

INSTITUTIONS OF DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE

Context for Governance: Political Power and Ideological Reach of the Communist Party

In China's one-party, authoritarian political system,¹ the Chinese Communist Party dominates the state and society.² The Party continues to grow and is known to penetrate and exert its influence on politics and society at all levels through Party groups in governmental agencies³ and in a variety of organizations,⁴ including many businesses.⁵ International experts asserted that under Party General Secretary and President Xi Jinping, there is less separation of Party and government.⁶ During the Commission's 2015 reporting year, central Party authorities emphasized "rectifying" weak grassroots-level Party organizations⁷ and stressed the goal of further strengthening Party leadership over the government's administrative, judicial, legislative, and other institutions.⁸ Central Party leaders also expressed the intention to use the law as a tool to achieve those goals and impose the Party's will, saying: ". . . the Party . . . acting within the scope of the Constitution and the law . . . , [will] be effective at making the Party's standpoints become the national will through statutory procedures, be effective at ensuring that the candidates recommended by Party organizations become leaders in State political bodies through statutory procedures, be effective at implementing Party leadership over the country and society through State political bodies, and be effective at utilizing democratic centralist principles to safeguard the authority of the center" ⁹ In addition, they stressed "strengthen[ing] Party leadership over legislative work" ¹⁰ and maintaining the Party's role in coordinating "all sides with people's congresses, governments, consultative conferences, trial bodies and prosecutorial bodies" ¹¹

During the reporting period, central Party leaders also further emphasized adherence to Party ideology. Party authorities, recalling the important role Party branches played during China's "revolution, construction, and reform" periods, stressed requirements to establish Party branches in all state-affiliated agencies and organizations, as well as in "economic, cultural, social, and other organizations" in order "to ensure the implementation of the Party's ideology, principles, and policy directions through these important channels." ¹² Party leaders particularly underscored the Party's leadership and control over, or the demand for, adherence to Party ideology by state-owned enterprises,¹³ universities,¹⁴ the military,¹⁵ the courts,¹⁶ the media,¹⁷ and think tanks.¹⁸ Authorities reportedly also encouraged programs for artists to uphold the "correct view" of art.¹⁹ In addition, articles documented a "hardening" of political discourse,²⁰ a tightening of ideological control,²¹ and an emphasis on "ideological security."²²

Reports described the Party's insistence on drawing clear distinctions between Chinese and Western ideology,²³ norms and values,²⁴ and notions of judicial independence.²⁵ State-run media reportedly emphasized that China's "governing in accord with the constitution" is not the same as "constitutional democracy" in Western nations.²⁶ Reports also noted an upswing in demonizing the West²⁷ and blaming overseas forces for China's domestic problems.²⁸ The

definition of national security in the new PRC National Security Law passed in July 2015 is very broad²⁹ and includes “political,” “economic,” and “international” security, as well as “cultural and social security.”³⁰ One Chinese security expert reportedly explained that to ensure “cultural security” Chinese authorities needed to promote traditional Chinese culture while repelling other perspectives including some Western values incompatible with Chinese core values.³¹

The Party made efforts to enforce prescribed ideological norms within academic and research circles, and repel Western ideals. These efforts included mandating quotas for student Internet propaganda workers and issuing directives to report on ideological trends among students.³² News reports noted attacks on academics and social commentators for voicing their opinions.³³ An official internal document—“Document No. 30”—reportedly called for a purge of “Western-inspired liberal ideas” from universities.³⁴ There has been some pushback against the Party’s efforts.³⁵ Chinese lawyers, for example, inquired into the legal basis of the restrictions on teaching materials,³⁶ and students, academics, and others raised questions about imposing ideological restrictions and launching attacks on Western ideology.³⁷

Central authorities provided more details about the government-controlled “social credit” system first introduced in 2014. Authorities intend the “social credit” scheme to be part of China’s socialist market economic and “social governance” systems,³⁸ to “strengthen sincerity in government affairs,” and to improve commercial and social “sincerity” and “judicial credibility.”³⁹ One journalist commented that by making information available to the public regarding legal compliance, the new system may be “a proxy for an underdeveloped legal system.”⁴⁰ The “social credit” system will include a numerical index to evaluate individuals and organizations, including companies, on their financial standing, and social and moral behavior.⁴¹ It also will include an information database linked to citizen identification cards tracking citizens’ financial data, criminal records, travel history, and perhaps even Internet purchases and online behavior.⁴² An international China expert asserted that this system is similar to one formerly employed by the East German government that was intended to prevent a revolt against the state, but “the Chinese aim is far more ambitious: it is clearly an attempt to create a new citizen” by “incentivizing specific behaviors.”⁴³

Intensified Crackdown on Democracy Advocates, Free Speech, Association, and Assembly

Under Chinese Communist Party General Secretary and President Xi Jinping, Party repression reportedly has intensified⁴⁴ and the ongoing crackdown is stronger than “anything since the Mao era.”⁴⁵ Other reports assert that human rights abuses in China are “the cruelest we have seen since 1989,”⁴⁶ that the “persecution of human rights defenders in 2014 was as severe as it has been since the mid-1990s,”⁴⁷ and that there has been a narrowing of tolerance for civic activism.⁴⁸ Under Xi Jinping, there reportedly has been “suppression of previously tolerated activities, topics, and individuals.”⁴⁹ A disturbing trend is Chinese authorities’ increasing use

of retaliation against individuals who plan to or have reached out to UN human rights bodies, including preventing citizens from traveling abroad to attend UN treaty body reviews of China by confiscating their passports and other means.⁵⁰ Those individuals include Wang Qiuyun, a member of the Women's Network Against HIV/AIDS whom authorities prevented from attending a review of China before the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,⁵¹ and Deng Chuanbin, who had planned to attend a human rights training session in Geneva, Switzerland, before authorities confiscated his passport.⁵²

Chinese authorities also continued to harass, detain, and impose prison sentences on democracy advocates who exercised their rights to freedom of speech, assembly, association, and demonstration, including individuals who advocated for democracy in Hong Kong.⁵³ Representative cases of democracy advocates targeted by authorities are noted below:

- **Chen Shuqing.** In September 2014, authorities detained Chen on suspicion of “inciting subversion of state power” for participating in activities associated with the banned China Democracy Party.⁵⁴
- **Zhao Haitong.** In November 2014, authorities sentenced Zhao to 14 years’ imprisonment for “inciting subversion of state power” for participating in peaceful demonstrations and for advocating for democratic reforms.⁵⁵
- **Shen Yongping.** In December 2014, authorities sentenced Shen, a filmmaker, to one year’s imprisonment for “illegal business activity” for making available online for free his documentary about historical efforts to establish constitutional government in China.⁵⁶
- **Yao Lifa.** In late 2014, authorities held Yao in detention for over a month, possibly because he was invited to provide assistance to an election candidate in Shandong province, among other possible reasons.⁵⁷

Authorities persecuted individuals for participating in memorial events in remembrance of the victims of the violent suppression of the 1989 Tiananmen protests. During the lead-up to the 26th anniversary of the Tiananmen protests, authorities questioned, held in custody,⁵⁸ criminally detained,⁵⁹ sent on forced “vacation,”⁶⁰ or harassed⁶¹ individuals and warned or pressured artists and historians not to document the lives of Tiananmen protesters.⁶² Authorities also pursued criminal cases against people detained prior to the 25th anniversary in 2014.⁶³ Below are some representative cases of people affected by the ongoing crackdown.

- **Pu Zhiqiang.** Authorities detained Pu on May 6, 2014, after he had attended a gathering in someone’s home during which participants discussed topics related to the 1989 Tiananmen protests.⁶⁴ Pu also made videos of his interviews with officials under suspicion of corruption who allege they had been tortured during their detention.⁶⁵ According to the May 2015 indictment, the charges against Pu were “picking quarrels and provoking trouble” and “inciting ethnic hatred.” Officials dropped two other charges.⁶⁶

- **Tang Jingling.** Authorities detained Tang in May 2014 and later charged him with “inciting subversion of state power” related to his role in a “June Fourth Meditation” activity commemorating the 1989 Tiananmen protests through meditation.⁶⁷ His trial began on June 19, 2015, but ended after he dismissed his attorneys to protest procedural violations.⁶⁸
- **Yu Shiwen and Chen Wei (husband and wife).** Authorities detained Yu and Chen in May 2014 after the couple reportedly organized a memorial service in Henan province in February 2014 that commemorated former Party leaders Hu Yaobang and Zhao Ziyang and victims of the crackdown on the 1989 Tiananmen protests.⁶⁹ Authorities later arrested them on the charge of “picking quarrels and provoking trouble.” Officials released Chen on bail in September 2014 but continued to hold Yu.⁷⁰
- **Chen Yunfei.** Authorities detained Chen on March 25, 2015, and formally arrested him on April 30 on the charges of “inciting subversion of state power” and “picking quarrels and provoking trouble” following his visit to the burial site of a 1989 Tiananmen democracy protest crackdown victim.⁷¹

Reform: Pledge To Expand “Socialist Political Democratic Consultative Processes”

During the reporting year, central Party authorities did not pledge to undertake any significant democratic political reforms.⁷² They did, however, pledge to improve and develop the existing “socialist political democratic consultative system”⁷³ in order to strengthen Party leadership. Chinese officials describe China’s political system as a “socialist democracy” with “multi-party cooperation” and “political consultation” under the leadership of the Communist Party.⁷⁴ Previously, types of “consultation” have included: input (intraparty) on decisions about Party cadre appointments; input on development projects at grassroots levels; input on some draft laws; and discussions between Party representatives and the national Chinese People’s Political Consultative Conference (CPPCC) and the eight “democratic” minor parties under the CPPCC umbrella.⁷⁵

In line with the pledge to improve China’s “socialist political democratic consultative system,” in February 2015, authorities issued an opinion stipulating improvement of vaguely defined Party-led⁷⁶ “democratic consultation” channels while “using promotion of consultative democracy to improve and strengthen the Party’s leadership and consolidate the Party’s hold on power.”⁷⁷ The opinion emphasized allowing mass organizations⁷⁸ to fully develop as Party conduits to the public,⁷⁹ and stipulated strengthening consultation between the CPPCC and eight “democratic” minor parties and the judiciary and government.⁸⁰ The opinion also called for gradual exploration of the involvement of “social organizations”—non-governmental groups, professional associations, and non-profit groups able to register with the government⁸¹—in undefined consultation processes.⁸²

Reform: Party Promotes “Administration According to Law”

During the reporting period, central Party leaders emphasized government reforms promoting “administration according to law”⁸³ and “modernizing government and governing capacity”⁸⁴ in the Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law (Decision) passed at the Fourth Plenum of the 18th National Congress of the Chinese Communist Party Central Committee in October 2014 (Fourth Plenum).⁸⁵ The Fourth Plenum Decision emphasized components of “administration according to law,” such as strengthening legal enforcement;⁸⁶ improving the organization of government and bolstering administrative procedure systems of law;⁸⁷ and developing statutory procedures for incorporating public and expert participation, risk assessments, and collective discussion during certain administrative policy decisionmaking processes.⁸⁸ The Decision also mandated improving administrative procedural transparency and tightening restraints on and supervision over the use of government administrative authority.⁸⁹ In addition, it specified the establishment of top-down systems whereby government leaders would “assume lifelong accountability for major policy decisions and a mechanism for tracking down and investigating those responsible for the decisionmaking” even after they leave office.⁹⁰

Local Elections in China’s One-Party State

Chinese leaders continued to encourage some popular participation in elections at local levels, but China’s political institutions remain out of compliance with international human rights standards. In China, elections are held at the very lowest administrative levels for rural village and urban community residents’ committees.⁹¹ Elections for local people’s congresses exist but take place only at the county level and below.⁹² The Chinese Communist Party employs both “intraparty” elections and selection processes at local and national levels,⁹³ but use of the term “intraparty democracy” in recent years reportedly has reached a low point in the media discourse of Chinese leaders.⁹⁴ There are no national-level elections for government officials.⁹⁵ Chinese political institutions do not meet the standards defined in Article 25 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights,⁹⁶ which China has signed and declared an intention to ratify.⁹⁷ Chinese political institutions also remain out of compliance with the standards set forth in Article 21 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which stipulates that the “will of the people” should be “expressed in periodic and genuine elections which shall be by universal and equal suffrage.”⁹⁸

Chinese authorities claimed that, by the end of 2013, 98 percent of villages directly elected their Party committees,⁹⁹ but this figure does not reflect the quality of those elections, which in some cases may not be free or fair. During the reporting year, for example, Party authorities in a prefecture in the Tibet Autonomous Region discriminated against certain types of individuals through codified restrictions on village committee and Party committee election candidates.¹⁰⁰ Prefectural authorities mandated that village committee candidates be members or soon-to-be members of the Communist

Party and cannot have “practiced evil religions” or “attended overseas ‘religious gatherings’ organized by the Fourteenth Dalai,” among other restrictions.¹⁰¹ Other reports highlighted additional problems with local village committee elections, including interference from officials,¹⁰² gender inequality,¹⁰³ irregular election procedures,¹⁰⁴ failure to recognize election outcomes,¹⁰⁵ silencing candidates whom Party authorities deem to be challenging,¹⁰⁶ and physical violence.¹⁰⁷

Open Government Affairs and Citizen Access to Information

Chinese authorities reiterated their intent to improve “open government affairs” (proactive government transparency) and to aim for information disclosure as the norm.¹⁰⁸ The Fourth Plenum Decision urged transparency, especially in government finances and budgets, distribution of public funding, approval and implementation of major construction projects, and public interest affairs.¹⁰⁹ In November 2014, the State Council General Office issued an opinion calling on government agencies to improve their websites, strengthen public trust in the government, and make government websites the primary source of government information.¹¹⁰ In April 2015, the State Council issued a decision calling on government agencies to make available to the public lists itemizing their administrative powers—including compulsory enforcement, administrative fines, and other related information—in an attempt to improve transparency, promote administrative reform, and restrain arbitrary authority.¹¹¹

Despite these policy and regulatory measures, transparency and access to government data is still lacking and government implementation of the 2008 Open Government Information Regulations¹¹² remains problematic. A source noted that it is getting more difficult for Chinese scientists to obtain good-quality public data, most of which are held by government departments.¹¹³ The lack of regulatory transparency reportedly has contributed to the complexity of the environment for U.S. businesses in China.¹¹⁴ In August 2015, authorities called on the media to use only approved story lines, tried to censor news reports, and blocked journalists from reporting on the August 12 chemical fire and explosions in Tianjin municipality that reportedly caused the death of 173 people.¹¹⁵ Before and after restrictions took effect and government agencies issued statements, however, social media and mainstream media reported on the disaster.¹¹⁶

Corruption

Widespread corruption continued to be a serious challenge facing China, alarming both Chinese leaders and members of the international community.¹¹⁷ News sources reported on corruption related to the procurement of government and military equipment and services,¹¹⁸ as well as corruption in the media,¹¹⁹ sports,¹²⁰ art,¹²¹ and intelligence and security¹²² sectors. News reports also highlighted serious problems with the buying and selling of official positions¹²³ and collusion between business and government officials.¹²⁴

SNARING “TIGERS AND FLIES”

During the reporting year, Chinese leaders’ wide-reaching anticorruption campaign continued snaring so-called “flies” and “tigers,”¹²⁵ including high-level officials in the government,¹²⁶ people’s congresses,¹²⁷ the Chinese People’s Political Consultative Conference,¹²⁸ the military,¹²⁹ state-owned enterprises,¹³⁰ the media,¹³¹ the Party’s discipline inspection apparatus,¹³² and the state security apparatus.¹³³ According to Xinhua, the Supreme People’s Procuratorate’s corruption probe data indicated that in 2014, procuratorates investigated a total of 55,101 people in 41,487 cases of violations related to their official jobs, an increase of 7.4 percent over the previous year.¹³⁴

The highest ranking official snared in the anticorruption campaign was Zhou Yongkang, a former member of the Standing Committee of the Political Bureau of the Communist Party Central Committee and head of the Party Central Committee Political and Legal Affairs Commission.¹³⁵ On June 11, 2015, the Tianjin No. 1 Intermediate People’s Court sentenced Zhou to life imprisonment and loss of political rights for life, and confiscated his personal assets for the crimes of accepting bribes, abuse of power, and intentionally leaking state secrets, following a closed trial that began on May 22.¹³⁶ Other high-level officials suspected of corruption included Xu Caihou¹³⁷ and Guo Boxiong, both former vice chairmen of the Central Military Commission,¹³⁸ and Ling Jihua, a key aide to former Party General Secretary and President Hu Jintao.¹³⁹

ANTICORRUPTION MEASURES

The anticorruption campaign in China continued, but authorities persisted in punishing citizen anticorruption advocacy efforts. The Fourth Plenum Decision called for “acceleration” of anticorruption legislation.¹⁴⁰ Authorities reportedly announced that the anticorruption drive would become more “targeted and focused,”¹⁴¹ while other sources indicated authorities would focus on political factions and organized corruption within the Party.¹⁴² Anticorruption authorities reportedly called for more public participation in the campaign against corruption but emphasized that the campaign would not lead to “mass movements” that disrupt social stability.¹⁴³ At the same time, anticorruption advocates Ding Jiayi,¹⁴⁴ Liu Ping,¹⁴⁵ and Huang Wenxun¹⁴⁶ remained imprisoned.

The anticorruption campaign also included several specific Party and governmental anticorruption measures and institutional changes. The Supreme People’s Procuratorate (SPP) set up Party discipline inspection offices inside all of the approximately 140 central Party and government agencies as well as central legislative and consultative bodies.¹⁴⁷ Central authorities also overhauled the anticorruption bureau under the SPP, elevating its status, and renaming it the General Office of Anticorruption.¹⁴⁸ In addition, authorities instituted a national real estate registry¹⁴⁹ and stepped up efforts to locate and bring to justice Chinese nationals living overseas who are corruption suspects.¹⁵⁰ To ensure smooth development of corruption informant tip procedures, the SPP issued a revised version of the SPP Informant Tip Work Provisions.¹⁵¹ These rules further clarified the rights of informants,¹⁵² increased reward

amounts for informants,¹⁵³ and toughened legal liabilities for individuals who threaten whistleblowers.¹⁵⁴

Despite the seriousness of anticorruption efforts at the central level, preventing corruption remains challenging,¹⁵⁵ and reports highlighting the darker sides of the anticorruption drive continued to surface. One article noted President Xi Jinping's vulnerability to claims that political motives may be driving decisions about corruption investigation targets.¹⁵⁶ Other articles raised ongoing accounts of torture¹⁵⁷ and abnormal deaths of officials,¹⁵⁸ including alleged "suicides."¹⁵⁹ One Chinese news article reported that government institutions were ordered to collect data on officials who died "unnatural" deaths and noted that, based on a survey of news articles, an estimated 50 Party officials died unnatural deaths between November 2012 and December 2014.¹⁶⁰ An opinion piece in *China Daily* reported an increase in the occurrence of suicides by officials over the last few years, approximately 30 percent of which have been linked to corruption investigations.¹⁶¹

Notes to Section III—Institutions of Democratic Governance

¹Jidong Chen et al., “Sources of Authoritarian Responsiveness: A Field Experiment in China,” *American Journal of Political Science* (forthcoming), reprinted in Social Science Research Network, last visited 28 April 15; Jin Kai, “No, China Isn’t Fascist: Once Again, Western Media Misunderstands China’s Political System,” *The Diplomat*, 5 March 15.

²Susan V. Lawrence and Michael F. Martin, Congressional Research Service, “Understanding China’s Political System,” 20 March 13, summary.

³*Ibid.*, 3–4; “Chinese Communist Party Has 87,793,000 Party Members and 4,360,000 Grassroots Organizations” [Zhongguo gongchandang you dangyuan 8779.3 wan ming jiceng dang zuzhi 436.0 wan ge], *Xinhua*, 29 June 15. By the end of 2014, there were reportedly 7,565 urban neighborhood Communist Party organizations, 32,753 township organizations, 92,581 community (residential) committees, and 577,273 village committees. In addition, by the end of 2014, the Party reportedly had over 87.7 million party members in total, compared with over 77.9 million at the end of 2009. For the 2009 figure, see Gao Lei, “At the End of 2009 Total Number of Party Members Throughout the Country Reaches 77,995,000” [Jiezhi 2009 niandi quanguo dangyuan zongshu da 7799.5 wan ming], *Chinese Communist Party Information Net*, 28 June 10. Party branches are within public institutions (including hospitals, schools, and research institutes) as well as within government departments.

⁴“Chinese Communist Party Has 87,793,000 Party Members and 4,360,000 Grassroots Organizations” [Zhongguo gongchandang you dangyuan 8779.3 wan ming jiceng dang zuzhi 436.0 wan ge], *Xinhua*, 29 June 15. By the end of 2014, there were Party organizations in 184,000 “social organizations” (*shehui zuzhi*), covering about 41.9 percent of all “social organizations.”

⁵*Ibid.* By the end of 2014, there were reportedly 194,900 publicly-owned enterprises and over 1,579,000 private enterprises with Party organizations, amounting to over 91 percent and 53 percent of such enterprises, respectively.

⁶Christopher K. Johnson and Scott Kennedy, “China’s Un-Separation of Powers: The Blurred Lines of Party and Government,” *Foreign Affairs*, 24 July 15.

⁷Sheng Ruowei, “More Than 60,000 Weak and Lax Grassroots Party Organizations Rectified” [Liuwan duo ge ruanruo huansan jiceng dang zuzhi bei zhengdun], *People’s Daily*, 31 May 14.

⁸Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, items 1(8), 2(2). See also Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, “CCP Central Committee Decision Concerning Some Major Questions in Comprehensively Moving Governing the Country According to the Law Forward,” translated in *China Copyright and Media* (blog), 28 October 14, item 2(2).

⁹*Ibid.*, item 1(8); *Ibid.*, item 1(8).

¹⁰*Ibid.*, item 2(2); *Ibid.*, item 2(2).

¹¹*Ibid.*, item 1(8); *Ibid.*, item 1(8).

¹²“Xi Jinping Convenes Chinese Communist Party Politburo Meeting, Deliberates ‘Chinese Communist Party Organization Work Regulations (Provisional)’” [Xi jinning zhuchi zhongyang zhengzhiju huiyi shenyi “zhongguo gongchandang dangzu gongzuo tiaoli (shixing)”], *Xinhua*, 29 May 15.

¹³“Xi Jinping: Deepen Reforms and Vigorously Expand Consolidated Achievements, Continue To Thoroughly Struggle Against Corruption” [Xi jinning: shenhua gaige gonggu chengguo jiju tuozhan buduan ba fan fubai douzheng yin xiang shenru], *Xinhua*, 13 January 15; Li Tao, “Xi Stresses CPC’s Leadership, Supervision Over SOEs,” *Xinhua*, 13 January 15; “China Tightens Communist Party Leadership at State Firms,” *Reuters*, reprinted in *New York Times*, 5 June 15.

¹⁴Chinese Communist Party Central Committee General Office and State Council General Office, Opinions Concerning Further Strengthening and Improving Propaganda and Ideology Work in Higher Education Under New Circumstances [Guanyu jinyibu jiaqiang he gaijin xin xingshi xia gaoxiao xuanchuan sixiang gongzuo de yijian], reprinted in *Xinhua*, 19 January 15. See also “Opinions Concerning Further Strengthening and Improving Propaganda and Ideology Work in Higher Education Under New Circumstances,” translated in *China Copyright and Media* (blog), 16 February 15; “Central Organization Department and Ministry of Education Responsible Persons Answer Questions About ‘College Presidents Responsibility System’” [Zhongzubu, jiaoyubu fuzeren jiu “xiaozhang fuze zhi” da jizhe wen], *Caixin*, 16 October 14.

¹⁵Minnie Chan, “Communist Party ‘Controls the Gun,’ PLA Top Brass Reminded,” *South China Morning Post*, 5 November 14; “Party Media Analyzes ‘New Gutian Meeting,’ Releases Signal: Show Your Colors and Oppose Nationalization of the Military” [Dang mei jiedu “xin gutian huiyi” shifang xin hao: qizhi xianming fandui jundui guojiahua], *The Paper*, 2 November 14.

¹⁶Chris Buckley, “China Is Said To Be Doing Away With Goals for Arrests and Convictions,” *New York Times*, 21 January 15.

¹⁷“China’s Xi Urges Young, New Media Workers To Lead Rejuvenation of Nation,” *Reuters*, 21 May 15; Bob Dietz, Committee to Protect Journalists, “In China, Mainstream Media as Well as Dissidents Under Increasing Pressure,” 17 December 14; “Central United Front First-Ever Training for New Media Professionals, Including Chen Tong, Zhang Yiming, Deng Fei, and Others” [Zhongyang tongzhanbu shou du lunxun xin meiti congye ren yuan, chen tong zhang yiming deng fei deng zai lie] *The Paper*, 19 May 15.

¹⁸“CCP General Office and State Council General Office Opinions Concerning Strengthening the Construction of New Types of Think Tanks With Chinese Characteristics,” translated in *China Copyright and Media* (blog), 21 January 15. *China Copyright and Media’s* translation is an unofficial translation. “China To Instill National Characteristics in Think Tanks,” *Xinhua*, 20 January 15.

¹⁹“China To Send Artists To Live in Grassroots Communities,” *Xinhua*, 1 December 14.

- ²⁰Qian Gang, “Reading Chinese Politics in 2014,” China Media Project, 30 December 14.
- ²¹“China’s Xi Calls for Tighter Ideological Control in Universities,” Reuters, 29 December 14; “Analysts Say Chinese Politics Will Continue To Turn Left in 2015” [Fenxi renshi 2015 nian zhongguo zhengzhi jixu zuo zhuan], Voice of America, 1 March 15; “Chinese Authorities Blocked History Websites, Chinese Communist Party Strengthens Ideological Control” [Zhongguo dangju feng lishi wangzhan zhonggong jiaqiang yishi xingtai kongzhi], Radio Free Asia, 16 February 15.
- ²²Simon Tisdall, “Chinese Repression of Dissent Intensifies Under Ruthless Xi Jinping,” Guardian, 30 December 14.
- ²³Peter Ford, “China Targets ‘Hostile Foreign Forces’ in Crescendo of Accusations,” Christian Science Monitor, 9 November 14.
- ²⁴Cao Siqi, “Cultural Security Stressed in Law,” Global Times, 21 April 15; Chinese Communist Party Central Committee General Office and State Council General Office, Opinion on Strengthening Construction of a Public Security Prevention and Control System [Guanyu jiaqiang shehui zhi’an fangkong tixi jianshe de yijian], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 13 April 15, para. 15.
- ²⁵Liu Ruifu, “Fundamental Differences Between Our Nation’s Independent and Just Judiciary and Western Nations’ Judicial Independence” [Woguo duli gongzheng sifa yu xifang guojia “sifa dul” de genben qubie], Seeking Truth, 25 December 14.
- ²⁶“Authoritative Interview: China’s ‘Govern According to the Constitution’ Is Not Western ‘Constitutional Democracy’” [Quanwei fangtan: zhongguo de “yi xian zhizheng” bushi xifang de “xianzheng minzhu”], CCTV, 5 November 14; Qian Gang, “Reading Chinese Politics in 2014,” China Media Project, 30 December 14.
- ²⁷David Bandurski, “The ‘Cancer’ of All Things Western,” China Media Project, 24 March 15; Christopher Bodeen, “China State Media Seen Stepping-Up Anti-Western Rhetoric,” Associated Press, reprinted in Yahoo! News, 2 March 15; Sui-Lee Wee, “China’s Top Court Says No to West’s Model of Judicial Independence,” Reuters, 26 February 15.
- ²⁸Peter Ford, “China Targets ‘Hostile Foreign Forces’ in Crescendo of Accusations,” Christian Science Monitor, 9 November 14.
- ²⁹“UN Rights Chief Concerned by ‘Broad Scope’ of China’s New Security Law,” UN News Centre, 7 July 15.
- ³⁰PRC National Security Law [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo guojia anquan fa], passed and effective 1 July 15, art. 3.
- ³¹Cao Siqi, “Cultural Security Stressed in Law,” Global Times, 21 April 15.
- ³²“Quotas for University Youth League Propaganda Work,” China Digital Times, 5 February 15.
- ³³Chris Buckley and Andrew Jacobs, “Maoists in China, Given New Life, Attack Dissent,” New York Times, 4 January 15; Megha Rajagopalan, “Chinese Academic Bemoans ‘Narrow-Minded . . . Repressive’ Attacks,” Reuters, reprinted in New York Times, 26 January 15.
- ³⁴Chris Buckley and Andrew Jacobs, “Maoists in China, Given New Life, Attack Dissent,” New York Times, 4 January 15.
- ³⁵Joanna Chiu, “Students in China Rail Against Government Restrictions,” Deutsche Presse-Agentur, 23 February 15; Megha Rajagopalan, “Chinese Academic Bemoans ‘Narrow-Minded . . . Repressive’ Attacks,” Reuters, reprinted in New York Times, 26 January 15.
- ³⁶“Nine Lawyers File FOIA Request Demanding Legal Basis for Banning the Spread of Western Value Systems in China’s Universities,” Fei Chang Dao (blog), 22 February 15.
- ³⁷Joanna Chiu, “Students in China Rail Against Government Restrictions,” Deutsche Presse-Agentur, 23 February 15; Dan Levin, “China Tells Schools To Suppress Western Ideas, With One Big Exception,” New York Times, 9 February 15; Liang Pan, “Signs of Resistance to China’s Latest Ideological Crackdown,” Foreign Policy, 3 March 15.
- ³⁸State Council, “Social Credit System Construction Program Outline (2014–2020)” [Shehui xinyong tixi jianshe guihua gangyao (2014–2020 nian)], reprinted in PRC Central People’s Government, 27 June 14, para. 1; State Council, “Planning Outline for the Construction of a Social Credit System (2014–2020),” translated in China Copyright and Media (blog), 25 April 15, para. 1.
- ³⁹Ibid., para. 3; Ibid., para. 3.
- ⁴⁰Sara Hsu, “China’s New Social Credit System,” The Diplomat, 10 May 15.
- ⁴¹Michelle FlorCruz, “China To Use Big Data To Rate Citizens in New ‘Social Credit System,’” International Business Times, 28 April 15; Sara Hsu, “China’s New Social Credit System,” The Diplomat, 10 May 15.
- ⁴²“21 Articles for Maintaining Stability’ Promote Information ‘Single Card,’ Triggering Polarized Commentary” [“Weiwen 21 tiao” tui xinxi “yikatong” yinfa liangji pinglun], Radio Free Asia, 15 April 15; Chinese Communist Party Central Committee General Office and State Council General Office, Opinion on Strengthening Construction of a Public Security Prevention and Control System [Guanyu jiaqiang shehui zhi’an fangkong tixi jianshe de yijian], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 13 April 15, para. 15; Sara Hsu, “China’s New Social Credit System,” The Diplomat, 10 May 15.
- ⁴³Michelle FlorCruz, “China To Use Big Data To Rate Citizens in New ‘Social Credit System,’” International Business Times, 28 April 15.
- ⁴⁴Sarah Cook, Freedom House, “The Politburo’s Predicament: Confronting the Limitations of Chinese Communist Party Repression,” January 2015, 3.
- ⁴⁵“Tighter Online Controls in China Point to Wider Clampdown,” Associated Press, reprinted in New York Times, 16 February 15.
- ⁴⁶“Human Rights Abuses in China ‘At Worst Since 1989’: Report,” Radio Free Asia, 16 February 15.
- ⁴⁷Chinese Human Rights Defenders, “Silencing the Messenger: 2014 Annual Report on the Situation of Human Rights Defenders in China,” 15 March 15, 1.
- ⁴⁸Josh Chin, “China Cracks Down on Foreign Nonprofits,” Wall Street Journal, 6 March 15.

- ⁴⁹ Sarah Cook, "The Risks of Expanding Repression in China," *The Diplomat*, 8 April 15.
- ⁵⁰ Chinese Human Rights Defenders, "Silencing the Messenger: 2014 Annual Report on the Situation of Human Rights Defenders in China," March 2015, 1, 4, 24–25.
- ⁵¹ Jess Macy Yu, "Chinese AIDS Activist Says She Was Kept From U.N. Conference," *New York Times*, Sinosphere (blog), 23 October 14.
- ⁵² Rights Defense Network, "Sichuan's Deng Chuanbin, Because of Participating in International Rights Organization's Rights Knowledge Training, Illegally Summoned, Passport, HK-Macau Travel Permit, Communications Equipment Confiscated" [Sichuan deng chuanbin yin canjia guoji renquan jigou zhuban de renquan zhishi peixun zao feifa chuanhuan huzhao, gang ao tongxingzheng, tongxun shebei bei kou], 8 June 15.
- ⁵³ Chinese Human Rights Defenders, "Individuals Detained in Mainland China for Supporting Hong Kong Pro-Democracy Protests," 9 July 15.
- ⁵⁴ Chinese Human Rights Defenders, "[CHRB] Torture & Ill-Treatment of Detainees & Political Charges Returning Under Xi (1/8–15/2015)," 15 January 15; Rights Defense Network, "'Subversion of State Power Case' of Zhejiang China Democracy Party Members Lu Gengsong, Chen Shuqing, Trial To Begin July 23, 2015" [Zhejiang minzhudang ren lu gengsong, chen shuqing "dianfu zhengquan an," jiang yu 2015 nian 7 yue 23 ri kaiting], 18 July 15. Authorities reportedly were to hold Chen's trial on July 23, 2015, though authorities sent the case to court in February. For more information on Chen Shuqing, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2006-00509.
- ⁵⁵ Rights Defense Network, "Zhao Haitong Sentenced to 14 Years for Inciting Subversion of State Power" [Zhao haitong bei yi shandong dianfu guojia zhengquan zui panxing shisi nian], 7 November 14; "Zhao Haitong Arrested for Inciting Subversion of State Power" [Zhao haitong she shandong dianfu guojia bei bu], Radio Free Asia, 4 November 13. For more information about Zhao's background and case, see "Activist Zhao Haitong" [Xingzhe zhao haitong], Boxun, 10 November 13; Rights Defense Network, "Xinjiang Democracy and Rights Activist Zhao Haitong Indicted on Suspicion of 'Inciting Subversion of State Power'" [Xinjiang minzhu weiquan renshi zhao haitong bei yi shexian "shandong dianfu guojia zhengquan zui" qisu], 22 June 14. For more information on Zhao Haitong, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00400.
- ⁵⁶ Edward Wong, "Prison Sentence for Maker of Documentary on Chinese Constitutional Rule," *New York Times*, Sinosphere (blog), 30 December 14. For more information on Shen Yongping, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00389.
- ⁵⁷ Rights Defense Network, "Hubei Election Expert Yao Lifa Returns Home After Being Taken Away and Detained for Over a Month" [Hubei xuanju zhuanjia yao lifa bei daizou kongzhi yi ge yu yue hou fanjia], 18 November 14. For more information on Yao Lifa, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2011-00532.
- ⁵⁸ "Chinese Police Jail Activists for 'Troublemaking' Over June 4 Anniversary," Radio Free Asia, 5 June 15; "China Holds Activist Who Posted Umbrella Selfie on Tiananmen Square on June 4," Radio Free Asia, 9 June 15; "More Than 10 Guangxi Human Rights Activists on a Hunger Strike in Remembrance of 'June 4,' Continue To Be Summoned" [Guangxi shi duo wei renquan huodong zhe jueshi jinian "liu si" bei chuanhuan xu], Boxun, 5 June 15; "Guo Chunping Sent Back for 'June 4' Post Online, Su Changlan Asked To Write 'Repentance Letter' in Prison" [Guo chunping yin fa "liu si" wang tie bei qianfan su changlan yu zhong bei yaoqiu xie "huiguo shu"], Radio Free Asia, 26 May 15; "China Detains Dissidents, Rights Activists Ahead of June 4 Anniversary," Radio Free Asia, 2 June 15; "During 26th Anniversary of June 4, Many Rights and Democracy Figures in Guizhou and Zhejiang in Soft Detention or Forced To Travel" [Liu si 26 zhounian qijian guizhou zhejiang duo ming renquan ji minzhu renshi zao ruanjin huo bei luyou], Radio Free Asia, 8 June 15.
- ⁵⁹ "China Formally Detains Sichuan Activist for 'Subversion' After Tiananmen Memorial Visit," Radio Free Asia, 7 April 15; Rights Defense Network, "Sichuan Rights Defender Pei Li (Cheng Wanyun or Cheng Aihua) Criminally Detained for Wearing Black To Commemorate June 4" [Sichuan renquan hanweizhe pei li (cheng wanyun huo cheng aihua) chuan hei yi jinian liu si zao xingju], 13 June 15.
- ⁶⁰ "China Detains Dissidents, Rights Activists Ahead of June 4 Anniversary," Radio Free Asia, 2 June 15; "During 26th Anniversary of June 4, Many Rights and Democracy Figures in Guizhou and Zhejiang in Soft Detention or Forced To Travel" [Liu si 26 zhounian qijian guizhou zhejiang duo ming renquan ji minzhu renshi zao ruanjin huo bei luyou], Radio Free Asia, 8 June 15.
- ⁶¹ Jack Chang and Isolda Morillo, "Secret Historians Preserve Past in China Amid State Amnesia," Associated Press, 11 March 15; "Several Autumn Rain Blessing Church Members Questioned on June 4, Wang Debang Harassed" [Qiu yu zhi fu jiaohui duo ren liu si bei chuanhuan wang debang zao saorao], Boxun, 5 June 15.
- ⁶² "Chinese Artist 'Warned Off' 1989 Tiananmen Activist Photo Project," Radio Free Asia, 6 May 15; Jack Chang and Isolda Morillo, "Secret Historians Preserve Past in China Amid State Amnesia," Associated Press, 11 March 15.
- ⁶³ Chinese Human Rights Defenders, "[CHRB] End Persecution of Participants in 1989 Pro-Democracy Movement for Their Ongoing Activism," 3 June 15.
- ⁶⁴ "Pu Zhiqiang Arrested on Suspicion of Picking Quarrels and Provoking Trouble, Illegally Obtaining Citizen Information" [Pu zhiqiang shexian xunxin zishi, feifa huoqu gongmin xinxi zui bei daibu], China News Service, 13 June 14; "Families 'Shocked' Over Subversion Charge for Chinese Rights Lawyers," Radio Free Asia, 23 June 14. For more information on Pu Zhiqiang, see the Commission's Political Prisoner Database record 2014-00174.
- ⁶⁵ "Pu's Video Workshop Exposed Party Abuses," Pu Zhiqiang, *The Lawyer*, 22 August 14.
- ⁶⁶ Verna Yu, "Chinese Human Rights Lawyer Pu Zhiqiang Indicted for 'Inciting Ethnic Hatred,' Faces Up to 8 Years' Jail," *South China Morning Post*, 15 May 15; Chris Buckley, "Chinese Rights Lawyer Detained in 2014 Will Stand Trial," *New York Times*, 15 May 15; Rights Defense Network, "Pu Zhiqiang Indictment" [Pu zhiqiang qisushu], 20 May 15.

⁶⁷In Tang Jingling Case, Second Instance Supplemental Investigation Situation Unclear, Lawyer for Guo Feixiong Plans To Sue Tianhe Court” [Tang jingling an erci tui zhen qingkuang bu minglang, guo feixiong lushi ni konggao tianhe fayuan], Radio Free Asia, 17 March 15; “Subversion, Public Order Cases of Tiananmen Anniversary Activists Move Closer to Trial,” Radio Free Asia, 23 April 15. For more information on Tang Jingling, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2011-00255.

⁶⁸Didi Tang, “Trial of Chinese Activists Halted After They Dismiss Lawyers,” Associated Press, reprinted in Washington Post, 19 June 15.

⁶⁹“Prominent 1989ers Voice Support for Yu Shiwen, Detained for Commemorating the Tiananmen Movement,” China Change, 12 January 15. For more information, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database records 2014-00192 on Yu Shiwen and 2014-00191 on Chen Wei.

⁷⁰Rights Defense Network, “Zhengzhou’s Yu Shiwen ‘Picking Quarrels and Provoking Trouble’ Case Has Been Transferred to the Court for a Month, Judge Has Not Given the Lawyers Any Documents” [Zhengzhou yu shiwen “xunxin zishi” an yisong fayuan yi ge yue, faguan hai bu gei lushi yuejuan], 19 March 15; Rights Defense Network, “Zhengzhou Case News Flash: This Morning Chen Wei, Ji Laisong, and Fang Yan Were Released!” [Zhengzhou an kuaixun: jinzhao chen wei, ji laisong, fang yan huoshi!], 2 September 14. For more information on Yu Shiwen and Chen Wei, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database records 2014-00192 and 2014-00191, respectively.

⁷¹Chinese Human Rights Defenders, “[CHRB] ‘Inciting Subversion’ Cases Move Forward; Pu Zhiqiang Still in Legal Limbo (4/23–5/7/15),” 7 May 15; “China Formally Detains Sichuan Activist for ‘Subversion’ After Tiananmen Memorial Visit,” Radio Free Asia, 7 April 15; Rights Defense Network, “News Flash: Authorities Implement Arrest of Mr. Chen Yunfei on Two Crimes of ‘Inciting Subversion’ and ‘Picking Quarrels and Provoking Trouble’” [Kuaixun: chen yunfei xiansheng bei yi dangju yi “shandong dianfu zui”, “xunxin zishi zui” liang zui ming zhixing daibu], 3 May 15. For more information on Chen Yunfei, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2010-00014.

⁷²Qian Gang, “Reading Chinese Politics in 2014,” China Media Project, 30 December 14.

⁷³Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, item 2(4). See also Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, “CCP Central Committee Decision Concerning Some Major Questions in Comprehensively Moving Governing the Country According to the Law Forward,” translated in China Copyright and Media (blog), 28 October 14, item 2(4).

⁷⁴State Council Information Office, “White Paper on China’s Political Party System” [Zhongguo de zhengdang zhidu baipishu], China Internet Information Center, 15 November 07, preface.

⁷⁵David Shambaugh, “Let a Thousand Democracies Bloom,” International Herald Tribune, reprinted in Brookings Institution, 6 July 07.

⁷⁶Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Opinion on Strengthening Construction of Socialist Consultative Democracy [Guanyu jiaqiang shehui zhuyi xieshang minzhu jianshe de yijian], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 9 February 15, para. 4.

⁷⁷Ibid., para. 24.

⁷⁸Embassy of the People’s Republic of China in the Federal Democratic Republic of Nepal, “Major Mass Organizations,” 27 October 04. Mass organizations are described by the Chinese government as “a bridge linking the CPC [Communist Party of China] and government with the people. They are [an] important social support for State power, playing a vital role in socialist democratic life.” Anthony J. Spires, “Contingent Symbiosis and Civil Society in an Authoritarian State: Understanding the Survival of China’s Grassroots NGOs,” American Journal of Sociology, Vol. 117, No. 1 (July 2011), 9.

⁷⁹Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Opinion on Strengthening Construction of Socialist Consultative Democracy [Guanyu jiaqiang shehui zhuyi xieshang minzhu jianshe de yijian], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 9 February 15, paras. 19–20.

⁸⁰Ibid., paras. 9, 13.

⁸¹For more information on regulation of China’s “social organizations,” see State Council, Regulations on the Registration and Management of Social Organizations [Shehui tuanti dengji guanli tiaoli], issued and effective 25 October 98, arts. 2–3, 6, 9. China’s “social organizations” (*shehui tuanti*) are the type of organization that most closely correspond to the Western concept of a non-governmental organization. “Social organizations” are voluntary organizations. They include academic, professional, or trade organizations, as well as voluntary associations of individuals with a common interest.

⁸²Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Opinion on Strengthening Construction of Socialist Consultative Democracy [Guanyu jiaqiang shehui zhuyi xieshang minzhu jianshe de yijian], reprinted in Xinhua, issued 9 February 15, para. 23.

⁸³Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, item 3. For a discussion of the difference between “rule of law” and “rule by law,” see Josh Chin, “‘Rule of Law’ or ‘Rule by Law’? In China, a Proposition Makes All the Difference,” Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 14 October 14.

⁸⁴Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, item 1(1); Qian Gang, “Reading Chinese Politics in 2014,” China Media Project, 30 December 14.

⁸⁵Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyanguanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14.

⁸⁶Ibid., item 3(3, 4). See also Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, “CCP Central Committee Decision Concerning Some Major Questions in Comprehensively Moving Governing the Country According to the Law Forward,” translated in China Copyright and Media (blog), 28 October 14, item 3(3, 4).

⁸⁷Ibid., item 3(1); Ibid., item 3(1).

⁸⁸Ibid., item 3(2); Ibid., item 3(2).

⁸⁹Ibid., items 3(2), 3(5), 3(6); Ibid., items 3(2), 3(5), 3(6).

⁹⁰Ibid., item 3(2); Ibid., item 3(2).

⁹¹PRC Organic Law of Village Committees [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo cunmin weiyuanhui zuzhi fa], passed 4 November 98, amended 28 October 10, 2; Cheng Li, “China’s Village Elections and Political Climate in 2010,” in Final Report of the Carter Center Limited Assessment Mission to the March 2010 Village Committee Elections in Yunnan Province, China, Carter Center, May 2010, 15; Village Elections in China, Staff Roundtable of the Congressional-Executive Commission on China, 8 July 02, Testimony of Elizabeth Dugan, Director, Asia Division, International Republican Institute; Kevin J. O’Brien and Lianjiang Li, “Accommodating ‘Democracy’ in a One-Party State: Introducing Village Elections in China,” China Quarterly, No. 162 (June 2000), 465–89.

⁹²PRC Election Law of the National People’s Congress and the Various Levels of Local People’s Congresses [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo quanguo renmin daibiao dahui he difang geji renmin daibiao dahui xuanju fa], passed 1 July 79, amended 10 December 82, 2 December 86, 28 February 95, 27 October 04, 14 March 10, art. 2; Liu Yawei, Carter Center, “China’s Township People’s Congress Elections: An Introduction,” last visited 19 June 15.

⁹³Cheng Li, “From Selection to Election? Experiments in the Recruitment of Chinese Political Elites,” China Leadership Monitor, Hoover Institution, Stanford University, No. 26 (Fall 2008), 2 September 08, 1; Cheng Li, “Intra-Party Democracy in China: Should We Take It Seriously?” China Leadership Monitor, Hoover Institution Stanford University, No. 30 (Fall 2009), 19 November 09, 7–9.

⁹⁴Qian Gang, “Reading Chinese Politics in 2014,” China Media Project, 30 December 14.

⁹⁵PRC Organic Law of Village Committees [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo cunmin weiyuanhui zuzhi fa], passed 4 November 98, amended 28 October 10, 2; Village Elections in China, Staff Roundtable of the Congressional-Executive Commission on China, 8 July 02, Testimony of Elizabeth Dugan, Director, Asia Division, International Republican Institute; Kevin J. O’Brien and Lianjiang Li, “Accommodating ‘Democracy’ in a One-Party State: Introducing Village Elections in China,” China Quarterly, No. 162 (June 2000), 465–489; Cheng Li, “China’s Village Elections and Political Climate in 2010,” in Final Report of the Carter Center Limited Assessment Mission to the March 2010 Village Committee Elections in Yunnan Province, China, Carter Center, May 2010, 15.

⁹⁶International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 25; UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, General Comment No. 25: The Right To Participate in Public Affairs, Voting Rights and the Right of Equal Access to Public Service, CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.7, 12 July 96. Article 25 of the ICCPR stipulates that citizens be permitted to “take part in the conduct of political affairs” and “to vote and to be elected at genuine periodic elections” (para. 1). The language requires that: “where citizens participate in the conduct of public affairs through freely chosen representatives, it is implicit in article 25 that those representatives do in fact exercise governmental power and that they are accountable through the electoral process for their exercise of that power” (para. 7). The language also requires that “the right to vote at elections and referenda must be established by law and may be subject only to reasonable restrictions . . . [p]arty membership should not be a condition of eligibility to vote, nor a ground of disqualification” (para. 10). In addition, Article 25 stipulates that “freedom of expression, assembly and association are essential conditions for the effective exercise of the right to vote and must be fully protected . . .” (para. 12); and an “independent electoral authority should be established to supervise the electoral process and to ensure that it is conducted fairly, impartially and in accordance with established laws which are compatible with the Covenant . . .” (para. 20).

⁹⁷International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 66, entry into force 23 March 76, art. 25. China has signed, but has not yet ratified, the ICCPR. In the 2009–2010 National Human Rights Action Plan issued by the Chinese government in April 2009, officials stated that the “essentials” of the ICCPR were some of the “fundamental principles” on which the plan was framed, and that the government “will continue legislative, judicial and administrative reforms to make domestic laws better linked with this Covenant, and prepare the ground for approval of the ICCPR.” State Council Information Office, “National Human Rights Action Plan of China (2009–2010),” reprinted in Xinhua, 13 April 09, Introduction, sec. V(1).

⁹⁸Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A (III) of 10 December 48, art. 21. “Everyone has the right to take part in the government of his country, directly or through freely chosen representatives . . . The will of the people shall be the basis of the authority of government, this will shall be expressed in periodic and genuine elections which shall be by universal and equal suffrage and shall be held by secret vote or by equivalent free voting procedures.”

⁹⁹Guo Likun and Tian Ying, “China on Track To Meet Human Rights Plan Goals,” Xinhua, 23 December 14.

¹⁰⁰International Campaign for Tibet, “New Conditions for Village Committees Candidates Exclude Tibetans Who ‘Secretly’ Hold Sympathy for the ‘Dalai Clique,’” 25 September 14.

¹⁰¹Ibid.

¹⁰²Tibetan Youth Is Killed by Police During Election Clash in Golog,” Radio Free Asia, 19 December 14; “Nearly 70 Tibetans Detained Following Clash Over Forced Vote,” Radio Free Asia, 7 January 15.

¹⁰³Rights Defense Network, “China Election Monitor (2015) No. 4—Hebei Baoding Anxin County Government-Led Village Election, Discriminates Against Women (Picture) (No. 2)” [Zhongguo xuanju guan cha (2015) zhi si—hebei baoding anxin xian zhengfu zhidao de cungan xuanju qishi funu (tu) (zhi er)], 6 April 15; Rights Defense Network, “China Election Monitor (2014) No. 63—Guangxi Guilin Quanzhou County Government-Led Village Official Election Discriminated Against Women” [Zhongguo xuanju guan cha (2014) zhi liushi san—guangxi guilin quanzhou xian zhengfu zhidao de cungan xuanju qishi funu], 15 February 15; Rights Defense Network, “China Election Monitor (2014) No. 60—Henan Ye County Government-Led Village Election Discriminated Against Women” [Zhongguo xuanju guan cha (2014), zhi liu shi—henan sheng ye xian zhengfu zhidao de cungan xuanju qishi funu], 25 January 15.

¹⁰⁴Rights Defense Network, “China Election Monitor (2015) No. 8—Hunan Hengyang County Villagers Again Collectively Petition Against Illegal Election” [Zhongguo xuanju guan cha (2015) zhi ba—hunan hengyang xian nongmin zai ci jiti shangfang konggao feifa xuanju], 22 April 15.

¹⁰⁵Rights Defense Network, “China Election Monitor, No. 28—Shandong Province, Liaocheng City, Shen County, Xuzhuang Town: Ignores Election Results, Violate Election Laws, Trample Voters Rights” [Xuanju guan cha jianbao zhi ershi ba—shandong sheng liaocheng shi shen xian xuzhuang zhen: wushi xuanju jieguo, weifan xuanju falu jianta xuanmin quanli], 16 April 15.

¹⁰⁶“China Jails Two Former Wukan Village Protest Leaders for ‘Graft,’” Radio Free Asia, 10 October 14; Echo Hui, “Wukan Protest Leader Yang Semaio Arrested, Accused of Taking Bribes,” South China Morning Post, 14 March 14; “Second Wukan Leader Held Ahead of Closed-Door Elections,” Radio Free Asia, 20 March 14.

¹⁰⁷“Tibetan Youth Is Killed by Police During Election Clash in Golog,” Radio Free Asia, 19 December 14; “Nearly 70 Tibetans Detained Following Clash Over Forced Vote,” Radio Free Asia, 7 January 15.

¹⁰⁸Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, 3(6.1); Jamie P. Horsley, “China’s Leaders Endorse Disclosure as the ‘Norm,’” *Freedomainfo.org*, 4 November 14.

¹⁰⁹Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, item 3(6.1). See also Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, “CCP Central Committee Decision Concerning Some Major Questions in Comprehensively Moving Governing the Country According to the Law Forward,” translated in *China Copyright and Media*, 28 October 14, item 3(6.1).

¹¹⁰State Council General Office, Opinion Regarding Strengthening Information Content on Government Websites [Guanyu jiaqiang zhengfu wangzhan xinxi neirong jianshe de yijian], 1 December 14, sec. 1(2.2).

¹¹¹Chinese Communist Party Central Committee General Office and State Council General Office, Guiding Opinion on Carrying Out the System of Itemizing the Powers of Local Government Working Departments at All Levels [Guanyu tuixing difang geji zhengfu gongzuo bumen quanli qingdan zhidu de zhidao yijian], *Xinhua*, 24 March 15, preface and arts. 1, 3, 4, 7; “Use ‘System Rationale’ To Restrain ‘Capricious Authority’—Three Questions About the System of Itemizing Local Powers” [Yong “zhidu lixing” ezhi “quanli renxing”—san wen defang quanli qingdan zhidu], *Xinhua*, 24 March 15.

¹¹²State Council, PRC Regulations on Open Government Information [Zhonghua renmin gongheguo zhengfu xinxi gongkai tiaoli], issued 5 April 07, effective 1 May 08. See also “China Commits to ‘Open Government Information’ Effective May 1, 2008,” *CECC China Human Rights and Rule of Law Update*, May 2008, 2.

¹¹³Zheng Wan, “China’s Scientific Progress Hinges on Access to Data,” *Nature*, 28 April 15.

¹¹⁴American Chamber of Commerce in Shanghai, “The American Chamber of Commerce in Shanghai 2015 China Business Report,” 4 March 15, 9.

¹¹⁵See, e.g., “Minitrue: Media Directives on Tianjin Port Explosions,” *China Digital Times*, 13 August 15; Gabriel Dominguez, “China’s Official Response to Emergencies Is ‘Censorship,’” *Deutsche Welle*, 18 August 15; United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, “China: UN Human Rights Expert Calls for Greater Transparency in the Wake of Tragic Tianjin Explosion,” 19 August 15; Liu Lin, “Number of Tianjin Port Explosion Accident Victims Rises to At Least 129” [Tianjin gang baozha shigu yunan renshu shangsheng zhi 129 ren], *Xinhua*, 24 August 15; Mark Hanrahan, “Tianjin Blasts: Chinese Authorities Call Off Search for Missing, Put Final Death Toll at 173,” *International Business Times*, 12 September 15; Tianjin Explosion: China Sets Final Death Toll at 173, Ending Search for Survivors,” *Associated Press*, reprinted in *Guardian*, 12 September 15.

¹¹⁶Han Xiao, “Chinese Media and the Tianjin Disaster,” *China Media Project*, 20 August 15.

¹¹⁷“People’s Daily Commentator: What Is Done Cannot Be Undone” [Renmin ribao pinglun yuan: kai gong meiyu huitou jian], *People’s Daily*, 16 January 15; Daniel A. Bell, “Why China’s Leaders See Corruption as a Mortal Threat,” *Huffington Post*, 17 February 15.

¹¹⁸Susan Finder, “Ruling the PLA According to the Law,” *The Diplomat*, 4 February 15; Wang Kun and Pan Ye, “Government Procurement of Services May Become Corruption’s New Disaster Area Some Projects’ Kickbacks Exceed 40 Percent” [Zhengfu goumai fuwu kong cheng fubai xin zaiqu yixie xiangmu huikou gaoda 40%], *Economic Observer Daily*, reprinted in *Xinhua*, 3 July 14.

¹¹⁹David Bandurski, “China Leads the World in Media Corruption, Says Expert,” *China Media Project*, 23 January 15.

- ¹²⁰“Chinese Sports Authorities Map Out Measures in Fight Against Corruption and Match-Fixing,” Xinhua, 26 January 15.
- ¹²¹“Central Discipline Inspection Commission Fifth Plenary Session Closes: Literature and Art Circles Lined Up To Be Target of Investigation” [Zhonggong jiwei wu zhong quanwei bimou: wenyi quan jiang lie diaocha duixiang], Radio Free Asia, 15 January 15.
- ¹²²Chun Han Wong, “China Antigraft Agency Investigates Intelligence Official,” Wall Street Journal, 16 January 15.
- ¹²³Matt Sheehan, “How To Bribe Your Way Into the Chinese Government,” Huffington Post, 1 December 14; Mark O’Neill, “Chinese Officials Sell Govt Posts for Millions,” EJ Insight, 24 November 14.
- ¹²⁴Mark O’Neill, “Chinese Officials Sell Govt Posts for Millions,” EJ Insight, 24 November 14; “People’s Daily Commentator: What is Done Cannot Be Undone” [Renmin ribao pinglun yuan: kai gong meiyou huitou jian], People’s Daily, 16 January 15.
- ¹²⁵Yuwen Wu, “Cracking China’s Corruption: Huge Hauls and Long Falls, BBC, 18 January 15. For more information on specific cases of corruption and the timeline of investigations, see “Tigers and Flies,” South China Morning Post, 6 November 14.
- ¹²⁶See, e.g., “China Jails Ex-Vice Governor 17 Years on Graft Charges,” Associated Press, reprinted in New York Times, 27 February 15; Yuwen Wu, “Cracking China’s Corruption: Huge Hauls and Long Falls, BBC, 18 January 15.
- ¹²⁷See, e.g., “More Than 30 Allegedly Corrupt Representatives and Members Will Miss the Two Sessions” [30 duo shexian tanfu de daibiao, weiyuan jiang quexi lianghui], Voice of America, 1 March 15; “CPC Expels Three Officials,” Xinhua, 13 February 15.
- ¹²⁸See, e.g., Su Rong, “China Takes Down Senior Leader Amid Anti-Corruption Campaign,” Associated Press, reprinted in ABC News, 16 February 15; “More Than 30 Allegedly Corrupt Representatives and Members Will Miss the Two Sessions” [30 duo shexian tanfu de daibiao, weiyuan jiang quexi lianghui], Voice of America, 1 March 15.
- ¹²⁹See, e.g., Susan Finder, “Shoring Up the ‘Rule of Law’ in China’s Military,” The Diplomat, 4 February 15. For information on specific cases, see Ben Blanchard and Benjamin Kang Lim, “Exclusive: China Investigates Second Top Officer for Graft—Sources,” Reuters, 3 March 15.
- ¹³⁰See, e.g., Joanne Chiu, “More China Southern Executives Removed in Graft Probe,” Wall Street Journal, 16 January 15; “Xinhua Commentary: Don’t Let ‘State-Owned Enterprise Worms’ Gnaw Away at State-Owned Assets” [Xinhua shiping: buneng ren you “guoqi zhuchong” zhu kong guoyou zichan], Xinhua, 7 February 15; Guo Yongfang, “70 Listed Companies Caught Up in Anti-Corruption Storms—Natural Resources Companies Accounted for About One in Four” [70 jia shangshi gongsi juanru fanfu fengbao ziyuan lei zhan si fen zhi yi zuoyou], Beijing News, reprinted in Caijing, 9 February 15; James T. Areddy, “China Graft Buster Wants Targets To Fear ‘Sword of Damocles,’” Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 12 February 15.
- ¹³¹See, e.g., Edward Wong, “CCTV, China’s Propaganda Tool, Finds Itself at Center of Antigraft Drive,” New York Times, 13 February 15; Alice Yan, “China To Step Up Anti-Graft Drive in Media and Broadcasting Sector,” South China Morning Post, 30 January 15.
- ¹³²Ye Jingsi, “China Anticorruption: Last Year Discipline Inspection System Investigated Nearly 1,600 People Internally” [Zhongguo fan fubai: qu nian jijian xitong neibu chachu jin 1600 ren], BBC, 7 January 15.
- ¹³³Sui-Lee Wee, “China Ejects Spy Chief From Group of Advisers: Xinhua,” Reuters, 25 February 15; Chun Han Wang, “China Antigraft Agency Investigates Intelligence Official,” Wall Street Journal, 16 January 15.
- ¹³⁴“China Enhances Crackdown on Corruption: Reports,” Xinhua, 12 March 15.
- ¹³⁵“Tianjin Procuratorate Files Charges Against Zhou Yongkang” [Tianjin jiancha jiguan gongsu zhou yongkang], Beijing Times, 4 April 15.
- ¹³⁶“Zhou Yongkang Sentenced to Life Imprisonment in First Instance Trial” [Zhou yongkang yishen bei panchu wuqi tuxing], Xinhua, 11 June 15.
- ¹³⁷Teddy Ng, “Former Top General Xu Caihou To Be Charged With Bribery Offenses,” South China Morning Post, 29 October 14.
- ¹³⁸Ma Xueling, “Eight High Ranking Officials Seized in the Past 37 Days, China Sweeps Up Another Wave of ‘Tigers’” [37 tian qin xia 8 ming gaoguan zhongguo zai xian yi bo “da hu” gaochaol], Xinhua, 1 August 15.
- ¹³⁹Brian Spegele, “China’s Investigation of Ex-President’s Aide Marks New Phase in War on Corruption,” Wall Street Journal, 23 December 14.
- ¹⁴⁰Chinese Communist Party Central Committee, Decision on Several Major Issues in Comprehensively Advancing Governance of the Country According to Law [Zhonggong zhongyang guanyu quanmian tuijin yifa zhiguo ruogan zhongda wenti de jue ding], issued 23 October 14, item 2(4.3).
- ¹⁴¹Andrea Chen and Mimi Lau, “Chinese Graft Busters Launch ‘Targeted’ Inspections of Government and State Firms,” Wall Street Journal, 18 November 14.
- ¹⁴²Cary Huang and Laura Zhou, “China’s Anti-Graft Agency To Focus on Political Factions and Organized Corruption,” South China Morning Post, 13 January 15; Jeremy Page, “China Anticorruption Campaign Targets Party ‘Cliques,’” South China Morning Post, 2 March 15.
- ¹⁴³“Corruption Fight Needs Public Support: CCDI,” Xinhua, reprinted in China Daily, 14 January 15.
- ¹⁴⁴Jonathan Kaiman, “China Jails Four More New Citizens’ Movement Activists,” Guardian, 18 April 14, reprinted in Chinese Human Rights Defenders, 12 May 14. Authorities sentenced Ding Jiayi on the charge of “gathering a crowd to disrupt order in a public place.” For additional information on Ding’s case, see Beijing Municipal Haidian District People’s Procuratorate, “Indictment of Ding Jiayi and Li Wei by Beijing Municipal Haidian District People’s Procuratorate,” translation posted on China Change, 21 December 13. See also the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2013-00307 on Ding Jiayi.

¹⁴⁵Josh Chin, “China Hands Out Harsh Sentences to Anticorruption Activists,” Wall Street Journal, 19 June 14. Authorities sentenced Liu, Wei, and Li for “picking quarrels and provoking trouble” and in addition sentenced Liu and Wei on the additional charges of “gathering a crowd to disrupt order in a public place” and “organizing and using a cult to undermine implementation of the law.” Rights Defense Network, “Rights Defense Network Statement: Strongly Protests Jiangxi, Xinyu Authorities’ Heavy Sentences for Liu Ping, Wei Zhongping, and Li Sihua” [Weiquanwang shengming: qianglie kangyi jiangxi xinyu dangju zhong pan liu ping, wei zhongping, li sihua], 19 June 14. According to Rights Defense Network, officials originally arrested Liu for “inciting subversion of state power.” Rights Defense Network, “Liu Ping, Wei Zhongping, Li Sihua Court of Second Instance Refuses To Hold Court Hearing and Upholds Original Verdict, Liu Ping Sent to a Women’s Prison in Jiangxi Province” [Liu ping, wei zhongping, li sihua jin er shen ju bu kaiting weichi yuanpan liu ping ru jiangxi sheng nujian], 11 August 14.

¹⁴⁶Chinese Human Rights Defenders, “[CHRB] Activist Said To Be Secretly Sentenced to 4 Years, Enforced Disappearance of Tibetan Monk (7/10–17/2014),” 17 July 14. According to the CHR article, authorities may have secretly sentenced Huang Wenxun to four years’ imprisonment for “inciting subversion of state power” but his sentence has not been confirmed by authorities. Chinese Human Rights Defenders, “Five Gentlemen From Chibi on Illuminating China Travels’ Chen Jianxiong and Li Yinli Released” [“Guangming zhongguoxing chibi wu junzi” chen jianxiong, li yinli huoshi], 13 July 13; China Human Rights Defenders, “[CHRB] Police Seize Lawyer After Blocking Visit to Detained Activist Xu Zhiyong (7/12–18, 2013),” 19 July 13. For more information on Huang Wenxun, see China Political Prisoner of Concern, “Huang Wenxun (CPPC #00069)” 10 March 14. See also the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2013-00231.

¹⁴⁷“Discipline Inspectors Set Up Offices in More Top Organs,” Xinhua, 31 March 15.

¹⁴⁸Li Jing, “China To Reform Anti-Corruption Bureau To Help in the Fight Against Graft,” South China Morning Post, 3 November 14.

¹⁴⁹Michael Cole, “China Property Registration To Begin in March in Corruption Crackdown,” Mingtiandi, 3 December 14.

¹⁵⁰Keira Lu Huang, “More Than 100 Corruption Suspects Seized Abroad in China’s ‘Fox Hunt’ Campaign,” South China Morning Post, 30 October 14.

¹⁵¹Supreme People’s Procuratorate, People’s Procuratorate Informant Tip Work Provisions [Renmin jianchayuan jubao gongzuo guiding], issued 18 July 96, amended 8 April 09, 21 July 14, effective 30 September 14, arts. 1, 8, reprinted in Procuratorial Daily; “Closely Rely on the Masses To Construct a ‘Four-Pronged Integrated’ System of Informant Reports” [Jinmi yikao renmin qunzhong goujian “siwei yiti” jubao tixi], Procuratorial Daily, 28 October 14.

¹⁵²Ibid., art. 8; Ibid.

¹⁵³Ibid., arts. 66–70; Ibid.

¹⁵⁴Ibid., arts. 58–65, 76–77; Ibid.

¹⁵⁵Russell Leigh Moses, “After the ‘Shock and Awe’: China’s Anti-Corruption Quagmire,” Wall Street Journal, China Real Time Report (blog), 18 December 14.

¹⁵⁶Elizabeth C. Economy, “Time for Xi To Reform His Reforms,” Council on Foreign Relations, Asia Unbound (blog), 6 February 15.

¹⁵⁷Andrew Jacobs and Chris Buckley, “Presumed Guilty in China’s War on Corruption, Targets Suffer Abuses,” New York Times, 19 October 14.

¹⁵⁸Wang Linuo, “Media: An Official Stripped Naked Put in Ice Bucket Smothers to Death” [Meiti: you guanyuan bei tuoguang fang bingtong men si], Caijing, reprinted in Phoenix Net, 1 March 15.

¹⁵⁹Xie Yanzong, “Discipline Inspection Official From Bengbu, Anhui Died During Interrogation, Family Says the Deceased Had Four Fractured Ribs” [Anhui bengbu jijian ganbu tanhua qijian siwang, jiashu cheng sizhe si gen leigu duanlie], The Paper, 16 January 15; Tom Phillips, “Communist Party Official ‘Attempts To Throw Himself to Death To Avoid Downfall,’” Telegraph, 26 January 15; “Zisha Shouyi: Suicide Benefits,” China Daily, 26 January 15.

¹⁶⁰Guo Qingyuan, “Amid Graft Fight, Communist Party Wants Count of ‘Unnatural Deaths,’” Caixin, 29 January 15.

¹⁶¹“Zisha Shouyi: Suicide Benefits,” China Daily, 26 January 15; Tom Phillips, “Communist Party Official ‘Attempts To Throw Himself to Death To Avoid Downfall,’” Telegraph, 26 January 15.