.

weighan Xiang quantize Tendante Changweigh and upong hexatiking she changed in Rights Defense Network, 24 December 17.

32 Xu Feipeng, "At Meeting of District Committee Secretaries, Cai Qi Stresses Defending the Nation, Guaranteeing Peace" [Cai qi zai quwei shuji hui shang qiangdiao jianchi shoutu jinze bao yifang ping'an], Qianlong, 27 November 17.

33 Wang Hao and Wu Hongli, "Cai Qi Greets Service Workers, Emphasizes Our City Can't Operate Without Ordinary Laborers, Chen Jining Also Greets [Them]" [Cai qi kanwang weiwen shenghuoxing fuwu ye laodongzhe shi qiangdiao women zhe zuo chengshi libukai putong laodongzhe chen jining yitong weiwen], Qianlong, 12 December 17.

34 For more information on the censorship of online discussion of the migrant worker evictions in Beijing, see Zheping Huang, "China's Evicting Mentions of Its 'Low-End' Migrants From Cyberspace," Quartz, 30 November 17; Freedom House, "China Media Bulletin: Holiday Crackdown, Beijing Netizen Outcries, Skype App Removal (Issue No. 124)," 9 December 17.

35 China Digital Times, "Minitrue: Beijing Municipality Campaign To Rectify [and] Clean Up Illegal Structures" [Zhenli bu: beijing shi zhengzhi qingtui wei jian xingdong], 28 November 17; China Digital Times, "Sensitive Word of the Week: Low-End Population," 30 November 17; "After Fire in Beijing's Shibalidian Township, More Violent Evictions of the 'Low-End Population,' Citizens Jointly Sign Letter Urging Cai Qi To Resign' [Beijing shibalidian xiang huozai hou 'diduan renkou' zai zao baoli quzhu gongmin lianshu duncu cai qi cizhi], Radio Free Asia,

hou 'diduan renkou' zai zao baoli quzhu gongmin lianshu duncu cai qi cizhi], Radio Free Asia, 14 December 17.

14 December 17.

37 Eva Dou and Dominique Fong, "Homeward Bound: Beijing Boots Migrant Workers To Trim Its Population," Wall Street Journal, 29 November 17; "After Fire in Beijing's Shibalidian Township, More Violent Evictions of the 'Low-End Population,' Citizens Jointly Sign Letter Urging Cai Qi To Resign" [Beijing shibalidian xiang huozai hou "diduan renkou" zai zao baoli quzhu gongmin lianshu duncu cai qi cizhil, Radio Free Asia, 14 December 17; "The Class Allegiance of China's De Facto Voters," Chublic Opinion (blog), 10 January 18.

38 The U.S.-based website China Digital Times collects and republishes censored articles. See, or "Theory Zapla" A Dishopartonia Day: Recording the Evapulsion of the Tow Fed Popul

e.g., "Zhang Zanbo—A Disheartening Day: Recording the Expulsion of the 'Low-End Population'" [Zhang zanbo—Ing ren jusang de yi tian: jilu qugan "diduan renkou"], Weibo post, reprinted in China Digital Times, 2 December 17; Wang Liuyi, "Analyzing the Legality of Beijing's Winter Cleanup Campaign'" [Beijing shi "dongji qingli xingdong" de hefaxing fenxil, WeChat post, reprinted in China Digital Times, 28 November 17; Xiong Pingping, "After Clearing Out, Local Beijing Residents Getting Anxious: Villages Emptied, Rental Income Gone" [Qingtui hou hearth legiting the height income the relative to the control of the company of the comp

bentu beijing ren kaishi jiaolu: cunzi kongle zujin meilel, Caijing, 25 December 17, reprinted in China Digital Times, 7 January 18.

39 Ye Bing, "Chinese Intellectuals Jointly Demand Beijing End Evictions of Migrants" [Zhongguo zhishifenzi lianming yaoqiu beijing tingzhi qugan wailai renkoul, Voice of America, 28 November 17; Nectar Gan, "Welcome to Beijing: Where Helping the Homeless Can Get You Evicted," South China Morning Post, 27 November 17.

Evicted," South China Morning Post, 27 November 17.

<sup>40</sup> Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire (14)" [Da huo zhihou (14)] [Video file], YouTube, 29 November 17; Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire (15A)" [Da huo zhihou (15A)] [Video file], YouTube, 29 November 17; Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire (16)" [Da huo zhihou (16)] [Video file], YouTube, 30 November 17.

<sup>41</sup> Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire (10)" [Da huo zhihou (10)] [Video file], YouTube, 29 November 17; Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire (11 Part 1)" [Da huo zhihou (11 shang)] [Video file], YouTube, 29 November 17.

42 Hua Yong, "After the Major Fire 2017–12–04 (2)" [Da huo zhihou 2017–12–04 (2)] [Video file], YouTube, 4 December 17; Hua Yong, "2017–12–07 Hua Yong at the Scene (18)" [2017–12–07 hua yong zai xianchang (18)] [Video file], YouTube, 7 December 17.

43 Videos can be found at Hua Yong's YouTube account and Twitter account. See also Austin Ramzy, "Artist Flees Beijing After Filming Devastation of Mass Evictions," New York Times, 12 December 17.

44 Austin Ramzy, "Artist Flees Beijing After Filming Devastation of Mass Evictions," New York Times, 12 December 17; Rights Defense Network, "Five Who Helped Hua Yong Escape From Xinjian Village, Beijing, Detained, Hua Yong Calls for [Their] Rescue" [Beijing xinjian cun 5 ming husong hua yong de cummin bei zhuabu hua yong yu guanzhu jiuyuan], 12 December 17. The following videos show an official attempting to remove Hua and local Beijing residents helping Hua to flee the area: Hua Yong, "2017–12–07 Hua Yong at the Scene (18)" [2017–12–07 hua yong zai xianchang (18)] [Video file], YouTube, 7 December 17; Hua Yong, "2017–12–07 hua yong zai xianchang (20)] [Video file], YouTube, 7 December 17.

45 Rights Defense Network, "Five Who Helped Hua Yong Escape From Xinjian Village, Beijing, Detained, Hua Yong Calls for [Their] Rescue" [Beijing xinjian cun 5 ming husong hua yong de cummin bei zhuabu hua yong yu guanzhu jiuyuan], 12 December 17; Rights Defense Network, "Hua Yong Visits 6 Criminally Detained Villagers From Xinjian Village, Beijing, Calls on Everyone To Follow [the Case] and Provide Legal Aid" [Hua yong tanfang beijing xinjian cun 6 ming zao xingju cunmin yu gejie guanzhu bing yu falu jiuyuan], 24 December 17. For more information, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database records 2018-00042 for Gu Tianjin, 2018-00043 for Hu Dehua, 2018-00044 for Hu Fuqiang, 2018-00045 for Liu Jinying, 2018-00046 for Shen Deli, and 2018-00047 for Zhang Shudong.

46 "Hua Yong Filmed 'Low-End Population' Evictions, Is Detained, Citizens Protest in Soli-

00043 for Hu Dehua, 2018-00044 for Hu Fuqiang, 2018-00045 for Liu Jinying, 2018-00046 for Shen Deli, and 2018-00047 for Zhang Shudong.

46 "Hua Yong Filmed 'Low-End Population' Evictions, Is Detained, Citizens Protest in Solidarity' [Hua yong paishe "diduan renkou" bei quzhu shipin zao zhuabu gongmin shangjie ju pai shengyuan], Radio Free Asia, 17 December 17. For more information on Hua Yong, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2018-00054. Hua recorded a series of videos in Tianjin prior to his detention. See, e.g., Hua Yong (huayong798), Twitter post, 15 December 17, 6:33 a.m.; Hua Yong (huayong798), Twitter post, 15 December 17, 7:07 a.m.

47 By releasing the seven individuals on bail (qubao houshen or "guarantee pending further investigation"), authorities may continue to restrict their freedom of movement, summon them for further questioning, and monitor them for up to 12 months. For a description of bail (qubao houshen), also translated as "guarantee pending further investigation," under Chinese legal provisions, see Human Rights in China, "HRIC Law Note: Five Detained Women Released on 'Guarantee Pending Further Investigation," 13 April 15. For relevant Chinese legal provisions, see PRC Criminal Procedure Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xingshi susong fa], passed 1 July 79, amended 17 March 96, 14 March 12, effective 1 January 13, arts. 65–72, 77; Ministry of Public Security, Public Security Procedural Provisions on Handling Criminal Cases [Gong'an

July 79, amended 17 March 96, 14 March 12, effective 1 January 13, arts. 65–72, 77; Ministry of Public Security, Public Security Procedural Provisions on Handling Criminal Cases [Gong'an jiguan banli xingshi anjian chengxu guiding], issued 13 December 12, effective 1 January 13, arts. 77, 85–86, 89.

48 "After Two Days' Criminal Detention, Hua Yong Released on Bail, Flew to Chengdu To Celebrate Daughter's Birthday" [Hua yong bei xingju liang ri hou qubao feidi chengdu peitong nu'er guo shengri], Radio Free Asia, 18 December 17; LifeTime Horizons (lifetimeusa), Twitter post, 18 December 17, 5:28 a.m.; Rights Defense Network, "Monthly Report of Political Prisoners and Prisoners of Conscience Detained in Mainland China" [Zhongdu dalu zai ya zhengzhi fan, liangxin fan yuedu baogao], 31 May 18; Civil Rights & Livelihood Watch, "Artist Hua Yong Driven Away for Social Stability, Forced To Leave Beijing" [Huajia hua yong zao weiwen qugan bei po banli beijingl 2 April 18

po banli beijingl, 2 April 18.

49 "Beijing Artist Under House Arrest in Remote Corner of China's Yunnan," Radio Free Asia, 9 August 18. For more information on the woman, Dong Yaoqiong, see the Commission's Polit-

9 August 18. For more information on the woman, Dong Yaoqiong, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2018-00343.

50 National People's Congress Standing Committee, PRC Regulations on Household Registration [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo hukou dengji tiaoli], issued and effective 9 January 58.

51 See, e.g., Hongbin Li et al., "Human Capital and China's Future Growth," Journal of Economic Perspectives, Vol. 31, No. 1 (Winter 2017), 28; Yang Song, "Hukou-Based Labour Market Discrimination and Ownership Structure in Urban China," Urban Studies, Vol. 53(8) (2016), 1658; Spencer Sheehan, "China's Hukou Reforms and the Urbanization Challenge," The Diplomat, 22 February 17. For more information on China's hukou system, see CECC, 2017 Annual Report, 5 October 17, 169-70.

52 National Bureau of Statistics of China, "The Economy Was Stable in 2017, and Exceeded Expectations" [2017 nian lingii vunxing wenzhong xianghao, hao yu yuqil, 18 January 18.

<sup>52</sup> National Bureau of Statistics of China, "The Economy Was Stable in 2017, and Exceeded Expectations" [2017 nian jingji yunxing wenzhong xianghao, hao yu yuqi], 18 January 18.
<sup>53</sup> See, e.g., Hongbin Li et al., "Human Capital and China's Future Growth," Journal of Economic Perspectives, Vol. 31, No. 1 (Winter 2017), 28; Yang Song, "Hukou-Based Labour Market Discrimination and Ownership Structure in Urban China," Urban Studies, Vol. 53(8) (2016), 1658; China Labour Bulletin, "Migrant Workers and Their Children," last visited 2 February 18; Eli Friedman, Insurgency Trap: Labor and Politics in Postsocialist China (Ithaca: Cornell University Procs. 2014), 14

18; Eli Friedman, Insurgency Trap: Labor and Politics in Postsocialist China (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2014), 14.

54 State Council, Opinion on Further Carrying Out Reform of the Household Registration System [Guowuyuan guanyu jin yi bu tuijin huji zhidu gaige de yijian], issued 30 July 14, paras. 4–9; "China To Help 100m Settle in Cities," Xinhua, reprinted in China Daily, 30 July 14; State Council General Office, "Plan Promoting 100 Million İndividuals in Cities Without Household Registration To Obtain Hukou" [Tuidong 1 yi fei huji renkou zai chengshi luohu fang'an], issued 30 September 16, paras. 4–6; China Digital Times, "Beijing To Scrap Urban-Rural Residency Distinction," 21 September 16.

55 China Digital Times, "Person of the Week: Sun Liping," 8 June 17.

<sup>56</sup> Sun Liping (Sun liping shehui guancha), "Sun Liping: It Was a Tragedy, but Not a Reason for Clearing the Population" [Sun liping: na jian shi shi beiju, dan bing bushi qingli renkou de liyou], WeChat post, 21 November 17.
<sup>57</sup> "About On the Road," University of Chicago, Paulson Institute, MacroPolo, last visited 16 July 18; State Council, Opinion on Further Carrying Out Reform of the Household Registration System [Guowuyuan guanyu jin yi bu tuijin huji zhidu gaige de yijian], issued 30 July 14, paras.

17. See also China Labour Bulletin, "Another Tragedy Unfolds in Beijing's Migrant Worker Shanty Towns," 20 November 17.

69 Emily Feng, "Beijing Begins Migrant School Demolition in Depopulation Drive," Financial Times, 19 July 17; Fan Shuo and Li Rongde, "School for Migrant Children in Beijing Fights Forced Closure," Caixin, 2 November 17.

70 Steven Lee Myers, "A Cleanup of 'Holes in the Wall' in China's Capital," New York Times, 17 July 17; Liu Caiyu, "Demolition of 1000's of Illegal Stores Leaves Beijing Migrants With Unsure Future," Global Times, 25 April 17; "Hundreds of Police Occupy Beijing Market Amid Anger Over Closures," Radio Free Asia, 20 September 17.

71 Beijing Municipal Commission of Housing and Urban-Rural Development et al., Opinion on Developing Rental of Collective Worker Dormitories (Provisional) (Draft for Solicitation of Com-

Pelijing Rental of Collective Worker Dormitories (Provisional) (Draft for Solicitation of Comments) [Guanyu fazhan zulinxing zhigong jiti sushe de yijian (shixing) (zhengqiu yijian gao)], 23 May 18, secs. 1–2. See also A Ruhan, "Beijing Promotes Rental of Collective Worker Dormitories" [Beijing tui zulinxing zhigong jiti sushe], Beijing Business Today, 23 May 18.

72 China Labour Bulletin, "China Faces Shortage of Express Delivery Workers in the New Year," 8 March 18; Jie Li, "Nanny Shortage: Housekeeping Industry Pulling People From Im-

poverished Regions" [Baomu jinque: jiazheng ye pinkun xian wa ren], Beijing Youth Daily, 20

poverished Regions" [Baomu jinque: jiazheng ye pinkun xian wa ren], benjing 10000 Dany, 20 May 18.

73 Shanghai Municipal People's Government, "'Shanghai Municipality General City Plan (2017–2035)' Issued, Shanghai Will Become a City of Innovation, Culture, and Ecology" ["Shanghai shi chengshi zongti guihua (2017–2035 nian)" fabu shanghai jiang chengwei chuangxin zhi cheng, renwen zhi cheng, shengtai zhi cheng], 5 January 18; Shanghai Municipal People's Government, "Municipal Government Introduces Information Relating to 'Shanghai Municipality General City Plan (2017–2035)' at Press Conference" [Shi zhengfu xinwen fabuhui jieshao "shanghai shi chengshi zongti guihua (2017–2035 nian)" xiangguan qingkuang], 4 January 18. See also Benjamin Haas, "China's Shanghai Sets Population at 25 Million To Avoid 'Big City Disease," "Guardian, 26 December 17.

74 'Li Keqiang Chairs Meeting of State Council Standing Committee" [Li keqiang zhuchi zhaokai guowuyuan changwu huiyi], Xinhua, 17 January 18; An Delie, "Li Keqiang Mobilizing Migrant Workers To Return to Rural Hometowns and Start Businesses Seen as Xi Jinping's Version of Being Sent Down to the Countryside" [Li keqiang dongyuan nongmingong fan xiang chuangye bei zhi xi jinping ban shangshan xiaxiang], Radio France Internationale, 18 January 18.

chuangye bei zni xi jinping ban shangsala alamaga, and the same and solve the National Bureau of Statistics in Beijing, "Beijing Municipality 2017 Citizen Economic and Social Development Statistical Bulletin" [Beijing shi 2017 nian guomin jingji he shehui fazhan tongji gongbao], 27 February 18, sec. 1; Shanghai Municipal Bureau of Statistics and Survey Office of the National Bureau of Statistics in Shanghai, "2017 Shanghai Municipality Citizen Economic Operations Situation" [2017 nian shanghai shi guomin jingji yunxing qingkuang], 19 January 18, sec. 8.

76 Bai Tiantian, "Beijing, Shanghai Record First Population Decline in 40 Years," Global Times 23 January 18.

Times, 23 January 18.

77 See, e.g., Amnesty International, "Standing Their Ground: Thousands Face Violent Eviction in China," 2012, 11–23; Human Rights Watch, "Demolished: Forced Evictions and the Tenants' Rights Movement in China," 24 March 04, 6–11.

78 Amnesty International, "Standing Their Ground: Thousands Face Violent Eviction in China," 2012, 11–12, 31–32; Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions, "One World, Whose Dream? Housing Rights Violations and the Beijing Olympic Games," July 2008, 7–8, 12–14; UN Watch, "38 Rights Groups Urge U.N. To Investigate Shanghai Expo Eviction of 18,000 Families," 14 July 10.

79 UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Concluding Observations on the Second Periodic Report of China, Including Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China, adopted by the Committee at its 40th Meeting (23 May 2014), E/C.12/CHN/CO/2, 13 June 14, para. 30.

80 UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, CESCR General Comment No. 4: The Right to Adequate Housing (Art. 11(1) of the Covenant), E/1992/23, 13 December 91, para. 8(a). Note that this finding is reaffirmed in UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment No. 7: The Right to Adequate Housing (Art. 11.1): Forced Evictions, E/1998/2, 20 May 97, para. 1; UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, (CESCR), adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 3 January 76, art. 11(1); United Nations Treaty Collection, Chapter IV, Human Rights, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment No. 7: The Right to Adequate Housing (Art. 11.1): Forced Evictions, E/1998/2, 20 May 97, para 16; Eva Pils, Human Rights in China (Medford: Polity Press, 2018), 105–07. tions, E/1998/2, 20 May 97, para. 16; Eva Pils, Human Rights in China (Medford: Polity Press,

2018), 105-07.

81 PRC Administrative Enforcement Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xingzheng qiangzhi fal, passed 30 June 11, effective 1 January 12, arts. 43-44. For analyses of the legality of the evictions in Beijing under Chinese law, see "Full Text of Request From Jiang Ping, He Weifang, and Other Scholars and Lawyers to the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress for a Review of the Constitutionality of the Beijing Government's Campaign To Expel Nonresidents and Relevant Administrative Documents" [Jiang ping, he weifang deng xuezhe lushi dui beijing shi zhengfu qugan wailai jumin de xingdong ji qi yiju de xingzheng wenjian xiang quanguo rendahui changweihui tiqing hexianxing shencha de quanwen], 19 December 17, reprinted in Rights Defense Network, 24 December 17; Wang Liuyi, "Analyzing the Legality of Beijing's 'Winter Cleanup Campaign'" [Beijing shi 'dongji qingli xingdong" de hefaxing fenxil, WeChat post, reprinted in China Digital Times, 28 November 17.

82 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 19; Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A (III) on 10 December 48, art. 19. For more information on restrictions on freedom of expression in China, see CECC, 2017 Annual Report, 5 October 17, 66-83.

83 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A (III) of 10 December 48, art. 20(1); International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 22. For more information on international standards and civil society in China, see CECC, 2017 Annual Report, 5 October 17, 223-28.

84 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, arts. 2(1), 12(1), 12(3), 26; Uni 81 PRC Administrative Enforcement Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo xingzheng qiangzhi

Hong Kong, China, and Macao, China, adopted by the Committee at its 40th Meeting (23 May 2014), E/C.12/CHN/CO/2, 13 June 14, para. 15; UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Special Rapporteur on Extreme Poverty and Human Rights on His Mission to China, Philip Alston, A/HRC/35/26/Add.2, 28 March 17, paras. 27–28. See also Chinese Human Rights Defenders, "From Forced Evictions of Migrant Workers to Abused Children: Violations of Social & Economic Rights in China Refute the 'China Development Model,'" 7 December 17.